



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

December 3, 2003

Ms. Lillian Guillen Graham
Assistant City Attorney
City of Mesquite
P.O. Box 850137
Mesquite, Texas 75185-0137

OR2003-8641

Dear Ms. Graham:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 191983.

The City of Mesquite (the "city") received two requests from the same requestor for any information related to a specified incident. You state that the city will release some of the requested information to the requestor. However, you claim that portions of the requested information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.119, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. The submitted information contains an accident report form that appears to have been completed pursuant to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. See Transp. Code § 550.064 (officer's accident report). Section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code states that except as provided by subsection (c), accident reports are privileged and confidential. Section 550.065(c)(4) provides for release of accident reports to a person who provides two of the following three pieces of information: (1) date of the accident; (2) name of any person involved in the accident; and (3) specific location of the accident. Transp. Code § 550.065(c)(4)). Under this provision, a governmental entity is required to release a copy of an accident report to a person who provides the law enforcement agency with two or more pieces of information specified by the statute. *Id.* In reviewing the information you have submitted to us, the

requestor has provided the city with all three pieces of information required by the statute. Thus, the city must release the submitted accident report under section 550.065(c)(4) of the Transportation Code. Although you contend that portions of this report are excepted under section 552.130, the exceptions found in the Public Information Act do not, as a general rule, apply to information that is made public by other statutes. See Open Records Decision No. 525 (1989) (statutory predecessor).

Also, chapter 772 of the Health and Safety Code authorizes the development of local emergency communications districts. Sections 772.118, 772.218, and 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code apply only to an emergency 9-1-1 district established in accordance with chapter 772. See Open Records Decision No. 649 (1996). These statutes make confidential the originating telephone numbers and addresses of 9-1-1 callers that are furnished by a service supplier. *Id.* at 2. Section 772.118 applies to an emergency communication district for a county with a population of more than two million. Section 772.218 applies to an emergency communication district for a county with a population of more than 860,000. Section 772.318 applies to an emergency communication district for a county with a population of more than 20,000. Subchapter E, which applies to counties with populations over 1.5 million, does not contain a confidentiality provision regarding 9-1-1 telephone numbers and addresses. Health & Safety Code § 772.401 *et seq.* You state that the emergency communication district here is subject to section 772.118. Therefore, the caller's phone number that you have marked is excepted from public disclosure based on section 552.101 as information deemed confidential by statute.

Further, we agree that a portion of the submitted information must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with the common law right of privacy. The doctrine of common law privacy protects information if it is highly intimate or embarrassing such that its release would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and the public has no legitimate interest in it. *Industrial Found. v. Texas Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668 (Tex. 1976). Prior decisions of this office have found that personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is protected by common law privacy. See Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992), 545 (1990). The personal financial information you have marked must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common law privacy.

Next, you contend that the submitted photographs of police officers are excepted under section 552.119 of the Government Code. This section provides:

- (a) A photograph that depicts a peace officer as defined by Article 2.12, Code of Criminal Procedure, or a security officer commissioned under Section 51.212, Education Code, the release of which would endanger the life or physical safety of the officer, is excepted from [required public disclosure] unless:

(1) the officer is under indictment or charged with an offense by information;

(2) the officer is a party in a fire or police civil service hearing or a case in arbitration; or

(3) the photograph is introduced as evidence in a judicial proceeding.

(b) A photograph exempt from disclosure under Subsection (a) may be made public only if the peace officer or security officer gives written consent to the disclosure.

Gov't Code § 552.119: In this instance, you have not demonstrated, nor is it apparent from our review of the submitted information, that release of the photographs would endanger the life or physical safety of the officers. We therefore determine that the city may not withhold the submitted photographs of police officers pursuant to section 552.119 of the Government Code, and they must be released.

Finally, section 552.130 of the Government Code prohibits the release of information that relates to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state or a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, with the exception of the information in the accident report form, the city must withhold the Texas driver's license, license plate, and motor vehicle information you have marked, as well as the Texas license plate numbers in the submitted photographs, pursuant to section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, we conclude that the city must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 of Government Code in conjunction with section 772.118 of the Health and Safety Code and in conjunction with common law privacy. Also, the city must withhold most of the section 552.130 information. All remaining information must be released, including the accident report form under section 550.065(c)(4) of the Transportation Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the

governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



W. Montgomery Meitler
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

WMM/lmt

Ref: ID# 191983

Enc: Submitted documents

c: Mr. Michael Shayne McVoy
705 Via Miramonte
Mesquite, Texas 75150
(w/o enclosures)