



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

July 20, 2004

Mr. James L. Hall
Assistant General Counsel
Texas Department of Criminal Justice
P.O. Box 4004
Huntsville, Texas 77342

OR2004-6013

Dear Mr. Hall:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 205520.

The Texas Department of Criminal Justice (the "department") received a request for all records regarding an accident that occurred at the Willacy State Jail on November 14, 2003 involving a named individual. You state that some information has been released to the requestor. You claim that the remaining requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.134 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note that the submitted information includes medical records, access to which is governed by the Medical Practice Act ("MPA"), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides in pertinent part:

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the

information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Occ. Code § 159.002(b), (c). The MPA ordinarily encompasses only records created either by a physician or by someone acting under the supervision of a physician. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982). However, when a file is created as the result of a hospital stay, this office has determined that all of the documents in the file that relate to diagnosis and treatment constitute either physician-patient communications or records of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician, created or maintained by a physician, for purposes of the MPA. *See* Open Records Decision No. 546 (1990).

Medical records pertaining to a deceased patient may only be released upon the signed consent of the personal representative of the deceased. *See* Occ. Code § 159.005(a)(5). Medical records must be released upon signed, written consent, provided that the consent specifies (1) the information to be covered by the release, (2) reasons or purposes for the release, and (3) the person to whom the information is to be released. *See* Occ. Code § 159.004, .005. The MPA requires that any subsequent release of medical records be consistent with the purposes for which a governmental body obtained the records. Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). We have marked the medical records that may be released only as provided under the MPA.

Additionally, section 611.002 of the Health and Safety Code applies to “[c]ommunications between a patient and a professional, [and] records of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient that are created or maintained by a professional.” *See also* Health & Safety Code § 611.001 (defining “patient” and “professional”). Sections 611.004 and 611.0045 provide for access to mental health records only by certain individuals. *See* Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). We have marked the mental health records that are confidential under section 611.002 and may not be released except in accordance with sections 611.004 and 611.0045 of the Health and Safety Code. Health & Safety Code § 611.002(b); *see id.* §§ 611.004, 611.0045.

We also note that portions of the information at issue constitute dental records that are subject to chapter 258 of the Occupations Code. Section 258.102 provides:

(a) The following information is privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this article:

- (1) a communication between a dentist and a patient that relates to a professional service provided by the dentist; and
- (2) a dental record.

(b) The privilege described by this section applies regardless of when the patient received the professional service from the dentist.

Occ. Code § 258.102. A “dental record” means dental information about a patient that is created or maintained by a dentist and relates to the history or treatment of the patient. *See* Occ. Code § 258.101. We have marked documents created or maintained by a dentist which relate to the history or treatment of the patient. Absent the applicability of a dental record access provision, the department must withhold this information pursuant to chapter 258 of the Occupations Code.

Finally, we address your claim under section 552.134 of the Government Code with respect to the remaining information. Section 552.134(a) provides:

Except as provided by Subsection (b) or by Section 552.029 [of the Government Code], information obtained or maintained by the Texas Department of Criminal Justice is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information about an inmate who is confined in a facility operated by or under a contract with the department.

Gov’t Code § 552.134(a). Section 552.029 of the Government Code provides:

Notwithstanding Section 508.313 or 552.134, the following information about an inmate who is confined in a facility operated by or under a contract with the Texas Department of Criminal Justice is subject to required disclosure under Section 552.021:

(8) basic information regarding the death of an inmate in custody, an incident involving the use of force, or an alleged crime involving the inmate.

Gov’t Code § 552.029(8). Section 552.134 is explicitly made subject to section 552.029. Under section 552.029(8), basic information regarding the death of an inmate in custody, an alleged crime involving an inmate, and an incident involving the use of force is subject to required disclosure.

The information at issue consists of data pertaining to a former inmate of the department. Although the individual is now deceased, we agree that section 552.134 applies because the information is about an inmate. We note, however, that some of the submitted information concerns an alleged crime involving that inmate, and the death of the inmate in custody. Accordingly, while basic information pertaining to the alleged crime involving the inmate and the death of the inmate must be released pursuant to section 552.029(8), the remainder of the information at issue must be withheld under section 552.134. As we are able to make this determination, we need not address your additional arguments.

In summary, we conclude (1) the medical records we have marked may be released only as provided under the MPA, (2) the mental health records we have marked are confidential under section 611.002 and may not be released except in accordance with sections 611.004 and 611.0045 of the Health and Safety Code, (3) absent the applicability of a dental record access provision, documents created or maintained by a dentist which relate to the history or treatment of the patient, which we have marked, must be withheld pursuant to chapter 258 of the Occupations Code, and (4) except for basic information pertaining to the alleged crime involving the inmate and the death of the inmate, which must be released pursuant to section 552.029(8), the remaining information at issue must be withheld under section 552.134.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Sarah Swanson", with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

Sarah I. Swanson
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

SIS/seg

Ref: ID# 205520

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Hector Rodriguez
Brin & Brin, P.C.
123 West McIntyre
Edinburg, Texas 78541
(w/o enclosures)