



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

November 13, 2003

Mr. Renaldo L. Stowers
Associate General Counsel
University of North Texas
P.O. Box 310907
Denton, Texas 76203-0907

OR2003-8167

Dear Mr. Stowers:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 190999.

The University of North Texas (the "university") received two requests from the same requestor, a former university police officer. The first request seeks tape recordings or written transcripts of police radio conversations, telephone conversations, and text page messages during a specific time period, personnel, disciplinary, investigative, and background check information regarding one former and one current employee of the university police department, and e-mails from the chief, deputy chief, and four other individuals. The second request seeks a copy of an internal affairs investigation report regarding the requestor, polygraph records pertaining to the requestor and the current and former employees referenced in the first request, and the "last employment status report" for the current and former employees. You indicate that some responsive information will be made available to the requestor. You also indicate that the requested internal affairs investigative report did not exist at the time the university received the present requests for information. We note that the Public Information Act does not require a governmental body to disclose information that did not exist at the time the request was received. *Economic Opportunities Dev. Corp. v. Bustamante*, 562 S.W.2d 266 (Tex.Civ.App.—San Antonio 1978, writ dismissed); Open Records Decision No. 452 at 3 (1986). You claim, however, that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.117,

552.130, and 552.137 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. The submitted documents include information relating to a polygraph examination. Section 1703.306(b) of the Occupations Code provides that "[a] governmental agency that acquires information from a polygraph examination under this section shall maintain the confidentiality of the information." The university must withhold the marked polygraph examination information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1703.306(b) of the Occupations Code.

You claim that an offense report in the submitted documents is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Section 552.108(a) excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime." Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See Gov't Code §§ 552.108(a)(1), (b)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state that "it is unknown whether the arrest report responsive to this request pertains to a pending criminal prosecution and whether its release would interfere with the detection investigation or prosecution of crime." Thus, you have provided us with no basis to determine that section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the offense report at issue. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases). We therefore determine that the university may not withhold the offense report under section 552.108.

We note that the submitted offense report contains a social security number. A social security number may be withheld in some circumstances under section 552.101 in conjunction with the 1990 amendments to the federal Social Security Act, 42 U.S.C. § 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I). *See Open Records Decision No. 622* (1994). These amendments make confidential social security numbers and related records that are obtained or maintained by a state agency or political subdivision of the state pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990. *See id.* We have no basis for concluding that the social security

¹ We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See Open Records Decision Nos. 499* (1988), *497* (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

number at issue is confidential under section 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I), and therefore excepted from public disclosure under section 552.101 on the basis of that federal provision. We caution, however, that section 552.352 of the Government Code imposes criminal penalties for the release of confidential information. Prior to releasing any social security number information, you should ensure that no such information was obtained or is maintained by the university pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990.

Next, the submitted documents also contain information that is excepted from disclosure under section 552.130 of the Government Code. Section 552.130 provides in pertinent part:

(a) Information is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 if the information relates to:

(1) a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state; [or]

(2) a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state[.]

We have marked the information in the submitted documents that the university must withhold under section 552.130.

We next address your claim under section 552.117 of the Government Code. Section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from required public disclosure the home address, home telephone number, social security number, and the family member information of a peace officer as defined by article 2.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. *See* Open Records Decision No. 622 (1994). You indicate that the submitted personnel records pertain to a peace officer and contain information excepted under section 552.117(a)(2). We have marked the information in the submitted documents that the university must withhold under section 552.117(a)(2).

Finally, the submitted documents contain the e-mail address of a member of the public. Section 552.137 of the Government Code provides:

(a) Except as otherwise provided by this section, an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body is confidential and not subject to disclosure under this chapter.

(b) Confidential information described by this section that relates to a member of the public may be disclosed if the member of the public affirmatively consents to its release.

(c) Subsection (a) does not apply to an e-mail address:

(1) provided to a governmental body by a person who has a contractual relationship with the governmental body or by the contractor's agent;

(2) provided to a governmental body by a vendor who seeks to contract with the governmental body or by the vendor's agent;

(3) contained in a response to a request for bids or proposals, contained in a response to similar invitations soliciting offers or information relating to a potential contract, or provided to a governmental body in the course of negotiating the terms of a contract or potential contract; or

(4) provided to a governmental body on a letterhead, coversheet, printed document, or other document made available to the public.

(d) Subsection (a) does not prevent a governmental body from disclosing an e-mail address for any reason to another governmental body or to a federal agency.

Act of June 2, 2003, 78th Leg., R.S., ch. 1089, § 1, 2003 Tex. Sess. Law Serv. 3124 (to be codified as amendment to Gov't Code § 552.137).

Section 552.137 requires a governmental body to withhold certain e-mail addresses of members of the public that are provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with the governmental body, unless the relevant members of the public have affirmatively consented to the release of the e-mail addresses. We note, however, that section 552.137 does not apply to the work e-mail addresses of officers or employees of a governmental body, a website address or Uniform Resource Locator, or the general e-mail address of a business. E-mail addresses within the scope of section 552.137(c) are also not excepted from disclosure under section 552.137.

We determine that the e-mail address in the submitted information is within the scope of section 552.137(a). Unless the university has received affirmative consent to disclose the e-mail address, the university must withhold the marked e-mail address under section 552.137 of the Government Code.

In summary, we have marked polygraph information that the university must withhold pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1703.306 of the Occupations Code. A social security number may be excepted under section 552.101 in conjunction with federal law. We have marked Texas driver's license and motor vehicle

registration information that must be withheld under section 552.130 of the Government Code. We have also marked information that must be withheld under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code. Unless the university receives affirmative consent to its release, the university must withhold the marked e-mail address under section 552.137 of the Government Code. The remainder of the submitted information must be released to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or

complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



David R. Saldivar
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

DRS/seg

Ref: ID# 190999

Enc: Submitted documents

c: Ms. Courtney Serrano-Hinston
351 South Highway 121 # 911
Lewisville, Texas 75067
(w/o enclosures)