



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

June 17, 2004

Mr. Anthony S. Corbett
Freeman & Corbett, LLP
8500 Bluffstone Boulevard, Suite B-104
Austin, Texas 78759

OR2004-4944

Dear Mr. Corbett:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 203625.

The Brushy Creek Municipal Utility District (the "district"), which you represent, received a request for the personnel file of a specified employee. You claim that portions of the requested information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.117 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. The submitted Form W-4, the Employee's Withholding Allowance Certificate, is confidential as tax return information under title 26, section 6103(a) of the United States Code and must not be released. Open Records Decision No. 600 at 8-9 (1992). Therefore, the district must withhold the submitted Form W-4 from disclosure.

You have also submitted an Employment Eligibility Verification, Form I-9. The Form I-9 is governed by title 8, section 1324a of the United States Code, which provides that the form "may not be used for purposes other than for enforcement of this chapter" and for enforcement of other federal statutes governing crime and criminal investigations. 8 U.S.C. § 1324a(b)(5); *see* 8 C.F.R. § 274a.2(b)(4). Release of this document under the Act would be "for purposes other than for enforcement" of the referenced federal statutes. Accordingly, we conclude that Form I-9 is confidential under section 552.101 and may only be released in compliance with the federal laws and regulations governing the employment verification system.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common law privacy. Common law privacy protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Industrial Found. v. Tex. Indus. Acc. Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. 540 S.W.2d at 683.

Additionally, this office has found that the following types of information are excepted from required public disclosure under common law privacy: some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps), personal financial information not relating to the financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992), 545 (1990), information concerning the intimate relations between individuals and their family members, *see* Open Records Decision No. 470 (1987), and identities of victims of sexual abuse, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 440 (1986), 393 (1983), 339 (1982). We have marked the information on the PPO Employee Action Form that you have submitted that the district must withhold under section 552.101 in conjunction with the common law right to privacy.

We next address your claim that section 552.117 of the Government Code is applicable to the submitted information. Section 552.117 excepts from disclosure the home address, telephone number, social security number, and family member information of current or former officials or employees of a governmental body who request that this information be kept confidential in accordance with section 552.024. Whether a particular piece of information is protected by section 552.117 must be determined at the time the request for it is made. *See* Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989). The district must withhold this type of information pursuant to section 552.117 only to the extent that the respective employee elected to keep this information confidential prior to the district's receipt of the current records request.

You have submitted the applicable employee election form. The employee has timely elected to not allow public access to her home address and telephone number in accordance with the procedures of section 552.024 of the Government Code. Therefore, the district must withhold the employee's home address and telephone number, which we have marked, pursuant to section 552.117 of the Government Code. However, the submitted election form does not provide the employee an opportunity to elect to keep confidential her social security number or information about her family members. Therefore, the district may not withhold this information pursuant to the submitted election form. However, if the employee has timely elected to keep her social security number and information about her family members confidential on a form not submitted to us for review, the district must withhold this information as well.

Notwithstanding the employee's election to withhold her social security number, we note that it may be confidential under federal law. A social security number may be withheld in some circumstances under section 552.101 in conjunction with the 1990 amendments to the federal Social Security Act, 42 U.S.C. § 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I). *See* Open Records Decision No. 622 (1994). These amendments make confidential social security numbers and related records that are obtained and maintained by a state agency or political subdivision of the state pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990. *See id.* We have no basis for concluding that the social security number in the responsive information is confidential under section 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I), and therefore excepted from public disclosure under section 552.101 of the Act on the basis of that federal provision. We caution, however, that section 552.352 of the Act imposes criminal penalties for the release of confidential information. Prior to releasing any social security number information, the district should ensure that no such information was obtained or is maintained by the district pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990.

In summary, the Form W-4 and Form I-9 must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with federal law. The district must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with the common law right to privacy. The district must withhold the named employee's home address and telephone number under section 552.117 of the Government Code. If the employee also timely elected to withhold her social security number and information concerning family members, the district must also withhold that information. Notwithstanding the employee's election to withhold her social security number from disclosure, prior to its release, the district should ensure that no such information was obtained or is maintained by the district pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990. The remaining information must be released to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the

governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Cary Grace
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

ECG/krl

Ref: ID# 203625

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. James Calvin Blackman
1358 County Road B
Lexington, Texas 78947
(w/o enclosures)