



July 1, 2002

Mr. Scott Durfee
General Counsel
Office of the District Attorney
Harris County
1201 Franklin Street, Ste. 600
Houston, Texas 77002

OR2002-3561

Dear Mr. Durfee.:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 165084.

The Harris County District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney") received a request for the file on a named individual. The district attorney seeks to withhold certain documents under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Initially, we note that requestor has asked to view the entire file concerning a named individual, yet the district attorney only seeks to withhold "certain documents responsive to the request for information." Therefore, to the extent the requested file contains information other than the types submitted to this office for review, and the district attorney has not released this information, the district attorney must do so at this time. *See Gov't Code §§ 552.006, .301(a), .302.*

¹We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988).* This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

You claim that the information in Appendix B is excepted from disclosure by section 552.108. Section 552.108 provides in pertinent part:

(a) [i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted from the requirements of 552.021 if: . . .(4) it is information that: (A) is prepared by an attorney representing the state in anticipation of or in the course of preparing for criminal litigation; or (B) reflects the mental impressions or legal reasoning of an attorney representing the state.

(b) [a]n internal record or notation of a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that is maintained for internal use in matters relating to law enforcement or prosecution is excepted from the requirements of 552.021 if: . . .(3) the internal record or notation: (A) is prepared by an attorney representing the state in anticipation of or in the course of preparing for criminal litigation; or (B) reflects the mental impressions or legal reasoning of an attorney representing the state.

(c) This section does not except from the requirements of Section 552.021 information that is basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.

Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(4), (b)(3), (c). A governmental body that raises section 552.108 must reasonably explain, if the requested information does not supply the explanation on its face, how and why section 552.108 applies to that information. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977); Open Records Decision No. 434 at 2-3 (1986). You state that the information in Appendix B consists of various prosecutorial handwritten and typewritten notes, as well as screening sheets and intake materials utilized to file the charges, in the case of *State of Texas vs. Adriana A. Goldman*, Cause No. 816821, in the 232nd District Court, Harris County, Texas. Upon review of your representations and the information in Appendix B, we conclude that the information was either prepared by an attorney representing the state in anticipation of or in the course of preparing for criminal litigation or reflects the mental processes or legal reasoning of an attorney representing the state. Therefore, we conclude that the information in Appendix B may be withheld from disclosure under section 552.108(a)(4) and 552.108(b)(3).

You also claim that the information in Appendix C contains confidential criminal history information that is protected from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. Section 552.101 excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." This exception protects information that other statutes make confidential. Criminal history record information ("CHRI") obtained from the National Crime Information Center ("NCIC") or the Texas Crime Information

Center ("TCIC") is confidential under section 552.101 in conjunction with federal law and subchapter F of chapter 411 of the Government Code. Federal law governs the dissemination of CHRI obtained from the NCIC network. Federal regulations prohibit the release to the general public of CHRI that is maintained in state and local CHRI systems. *See* 28 C.F.R. § 20.21(c)(1) ("Use of criminal history record information disseminated to noncriminal justice agencies shall be limited to the purpose for which it was given.") and (c)(2) ("No agency or individual shall confirm the existence or nonexistence of criminal history record information to any person or agency that would not be eligible to receive the information itself."); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 565 at 10-12 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its own individual law with respect to CHRI that it generates. *See* ORD 565 at 10-12. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) of the Government Code authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *See* Gov't Code § 411.089(b). Any CHRI generated by the federal government or another state may be disclosed only in accordance with the federal regulations. Any CHRI obtained from the Texas Department of Public Safety (the "DPS") or another criminal justice agency must be withheld as provided by subchapter F of chapter 411 of the Government Code. The definition of CHRI does not encompass driving record information maintained by the DPS. *See* Gov't Code § 411.082(2)(B). Furthermore, where a governmental entity has compiled information that lists an individual as a criminal suspect, arrestee, or defendant, the compiled information takes on a character that implicates the individual's right to privacy in a manner that the same information in an uncompiled state does not. *See United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749 (1989).²

Thus, to the extent that the submitted documents in Appendix C contain any information that is confidential under the federal regulations or subchapter F of chapter 411 of the Government Code, or that is private under *Reporters Committee*, the district attorney must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by

²Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the common-law right of privacy. Information must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy when the information is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, such that its release would be highly objectionable to a person of ordinary sensibilities, and (2) of no legitimate public interest. *See Industrial Found. v. Texas Ind. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976), *cert. denied*, 430 U.S. 931 (1977).

filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at 877/673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Department of Public Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.--Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at 512/475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Michael A. Pearle
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

-

MAP/jh

Ref: ID# 165084

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Gabriel Yanez
Earth-Safe, Inc.
812 E. Gulf Boulevard, Unit 2
Indian Rcks Beach, Florida 33785
(w/o enclosures)