



September 14, 2001

Ms. Janice Mullenix
Associate General Counsel
Texas Department of Transportation
125 East 11th Street
Austin, Texas 78701-2483

OR2001-4115

Dear Ms. Mullenix:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 151964.

The Department of Transportation (the "department") received a request for the personnel files of two named individuals. You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.103, 552.117, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.¹

We first note that the submitted materials include information made public by section 552.022 of the Government Code. This section provides several categories of information that are not excepted from required disclosure unless they "are expressly confidential under other law." In pertinent part this section reads

- (a) Without limiting the amount or kind of information that is public information under this chapter, the following categories of information are

¹We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

public information and not excepted from required disclosure under this chapter unless they are expressly confidential under other law:

(1) a completed report, audit, evaluation, or investigation made of, for, or by a governmental body, except as provided by Section 552.108;

...

(7) a description of an agency's central and field organizations . . .
[and]

...

(15) information regarded as open to the public under an agency's policies[.]

The submitted materials include employee evaluations and information regarded as open to the public under an agency's policies, such as job descriptions and job vacancy notices. All of the records relating to employee evaluations, including those you have marked as Tab 4, are subject to required release under section 552.022(a)(1), while job descriptions and job vacancy notices, including those you have marked as Tab 3, fall within the scope of subsection (15) of section 552.022(a). We have marked additional information which is public under section 552.022(a)(1). The organizational charts are subject to required release under section 552.022(a)(7), and we have marked them accordingly. The submitted information which is within the ambit of section 552.022 is therefore subject to required public disclosure, except to the extent that any of this information is expressly confidential under other law. Although you claim that section 552.103 of the Government Code applies to all of the submitted information, it is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects the governmental body's interests and may be waived. As such, this exception does not constitute other law that makes information expressly confidential for the purposes of section 552.022(a). *See Open Records Decision Nos. 542 at 4 (1990)* (statutory predecessor to section 552.103 does not implicate third-party rights and is waivable by governmental body).

However, sections 552.101, 552.117, and 552.130 may be applicable to some of the submitted information which is subject to release under section 552.022. Section 552.117 excepts from disclosure the home addresses and telephone numbers, social security numbers, and family member information of current or former officials or employees of a governmental body who request that this information be kept confidential under section 552.024. Whether a particular piece of information is protected by section 552.117 must be determined at the time the request for it is made. *See Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989)*. Therefore, the department may only withhold information under

section 552.117 on behalf of current or former officials or employees who made a request for confidentiality under section 552.024 prior to the date on which the request for this information was made. For those employees who timely elected to keep their personal information confidential, the department must withhold the employees' home addresses and telephone numbers, social security numbers, and any information that reveals whether these employees have family members. The department may not withhold this information under section 552.117 for those employees who did not make a timely election to keep the information confidential.

Social security numbers may also be withheld in some circumstances under section 552.101 of the Government Code. A social security number or "related record" may be excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 in conjunction with the 1990 amendments to the federal Social Security Act, 42 U.S.C. § 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I). *See Open Records Decision No. 622 (1994)*. These amendments make confidential social security numbers and related records that are obtained and maintained by a state agency or political subdivision of the state pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990. *See id.* We have no basis for concluding that any of the social security numbers in the file are confidential under section 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I), and therefore excepted from public disclosure under section 552.101 on the basis of that federal provision. We caution, however, that section 552.352 of the Public Information Act imposes criminal penalties for the release of confidential information. Prior to releasing any social security number information, the department should ensure that no such information was obtained or is maintained by the department pursuant to any provision of law, enacted on or after October 1, 1990.

Section 552.130 provides in relevant part:

(a) Information is excepted from the requirement of Section 552.021 if the information relates to:

- (1) a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state; [or]
- (2) a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state[.]

You must withhold Texas driver's license numbers under section 552.130 from the information to be released under section 552.022.

With regard to the remaining information, we address your section 552.103 arguments. Section 552.103(a), the "litigation exception," excepts from disclosure information relating to litigation to which the state or a political subdivision is or may be a party. The city has the burden of providing relevant facts and documents to show that the section 552.103(a) exception is applicable in a particular situation. The test for meeting this burden is a

showing that (1) litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated, and (2) the information at issue is related to that litigation. *University of Tex. Law Sch. v. Texas Legal Found.*, 958 S.W.2d 479, 481 (Tex. App.--Austin 1997, no pet.); *Heard v. Houston Post Co.*, 684 S.W.2d 210, 212 (Tex. App.--Houston [1st Dist.] 1984, writ ref'd n.r.e.); Open Records Decision No. 551 at 4 (1990). The city must meet both prongs of this test for information to be excepted under section 552.103(a).

The mere chance of litigation will not trigger section 552.103(a). Open Records Decision No. 452 at 4 (1986). To demonstrate that litigation is reasonably anticipated, the governmental body must furnish *concrete* evidence that litigation involving a specific matter is realistically contemplated and is more than mere conjecture. *Id.* Whether litigation is reasonably anticipated must be determined on a case-by-case basis. Open Records Decision No. 452 at 4 (1986).

You have submitted information to this office showing that the requestor has filed a complaint with the Equal Employment Opportunity Commission ("EEOC") and the Texas Commission on Human Rights (the "TCHR") alleging discrimination and retaliation. The TCHR operates as a federal deferral agency under section 706(c) of title VII, 42 U.S.C. § 2000e-5. The EEOC defers jurisdiction to the TCHR over complaints alleging employment discrimination. *Id.*

This office has stated that a pending EEOC complaint indicates litigation is reasonably anticipated. Open Records Decision Nos. 386 at 2 (1983), 336 at 1 (1982). By showing that the complaint filed with the TCHR is pending, you have shown that litigation is reasonably anticipated. Our review of the records at issue also shows that they are related to anticipated litigation for purposes of section 552.103(a). Thus, with the exception of the marked information which is expressly public under section 552.022, you may withhold the requested information pursuant to section 552.103(a).

We note that once the information has been obtained by all parties to the pending litigation, no section 552.103(a) interest exists with respect to that information. Open Records Decision No. 349 at 2 (1982). We also note that the applicability of section 552.103(a) ends when the litigation is concluded. Attorney General Opinion MW-575 (1982) at 2; Open Records Decision Nos. 350 at 3 (1982), 349 at 2 (1982).

In summary, for those employees who timely elected to keep their personal information confidential, the department must withhold under section 552.117 the employees' home addresses and telephone numbers, social security numbers, and any information that reveals whether these employees have family members from the information subject to release under section 552.022. Prior to releasing any social security number information, the department should ensure that no such information was obtained or is maintained by the department pursuant to any provision of law, enacted on or after October 1, 1990. Pursuant to section 552.130, Texas driver's license numbers must be withheld from the information

subject to release under section 552.022. The remaining information not subject to release under 552.022 may be withheld pursuant to section 552.103.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at 877/673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Department of Public Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.--Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the General Services Commission at 512/475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for

contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script, appearing to read "Cindy Nettles".

Cindy Nettles
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CN/seg

Ref.: ID# 151964

Enc.: Submitted documents

c: Mr. Clint Mighty
8200 Sunburg Lane #1014
Houston, Texas 77095
(w/o enclosures)