



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

GREG ABBOTT

March 4, 2004

Mr. Bruce P. Sadler
Assistant District Attorney
47th Judicial District of Texas
Potter and Armstrong Counties
501 S. Fillmore, Suite 5A
Amarillo, Texas 79101-2449

OR2004-1633

Dear Mr. Sadler:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 197130.

The Armstrong County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff") received a request for information related to an investigation of a named individual. You state that some of the requested information is subject to disclosure under section 22.082 of the Education Code or sections 411.087 and 411.090 of the Government Code. Additionally, you claim that portions of the requested information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 22.082 of the Education Code provides that "[t]he State Board for Educator Certification shall obtain from any law enforcement or criminal justice agency all criminal history record information that relates to an applicant for or holder of a certificate." Additionally, section 411.090 of the Government Code specifically grants a right of access for the State Board for Educator Certification (the "SBEC") to obtain criminal history record information ("CHRI") from the Department of Public Safety ("DPS"). Section 411.090 of the Government Code provides that

(a) The State Board for Educator Certification is entitled to obtain from [DPS] any criminal history record information maintained by the department about a person who has applied to the board for a certificate under Subchapter B, Chapter 21, Education Code.

Furthermore, pursuant to section 411.087 of the Government Code, an agency that is entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS is also authorized to "obtain from any other criminal justice agency in this state criminal history record information maintained by that [agency]." Gov't Code § 411.087(a)(2). CHRI consists of "information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions." Gov't Code § 411.082(2).

In this instance, the requestor is a staff investigator with the SBEC and states that the SBEC is conducting an investigation of an individual who has applied for or currently holds educator credentials. The requestor specifically seeks "copies of all offense, incident, and investigative reports" regarding the named individual. We conclude that when read together, section 22.082 of the Education Code and sections 411.087 and 411.090 of the Government Code give the SBEC a statutory right of access to a portion of the requested information. *See also* Gov't Code § 411.082(2); *cf. Brookshire v. Houston Indep. Sch. Dist.*, 508 S.W.2d 675, 678-79 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1974, no writ) (when legislature defines term in one statute and uses same term in relation to same subject matter in latter statute, later use of term is same as previously defined). Therefore, we agree that the sheriff must release information from the submitted documents to this requestor that shows the type of allegation made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions. *See* Open Records Decision No. 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exceptions to disclosure under the Public Information Act).

In regard to the remaining submitted information, section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." This section encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. Common-law privacy protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Industrial Found. v. Texas Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. Having reviewed the highlighted information in Exhibit E, and all of the information in Exhibits G, H, I, J, K, and L, we conclude that none of this information is protected by common-law privacy. Consequently, it may not be withheld on this basis.

You also assert section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code in regard to the highlighted information in Exhibit E, and all of the information in Exhibits G, H, I, J, K, and L. Section 552.108 provides in pertinent part:

(a) Information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 if:

- (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation or prosecution of crime; [or]
- (2) it is information that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]

Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1), (2). Generally speaking, subsections 552.108(a)(1) and (a)(2) are mutually exclusive. Subsection 552.108(a)(1) protects information that pertains to a pending criminal investigation or prosecution. In contrast, subsection 552.108(a)(2) protects information relating to a concluded criminal investigation or prosecution that did not result in a conviction or a deferred adjudication. A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See* Gov't Code § § 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). On the other hand, a governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate that the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. In this instance, the submitted information relates to an investigation that resulted in two charges of the offense of furnishing alcohol to a minor. You state that "[t]hese two cases have not been tried and are still pending before the Armstrong County Court." However, you also assert that the highlighted information in Exhibit E, and all of the information in Exhibits G, H, I, J, K, and L "deals with an investigation only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication." Because you have provided this office with conflicting representations, we find that you have not demonstrated the applicability of section 552.108. Therefore, the sheriff may not withhold any of the submitted information under section 552.108 of the Government Code.

However, the submitted social security numbers must be withheld in some circumstances under section 552.101 in conjunction with the 1990 amendments to the federal Social Security Act, 42 U.S.C. § 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I). *See* Open Records Decision No. 622 (1994). These amendments make confidential social security numbers and related records that are obtained and maintained by a state agency or political subdivision of the state pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990. *See id.* We have no basis for concluding that the social security numbers in the responsive information are confidential under section 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I), and therefore excepted from public disclosure under section 552.101 of the Public Information Act (the "Act") on the basis of that federal provision. We caution, however, that section 552.352 of the Act imposes criminal penalties for the release of confidential information. Prior to releasing any social security number

information, the sheriff should ensure that no such information was obtained or is maintained by the sheriff pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code prohibits the release of information that relates to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state or a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state. *See Gov't Code § 552.130.* Accordingly, we agree that the sheriff must withhold the Texas driver's license information you have highlighted, and the additional information we have marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Additionally, we note that a portion of the submitted information is confidential under section 552.136 of the Government Code, which states that "[n]otwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential." Gov't Code § 552.136. Thus, pursuant to this section, the sheriff must withhold the account numbers we have marked.

Finally, section 552.137 of the Government Code provides:

(a) Except as otherwise provided by this section, an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body is confidential and not subject to disclosure under this chapter.

(b) Confidential information described by this section that relates to a member of the public may be disclosed if the member of the public affirmatively consents to its release.

....

(d) Subsection (a) does not prevent a governmental body from disclosing an e-mail address for any reason to another governmental body or to a federal agency.

Section 552.137 requires a governmental body to withhold certain e-mail addresses of members of the public that are provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with the governmental body, unless the members of the public with whom the e-mail addresses are associated have affirmatively consented to their release. Section 552.137 does not apply to a government employee's work e-mail address or a business's general e-mail address or web address. We find that the e-mail addresses we have marked are excepted from disclosure under section 552.137(a). Accordingly, we conclude that, unless consent to release has been granted, the sheriff must withhold these e-mail addresses pursuant to section 552.137(a) of the Government Code.

In summary, we conclude that: 1) the submitted social security numbers may be confidential under federal law; and 2) the sheriff must withhold the section 552.130, 552.136, and 552.137 information. All remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



W. Montgomery Meitler
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

WMM/lmt

Ref: ID# 197130

Enc: Submitted documents

c: Mr. Scott Byram
Staff Investigator
Professional Discipline Unit
State Board for Educator Certification
4616 W. Howard Lane, Suite 120
Austin, Texas 78728
(w/o enclosure)