



OFFICE *of the* ATTORNEY GENERAL  
GREG ABBOTT

May 7, 2003

Ms. Tenley Aldredge  
Assistant County Attorney  
Travis County  
P.O. Box 1748  
Austin, Texas 78767

OR2003-3080

Dear Ms. Aldredge:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 180694.

The Travis County District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney") received a request for copies of "all documents and other tangible items" in the prosecution file of a named individual.<sup>1</sup> You indicate that you have released most of the responsive information to the requestor. However, you claim that some of the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Access to the Emergency Medical Services ("EMS") records is governed by the provisions of section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code. Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). Section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code, the Emergency Medical Services Act, provides:

- (a) A communication between certified emergency medical services personnel or a physician providing medical supervision and a patient that is made in the course of providing emergency medical services to the patient is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

---

<sup>1</sup> We note that this office has ruled that tangible physical items are not the type of information contemplated under the Public Information Act. *See, eg.* Open Records Decision No. 581 (1990).

(b) Records of the identity, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by emergency medical services personnel or by a physician providing medical supervision that are created by the emergency medical services personnel or physician or maintained by an emergency medical services provider are confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

....

(g) The privilege of confidentiality under this section does not extend to information regarding the presence, nature of injury or illness, age, sex, occupation, and city of residence of a patient who is receiving emergency medical services. . . .

Health & Safety Code § 773.091(a), (b), (g). The submitted documents include EMS records, and it does not appear that any of the exceptions to confidentiality set forth in section 773.092 of the Health and Safety Code apply. Accordingly, the district attorney must withhold the submitted EMS records in Group A, which we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code, except for information required to be released under section 773.091(g).

We note that you assert that the documents in Group A consist of medical records. We will address your argument with respect to the remaining documents in Group A. Access to medical records is governed by the Medical Practice Act (the "MPA"), chapter 159 of the Occupations Code. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides:

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

This office has concluded that the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records either created by a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982). The MPA requires that any subsequent release of medical records be consistent with the purposes for which a governmental body obtained the records. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). Medical records may be released only as provided under the MPA. Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). Upon review of the remaining documents in Group A, we conclude that they do not qualify as medical records for purposes of the MPA.

We next note that you claim that the juror information contained in Group B is confidential. Information collected about jurors in the jury selection process is governed by article 35.29 of the Code of Criminal Procedure, which provides:

Information collected by the court or by a prosecuting attorney during the jury selection process about a person who serves as a juror, *including the juror's home address, home telephone number, social security number, driver's license number, and other personal information*, is confidential and may not be disclosed by the court, the prosecuting attorney, the defense counsel, or any court personnel except on application by a party in the trial or on application by a bona fide member of the news media acting in such capacity to the court in which the person is serving or did serve as a juror. On a showing of good cause, the court shall permit disclosure of the information sought. [Emphasis added].

Article 35.29 makes confidential certain personal information pertaining to only those individuals who actually served on a jury in a criminal trial. In addition to the confidential information listed in article 35.29, "other personal information" that is confidential pursuant to article 35.29 includes the juror's present employer, business telephone number, and spouse's employer. Juror names, however, are not made confidential by article 35.29, and are not "other personal information" that is confidential pursuant to article 35.29. We have marked the information in Group B that the district attorney must withhold with regard to jurors who actually served on the jury.

Further, we note that the information in Group B contains e-mail addresses of members of the public. Section 552.137 of the Government Code requires the district attorney to withhold an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body, unless the member of the public has affirmatively consented to its release. You do not inform us that a member of the public has affirmatively consented to the release of any e-mail address contained in the submitted materials. The district attorney must, therefore, withhold e-mail addresses of members of the public under section 552.137. Thus, we have marked the e-mail addresses that must be withheld under section 552.137.

We note that you have marked information in Group C that you assert is confidential under section 552.130 of the Government Code. Section 552.130 provides in relevant part:

(a) Information is excepted from the requirement of Section 552.021 if the information relates to:

(1) a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state; [or]

(2) a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state[.]

You must withhold the Texas driver's license numbers, vehicle identification number, and license plate number that you have marked under section 552.130. We have marked additional information that must be withheld under section 552.130. We further note that you have marked a license plate number and a vehicle identification number to which the requestor has a right of access under section 552.023. Under section 552.023, a person or a person's authorized representative has a special right of access, beyond the right of the general public, to information held by a governmental body that relates to the person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests. Gov't Code § 552.023(a). This information, which we have marked, must be released to the requestor.

Included among the documents you seek to withhold is an accident report form that appears to have been completed pursuant to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. *See* Transp. Code § 550.064 (officer's accident report). Section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code states that except as provided by subsection (c), accident reports are privileged and confidential. Section 550.065(c)(4) provides for the release of accident reports to a person who provides two of the following three pieces of information: (1) date of the accident; (2) name of any person involved in the accident; and (3) specific location of the accident. Transp. Code § 550.065(c)(4). Under this provision, the Department of Public Safety or another governmental entity is required to release a copy of an accident report to a person who provides the agency with two or more pieces of information specified by the statute. *Id.* In the situation at hand, the requestor has not provided the district attorney with two of the three pieces of information for any accident report. Thus, you must withhold the accident report under section 550.065(b).

We note that we have marked personal financial information that is confidential under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. Common-law privacy protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. 540 S.W.2d at 683. This office has concluded that financial information concerning an individual is in some instances protected by a common law right to privacy. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 545 (1990), 523 (1989). A previous opinion of this office states that "all financial information relating to an individual . . . ordinarily satisfies the first requirement of common law privacy, in that it constitutes highly intimate or embarrassing facts about the individual, such that its public disclosure would be highly objectionable to a person of ordinary sensibilities." Open Records Decision No. 373 at 3 (1983). We have

marked the personal financial information in which there is no legitimate public interest. You must withhold the personal financial information that we have marked under section 552.101 and common-law privacy.

Finally, we note that the information in Group C contains a social security number. Section 552.101 excepts "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. A social security number or "related record" may be excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 in conjunction with the 1990 amendments to the federal Social Security Act, 42 U.S.C. § 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I). *See* Open Records Decision No. 622 (1994). These amendments make confidential social security numbers and related records that are obtained and maintained by a state agency or political subdivision of the state pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990. *See id.* We have no basis for concluding that the social security numbers in the submitted documents are confidential under section 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I), and therefore excepted from public disclosure under section 552.101 on the basis of that federal provision. We caution, however, that section 552.352 of the Public Information Act imposes criminal penalties for the release of confidential information. Prior to releasing any social security number, you should ensure that no such information was obtained or is maintained by the district attorney pursuant to any provision of law, enacted on or after October 1, 1990.

In summary, you must withhold the EMS records that we have marked in Group A under section 552.101 in conjunction with Health & Safety Code section 773.091. You must withhold the personal information we have marked in Group B to the extent it pertains to an individual who actually served on the jury under section 552.101 in conjunction with article 35.29 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. We have marked e-mail addresses in Group B that must be withheld under section 552.137. You must withhold most of the information you have marked in Group C, as well as information that we have marked under section 552.130. You must release the section 552.130 information that we have marked to which the requestor has a right of access under section 552.023. You must withhold the accident report we have marked under section 550.065 of the Transportation Code. We have marked personal financial information in Group C that must be withheld under section 552.101 and common-law privacy. The social security number in Group C may be confidential. You must release the remaining information to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full

benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Jennifer E. Berry  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

JEB/sdk

Ref: ID# 180694

Enc: Submitted documents

c: Mr. John Ragland  
Ragland Law Firm  
106 East Sixth Street, Suite 720  
Austin, Texas 78701  
(w/o enclosures)