



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

November 4, 2003

Ms. Amy L. Sims
Assistant City Attorney
City of Lubbock
P.O. Box 2000
Lubbock, Texas 79457

OR2003-7925

Dear Ms. Sims:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 190507.

The City of Lubbock Police Department (the "department") received a request for a specific incident report. You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.103, 552.107, and 552.111 of the Government Code. We have reviewed the representative sample of information you submitted and considered the exceptions you claim.¹

Initially, we note that the submitted information constitutes a completed investigation made of, for, or by the department, which is specifically made public under section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a) provides in pertinent part as follows:

- (a) Without limiting the amount or kind of information that is public information under this chapter, the following categories of information are public information and not excepted from required disclosure under this chapter unless they are expressly confidential under other law:

¹ We assume the representative sample of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. See Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach and, therefore, does not authorize the withholding of any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

- (1) a completed report, audit, evaluation, or investigation made of, for, or by a governmental body, except as provided by Section 552.108.

Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(1). Because the submitted information is subject to section 552.022(a), the department must release it, unless the information is expressly confidential under other law or excepted under section 552.108 of the Government Code. You claim that the submitted information is excepted under sections 552.103, 552.107, and 552.111 of the Government Code. However, these sections are discretionary exceptions to disclosure that protects a governmental body's interests and may be waived; as such, it is not other law that makes information confidential for the purposes of section 552.022. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 663 (1999) (governmental body may waive section 552.103), 630 at 4 (1994) (governmental body may waive section 552.107(1)), 473 (1987) (governmental body may waive section 552.111); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally). Therefore, the department may not withhold the responsive information under sections 552.103, 552.107, and 552.111 of the Government Code.

However, the attorney-client privilege is also found in Rule 503 of the Texas Rules of Evidence. The Texas Supreme Court has held that "[t]he Texas Rules of Civil Procedure and Texas Rules of Evidence are 'other law' within the meaning of section 552.022." *In re City of Georgetown*, 53 S.W.3d 328 (Tex. 2001). Thus, we will determine whether this information is confidential under Rule 503 of the Texas Rules of Evidence. *See* Open Records Decision No. 677 (2002). In this case, you have not provided any arguments to show that the applicability of Rule 503 as required by section 552.301 of the Government Code. Therefore, you may not withhold the information under Rule 503. *See* Gov't Code § 552.302.

You also claim that the information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 which excepts from disclosure "information made confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." This section encompasses information another statute makes confidential. The submitted documents contain fingerprint information that may be confidential pursuant to sections 559.001, 559.002, and 559.003 of the Government Code. We will address this argument now.

Sections 559.001, 559.002 and 559.003 provide as follows:

Sec. 559.001. DEFINITIONS. In this chapter:

- (1) "Biometric identifier" means a retina or iris scan, fingerprint, voiceprint, or record of hand or face geometry.

(2) "Governmental body" has the meaning assigned by Section 552.003 [of the Government Code], except that the term includes each entity within or created by the judicial branch of state government.

Sec. 559.002. DISCLOSURE OF BIOMETRIC IDENTIFIER. A governmental body that possesses a biometric identifier of an individual:

(1) may not sell, lease, or otherwise disclose the biometric identifier to another person unless:

(A) the individual consents to the disclosure;

(B) the disclosure is required or permitted by a federal statute or by a state statute other than Chapter 552 [of the Government Code]; or

(C) the disclosure is made by or to a law enforcement agency for a law enforcement purpose; and

(2) shall store, transmit, and protect from disclosure the biometric identifier using reasonable care and in a manner that is the same as or more protective than the manner in which the governmental body stores, transmits, and protects its other confidential information.

Sec. 559.003. APPLICATION OF CHAPTER 552. A biometric identifier in the possession of a governmental body is exempt from disclosure under Chapter 552.

It does not appear to this office that section 559.002 permits the disclosure of the submitted fingerprint information. Therefore, the department must withhold the fingerprints under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 559.003 of the Government Code.

The submitted documents also contain confidential criminal history record information ("CHRI"). Criminal history record information generated by the National Crime Information Center ("NCIC") or by the Texas Crime Information Center ("TCIC") is confidential. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains, except that the DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See Gov't Code* § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Furthermore,

“[n]o agency or individual shall confirm the existence or nonexistence of criminal history record information to any person or agency that would not be eligible to receive the information itself.” 28 C.F.R. § 20.21(c)(2). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Accordingly, the marked CHRI information is excepted from required public disclosure by section 552.101 of the Government Code.

We note that the submitted information also contains a Texas driver’s license number. Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information related to a motor vehicle operator’s or driver’s license or permit issued by an agency of this state. Gov’t Code § 552.130(a)(1). Accordingly, you must withhold the Texas driver’s license information we have marked. The remaining information must be released to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov’t Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body’s intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental

body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Debbie K. Lee
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

DKL/seg

Ref: ID# 190507

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Sandy Partain-Smith
2603 Marlboro Street
Lubbock, Texas 79415
(w/o enclosures)