



OFFICE *of the* ATTORNEY GENERAL
GREG ABBOTT

March 24, 2004

Mr. James T. Russell
Administrative Assistant
27th Judicial District of Texas
P.O. Box 540
Belton, Texas 76513-0540

OR2004-2231

Dear Mr. Russell:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 198153.

The District Attorney for the 27th Judicial District of Texas (the "district attorney") received a request for the "contents of the criminal court file and the District Attorney's office file(s)" pertaining to case number 03-967. You claim that portions of the requested information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.132 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information, some of which consists of representative sample information.² Initially, we note that the submitted information includes "Texas Peace Officer's Accident Reports," which are subject to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. Section 550.065(b) provides that, except as provided by subsection (c), accident reports are privileged and confidential. *See* Transp. Code § 550.065(b). Section 550.065(c)(4) provides for the release

¹Although you initially also raised sections 552.103, 552.107, 552.111, 552.134, and 552.136, you do not submit arguments in support of a claim under any of these sections. Therefore, we assume that you no longer urge these exceptions. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.301, .302.

²We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

of accident reports to a person who provides two of the following three pieces of information: (1) date of the accident; (2) name of any person involved in the accident; and (3) specific location of the accident. *See* Transp. Code § 550.065(c)(4). Under this provision, the Department of Public Safety or another governmental entity is required to release a copy of an accident report to a person who provides the agency with two or more pieces of information specified by the statute. *See id.* In this instance, we find that the requestor has not provided the district attorney with at least two of the three pieces of information required under section 550.065(c)(4). Accordingly, we conclude that the district attorney must withhold the submitted accident report forms pursuant to section 550.065(c)(4) of the Transportation Code.

We further note that portions of the submitted information constitute medical records that are subject to the Medical Practice Act (the "MPA"), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code. The MPA provides that "a record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter." Occ. Code § 159.002(b). This office has concluded that the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982). In addition, information that is subject to the MPA also includes information that was obtained from medical records. *See id.* § 159.002(a), (b), (c); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). When a patient is deceased, as here, medical records may be released only on the signed consent of the deceased's personal representative. *See* Occ. Code §§ 159.005(a)(5). The consent must specify (1) the information to be covered by the release, (2) reasons or purposes for the release, and (3) the person to whom the information is to be released. *See* Occ. Code §§ 159.004, .005. Section 159.002(c) also requires that any subsequent release of medical records be consistent with the purposes for which the governmental body obtained the records. *See* Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). We have marked the medical records that are subject to the MPA. *See* Occ. Code § 159.005(a)(5), (b); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 546 (1990) (finding that because hospital treatment is routinely conducted under supervision of physicians, documents relating to diagnosis and treatment during hospital stay would constitute protected MPA records). The district attorney may only disclose this information in accordance with the access provisions of the MPA. Absent the applicability of an MPA access provision, the district attorney must withhold these marked records pursuant to the MPA.

Next, we address your claims under section 552.108 of the Government Code for the information submitted in Exhibit A. Section 552.108, the "law enforcement exception," provides as follows:

- (a) Information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted from [required public disclosure] if:

(1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime;

(2) it is information that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication;

(3) it is information relating to a threat against a peace officer collected or disseminated under Section 411.048; or

(4) it is information that:

(A) is prepared by an attorney representing the state in anticipation of or in the course of preparing for criminal litigation; or

(B) reflects the mental impressions or legal reasoning of an attorney representing the state.

(b) An internal record or notation of a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that is maintained for internal use in matters relating to law enforcement or prosecution is excepted from [required public disclosure] if:

(1) release of the internal record or notation would interfere with law enforcement or prosecution;

(2) the internal record or notation relates to law enforcement only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication; or

(3) the internal record or notation:

(A) is prepared by an attorney representing the state in anticipation of or in the course of preparing for criminal litigation; or

(B) reflects the mental impressions or legal reasoning of an attorney representing the state.

(c) This section does not except [from public disclosure] information that is basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.

Gov't Code § 552.108. Section 552.108 is applicable to certain specific types of law enforcement information. Section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable if the release of the information would interfere with a pending criminal investigation or prosecution. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases). Section 552.108(b)(1) protects internal records of a law enforcement agency, the release of which would interfere with law enforcement and crime prevention. *See City of Fort Worth v. Cornyn*, 86 S.W.3d 320, 327 (Tex. App.—Austin 2002, no pet. h.) (section 552.108(b)(1) protects information that, if released, would permit private citizens to anticipate weaknesses in police department, avoid detection, jeopardize officer safety, and generally undermine police efforts to effectuate state laws). Sections 552.108(a)(2) and 552.108(b)(2) are applicable only if the information at issue relates to a concluded case that did not result in a conviction or a deferred adjudication. Section 552.108(a)(3) is applicable to information collected or disseminated under section 411.048 of the Government Code. Sections 552.108(a)(4) and 552.108(b)(3) are applicable to information that was prepared by an attorney representing the state in anticipation of or in the course of preparing for criminal litigation or that reflects the mental impressions or legal reasoning of an attorney representing the state.

