



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

September 19, 2003

Ms. J. Middlebrooks
Assistant City Attorney
Criminal Law & Police Division
City of Dallas
1400 South Lamar Street #300A
Dallas, Texas 75215-1801

OR2003-6604

Dear Ms. Middlebrooks:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 187954.

The Dallas Police Department (the "Department") received a request for copies of specified incident and arrest reports pertaining to a named individual. You assert that portions of the requested information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We reviewed the representative sample of information you submitted and considered the exceptions you claim.¹

First, we address your arguments under section 552.101 of the Government Code. Section 552.101 excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." This exception encompasses the confidentiality provisions of other statutes. Federal law governs and restricts access to criminal history record information ("CHRI") obtained from the National Crime Information Center ("NCIC"). *See* 28 C.F.R. §§ 20.1 *et seq.*; Open Records Decision No. 565

¹ We assume the representative sample of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach and, therefore, does not authorize the withholding of any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

at 10-12 (1990). The relevant federal regulations permit each state to follow its own applicable law with respect to the CHRI that it generates. ORD 565 at 11-12. Sections 411.083 and 411.089 of the Government Code authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI from the Texas Crime Information Center ("TCIC"). However, CHRI obtained from the TCIC network may be released by a criminal justice agency only to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. Gov't Code § 411.089(b)(1). Thus, CHRI generated by the federal government or another state may be obtained only in accordance with the relevant federal regulations, and CHRI obtained from the Texas Department of Public Safety or another Texas criminal justice agency through the TCIC must be withheld in accordance with subchapter F of chapter 411 of the Government Code. Accordingly, we agree that, to the extent the Department maintains CHRI obtained from the NCIC or TCIC, it must withhold such information from the requestor under chapter 411 of the Government Code.

Next, as you note, the social security numbers contained in the information at issue may be confidential under federal law. A social security number may be withheld in some circumstances under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the 1990 amendments to the federal Social Security Act, 42 U.S.C. § 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I). *See* Open Records Decision No. 622 (1994). These amendments make confidential social security numbers and related records that are obtained and maintained by a state agency or political subdivision of the state pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990. *See id.* We have no basis for concluding that the social security number in the responsive records is confidential under section 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I), and therefore, excepted from public disclosure under section 552.101 and the referenced federal provision. However, we caution the Department that section 552.352 of the Act imposes criminal penalties for the release of confidential information. Prior to releasing any social security number, you should ensure that no such information was obtained or is maintained by the Department pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990.

Also, the submitted documents include fingerprint information that is subject to sections 559.001, 559.002, and 559.003 of the Government Code. These provisions provide the following:

Sec. 559.001. DEFINITIONS. In this chapter:

- (1) "Biometric identifier" means a retina or iris scan, fingerprint, voiceprint, or record of hand or face geometry.
- (2) "Governmental body" has the meaning assigned by Section 552.003 [of the Government Code], except that the term includes each entity within or created by the judicial branch of state government.

Sec. 559.002. DISCLOSURE OF BIOMETRIC IDENTIFIER. A governmental body that possesses a biometric identifier of an individual:

(1) may not sell, lease, or otherwise disclose the biometric identifier to another person unless:

(A) the individual consents to the disclosure;

(B) the disclosure is required or permitted by a federal statute or by a state statute other than Chapter 552 [of the Government Code]; or

(C) the disclosure is made by or to a law enforcement agency for a law enforcement purpose; and

(2) shall store, transmit, and protect from disclosure the biometric identifier using reasonable care and in a manner that is the same as or more protective than the manner in which the governmental body stores, transmits, and protects its other confidential information.

Sec. 559.003. APPLICATION OF CHAPTER 552. A biometric identifier in the possession of a governmental body is exempt from disclosure under Chapter 552.

Gov't Code §§ 559.001, .002, .003. We find no indications that any of the permitted disclosure provisions apply in this case. Therefore, the Department must withhold the thumb print in the submitted documents under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 559.003 of the Government Code.

Last, the submitted documents contain information subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code. This provision excepts from public disclosure information relating to a driver's license or a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Therefore, the Department must withhold the information pertaining to motor vehicle records, which you have redacted, under section 552.130 of the Government Code. We have marked additional information the Department must withhold under this provision.

In summary, the Department must withhold the following information under section 552.101 in conjunction with the stated doctrine or statute: 1) CHRI obtained from the TCIC or NCIC pursuant to chapter 411 of the Government Code, 2) if applicable, the social security number you have marked in accordance with the 1990 amendments to the federal Social Security Act, and 3) the thumb print, which you have marked, pursuant to section 559.003 of the Government Code. The Department must withhold the motor vehicle information you have

redacted and we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The Department must release the remainder of the submitted information to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this

ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Christen Sorrell".

Christen Sorrell
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CHS/seg

Ref: ID# 187954

Enc: Submitted documents

c: Ms. Katie Menzer
The Dallas Morning News
P.O. Box 655237
Dallas, Texas 75265
(w/o enclosures)