



October 29, 2001

Mr. Michael D. Chisum  
General Counsel  
Texas Department of Licensing And Regulation  
P.O. Box 12157  
Austin, Texas 78711

OR2001-4944

Dear Mr. Chisum:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 154064.

The Texas Department of Licensing And Regulation (the "department") received two requests for a copy of proposals submitted by bidders and the selection criteria used for determining the winning bid for four agency purchase requisitions. You claim that the requested information may be excepted from disclosure under section 552.110 of the Government Code. You have notified nine entities of the request for information pursuant to section 552.305 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305 (permitting interested third party to submit to attorney general reasons why requested information should not be released); Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (determining that statutory predecessor to Gov't Code § 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception in Open Records Act in certain circumstances). We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

An interested third party is allowed ten business days after the date of its receipt of the governmental body's notice under section 552.305(d) to submit its reasons, if any, as to why information relating to that party should be withheld from public disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d)(2)(B). As of the date of this letter, none of the third parties notified by the department has submitted to this office its reasons explaining why its information should not be released. Therefore, we will consider the argument made by the department.

You argue that public disclosure of the information at issue "may cause substantial competitive harm to the company from whom the information was obtained," and it therefore is excepted from disclosure under section 552.110 of the Government Code. The governmental body, or interested third party, raising the commercial or financial information prong of this exception must provide a specific factual or evidentiary showing, not conclusory or generalized allegations, that substantial competitive injury would likely result from disclosure. Gov't Code § 552.110(b); Open Records Decision No. 661. (1999); *see also National Parks & Conservation Ass'n v. Morton*, 498 F.2d 765 (D.C. cir. 1974). As there has been no such showing here, we conclude that the requested information may not be withheld under section 552.110.

We note that the submitted information also contains e-mail addresses obtained from the public. The Seventy-seventh Legislature recently added section 552.137 to chapter 552 of the Government Code. This new exception makes certain e-mail addresses confidential.<sup>1</sup> Senate Bill 694, as passed May 14, 2001, signed by the Governor May 26, 2001, and made effective immediately, provides in relevant part:

Sec. 552.137. CONFIDENTIALITY OF CERTAIN E-MAIL ADDRESSES.

- (a) An e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body is confidential and not subject to disclosure under this chapter.
- (b) Confidential information described by this section that relates to a member of the public may be disclosed if the member of the public affirmatively consents to its release.

Act of May 14, 2001, 77th Leg., R.S., S.B. 694, § 1 (to be codified at Gov't Code § 552.137). You do not inform us that a member of the public has affirmatively consented to the release of any e-mail address contained in the submitted materials. The department must, therefore, withhold the marked e-mail addresses under section 552.137.

In summary, e-mail addresses of members of the public must be withheld from disclosure under section 552.137. The remainder of the submitted information must be released to the requestor.

---

<sup>1</sup>House Bill 2589, which also makes certain e-mail addresses confidential, took effect on September 1, 2001. *See* Act of May 22, 2001, 77th Leg., R.S., H.B. 2589, § 5 (to be codified at Gov't Code § 552.136). The language of section 552.136, as added by House Bill 2589, is identical to that of section 552.137.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at 877/673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Department of Public Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.--Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the General Services Commission at 512/475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for

contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Cindy Nettles  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

CN/seg

Ref: ID# 154064

Enc: Submitted documents

c: Ms. Myneca Y. Ojo  
Program Director  
Texas Minority Business Opportunity Committee  
P.O. Box 6206  
Austin, Texas 78762  
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Wayland Whipple  
Spectrum Data, Inc.  
10537 Gulfdale Drive  
San Antonio, Texas 78711-2548  
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Shuba Mantri  
Alpha Sim Technology, Inc.  
5870 Highway 6 North, Suite 303  
Houston, Texas 77084  
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Spencer Johns  
CompuScan Office Solutions, Inc.  
12801 North Stemmons Freeway, Suite 903  
Dallas, Texas 75234  
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Rain K. Gilbert  
DM2000, Inc.  
1833 Hormel Drive  
San Antonio, Texas 78219  
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Trace Finley  
Image API  
1115 San Jacinto Boulevard, Suite 130  
Austin, Texas 78701  
(w/o enclosures)

Ms. Kacee Jackson  
Jackson Digital Document Imaging  
9421-A Burnet Road  
Austin, Texas 78758  
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Eric Kennedy  
Neubus, Inc.  
8310 North Capital of Texas Highway, Suite 288  
Austin, Texas 78731  
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Jay Boshart  
Raytheon  
EIS Service Center  
6201 Interstate 30  
Greenville, Texas 75402  
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Bo Bowman  
Spectrum Data, Inc.  
10537 Gulfdale Drive  
San Antonio, Texas 78216  
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. William F. Krautter  
Statistical Service Corporation of Austin  
8870 Business Park Drive  
Austin, Texas 78759  
(w/o enclosures)