A governmental body that claims an exception to disclosure under section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why this exception is applicable to the information that the governmental body seeks to withhold. *See Gov't Code § 552.301(e)(1)(A)*; *Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977); Open Records Decision No. 434 at 2-3 (1986). We understand you to assert that the information submitted in Exhibit A comprises internal records or notations of the district attorney's office that are maintained for internal use in matters relating to law enforcement or prosecution and were prepared by the district attorney's office in anticipation of or in the course of preparing for criminal litigation. Therefore, based on your representations and our review of the information at issue, we conclude that the information submitted in Exhibit A is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108(b)(3) of the Government Code.³

You claim that portions of the remaining submitted information are excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. Section 552.101 excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision," and encompasses information protected by other statutes. Criminal history record information ("CHRI") generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* Section

³As section 552.108 is dispositive, we do not address your remaining claims for this information.

411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains, except that the DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083.

Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090 - .127. Thus, any CHRI generated by the federal government or another state may not be made available to the requestor except in accordance with federal regulations. *See* Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). Furthermore, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. Therefore, to the extent that the submitted records contain CHRI that was obtained pursuant to these state and federal laws, it must be withheld under section 552.101 as information made confidential by law.

We also note that the submitted records contain fingerprint information. Section 552.101 also encompasses sections 560.001, 560.002, and 560.003 of the Government Code, which govern fingerprint information and provide:

Sec. 560.001. DEFINITIONS. In this chapter

- (1) "Biometric identifier" means a retina or iris scan, fingerprint, voiceprint, or record of hand or face geometry.
- (2) "Governmental body" has the meaning assigned by Section 552.003 [of the Government Code], except that the term includes each entity within or created by the judicial branch of state government.

Sec. 560.002. DISCLOSURE OF BIOMETRIC IDENTIFIER. A governmental body that possesses a biometric identifier of an individual:

- (1) may not sell, lease, or otherwise disclose the biometric identifier to another person unless:
 - (A) the individual consents to the disclosure;
 - (B) the disclosure is required or permitted by a federal statute or by a state statute other than Chapter 552 [of the Government Code]; or

(C) the disclosure is made by or to a law enforcement agency for a law enforcement purpose; and

(2) shall store, transmit, and protect from disclosure the biometric identifier using reasonable care and in a manner that is the same as or more protective than the manner in which the governmental body stores, transmits, and protects its other confidential information.

Sec. 560.003. APPLICATION OF CHAPTER 552. A biometric identifier in the possession of a governmental body is exempt from disclosure under Chapter 552.

Gov't Code §§ 560.001-.003. Thus, pursuant to section 552.101 and section 560.003, the district attorney must withhold the fingerprint information we have marked, unless section 560.002 permits its disclosure.

Among the documents at issue is a presentence investigation report, which is made confidential under section 9(j) of article 42.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure and thus must be withheld pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code. Article 42.12, section 9(j), provides as follows:

(j) The judge by order may direct that any information and records that are not privileged and that are relevant to a report required by Subsection (a) or Subsection (k) of this section be released to an officer conducting a presentence investigation under Subsection (i) of this section or a postsentence report under Subsection (k) of this section. The judge may also issue a subpoena to obtain that information. A report and all information obtained in connection with a presentence investigation or postsentence report are confidential and may be released only to those persons and under those circumstances authorized under Subsections (d), (e), (f), (h), (k), and (l) of this section and as directed by the judge for the effective supervision of the defendant. Medical and psychiatric records obtained by court order shall be kept separate from the defendant's community supervision file and may be released only by order of the judge.

Because none of the circumstances described in subsections (d), (e), (f), (h), (k), or (l) appears to be present here, we conclude that the presentence investigation report is made confidential by statute and therefore is excepted from public disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. Accordingly, the district attorney must withhold this document.

In addition, we note that the remaining submitted information includes social security numbers that may be confidential under federal law. Section 552.101 also encompasses

amendments to the Social Security Act, 42 U.S.C. § 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I), that make confidential social security numbers and related records that were obtained or are maintained by a state agency or political subdivision of the state pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990. *See* Open Records Decision No. 622 (1994). We have no basis for concluding that the social security numbers at issue are confidential under section 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I) and therefore excepted from public disclosure under section 552.101 on the basis of that federal provision. We caution, however, that section 552.352 of the Government Code imposes criminal penalties for the release of confidential information. Prior to releasing any social security number information, the district attorney should ensure that no such information was obtained or is maintained by the district attorney pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990.

Juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997 are confidential under section 58.007 of the Family Code. The relevant language of section 58.007(c) reads as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
- (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapter B.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). We note, however, that information relating to juvenile crime victims is not made confidential by section 58.007. *See* Open Records Decision No. 628 at 6 (1994) (predecessor statute). The information that you seek to withhold pursuant to section 58.007 pertains to the identities of juvenile crime victims. Thus, section 58.007 does not make this information confidential, and it may not be withheld on this basis.

You further claim that the records submitted in Exhibit G are subject to the Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act of 1974 ("FERPA"), 20 U.S.C. § 1232g. Section 552.026 of the Government Code incorporates FERPA into chapter 552 of the Government Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 634 at 6-8 (1995). Section 552.026 provides:

[t]his chapter does not require the release of information contained in education records of an educational agency or institution, except in conformity with the Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act of 1974, Sec. 513, Pub. L. No. 93-380, 20 U.S.C. Sec. 1232g.

Gov't Code § 552.026. FERPA provides that no federal funds will be made available under any applicable program to an educational agency or institution that releases personally identifiable information (other than directory information) contained in a student's education records to anyone but certain numerated federal, state, and local officials and institutions, unless otherwise authorized by the student's parent. *See* 20 U.S.C. § 1232g(b)(1). "Education records" are those records, files, documents, and other materials which

- (i) contain information directly related to a student; and
- (ii) are *maintained by an educational agency or institution* or by a person acting for such agency or institution.

20 U.S.C. § 1232g(a)(4)(A) (emphasis added). We note that the district attorney is not an educational agency or institution attended by students. Consequently, the information that you seek to withhold in Exhibit G is not an "education record" as defined by FERPA. *See* Open Records Decision No. 390 (1983). Accordingly, we conclude that FERPA is inapplicable to the information at issue, and it may not be withheld from the requestor on that basis.

You contend that some of the remaining submitted information is protected by the common law and constitutional rights to privacy, which are encompassed by section 552.101. The doctrine of common law privacy protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. 540 S.W.2d at 683.

Constitutional privacy consists of two interrelated types of privacy: (1) the right to make certain kinds of decisions independently and (2) an individual's interest in avoiding disclosure of personal matters. Open Records Decision No. 455 at 4 (1987). The first type protects an individual's autonomy within "zones of privacy," which include matters related to marriage, procreation, contraception, family relationships, and child rearing and education. *Id.* The second type of constitutional privacy requires a balancing between the individual's privacy interests and the public's need to know information of public concern. *Id.* The scope of information protected is narrower than that under the common law doctrine of privacy and

includes only information that concerns the “most intimate aspects of human affairs.” *Id.* at 5 (citing *Ramie v. City of Hedwig Village, Texas*, 765 F.2d 490 (5th Cir. 1985)).

This office has found that the following types of information are excepted from required public disclosure under constitutional or common law privacy: an individual’s criminal history when compiled by a governmental body, *see* Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990) (citing *United States Dep’t of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749 (1989)); some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps); personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992), 545 (1990); information concerning the intimate relations between individuals and their family members, *see* Open Records Decision No. 470 (1987); and identities of victims of sexual abuse, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 440 (1986), 393 (1983), 339 (1982).

Having reviewed the submitted information, we agree that some of it is protected by common-law privacy and must be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis. However, we find that none of the remaining information in these documents is protected by constitutional or common-law privacy and may not, therefore, be withheld from disclosure on that basis.

Finally, we address your claim that the submitted records also contain information relating to a driver’s license or motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state. Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides in relevant part:

(a) Information is excepted from the requirement of Section 552.021 if the information relates to:

- (1) a motor vehicle operator’s or driver’s license or permit issued by an agency of this state; [or]
- (2) a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state[.]

Gov’t Code § 552.130(a)(1)-(2). To the extent the information that we have marked relates to a driver’s license or motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state, the district attorney must withhold this information from disclosure pursuant to section 552.130.

In summary, the district attorney may withhold the information submitted in Exhibit A under section 552.108(b)(3). The district attorney must withhold the following: (1) accident report forms pursuant to section 550.065(c)(4) of the Transportation Code; (2) medical records pursuant to the MPA, unless an MPA access provision is applicable; (3) CHRI obtained

pursuant to the state or federal regulations governing such information; (4) fingerprint information in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code, unless section 560.002 permits its disclosure; (5) the presentence investigation report made confidential by section 9(j) of article 42.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure; and (6) the information that we have marked in conjunction with common law privacy. Social security numbers may be confidential under federal law. Texas-issued driver's license and motor vehicle record information must be withheld from disclosure under section 552.130. The remaining submitted information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877)673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be

sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512)475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Cindy Nettles
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CN/jh

Ref: ID# 198153

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Jaime M. Lynn
The Lynn Law Firm, P.C.
6601 Vaught Ranch Road, Suite 102
Austin, Texas 78730
(w/o enclosures)