



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

GREG ABBOTT

November 17, 2004

Ms. Mia Settle-Vinson  
Assistant City Attorney  
City of Houston  
P. O. Box 1562  
Houston, Texas 77251-1562

OR2004-9756

Dear Ms. Settle-Vinson:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 213326.

The City of Houston (the "city") received a request for all police reports from a specified address "and the surrounding two-mile radius of this location for the past two years from March 16<sup>th</sup>, 2004." You state that the department is unable to search for records based on a "two-mile radius."<sup>1</sup> You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.<sup>2</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup>We note that the Public Information Act (the "Act") does not require a governmental body to disclose information that did not exist at the time the request was received, nor does it require a governmental body to prepare new information in response to a request. *Economic Opportunities Dev. Corp. v. Bustamante*, 562 S.W.2d 266 (Tex. Civ. App.—San Antonio 1978, writ dismissed); Attorney General Opinion H-90 (1973); Open Records Decision Nos. 452 at 2-3 (1986), 342 at 3 (1982), 87 (1975); *see also* Open Records Decision Nos. 572 at 1 (1990), 555 at 1-2 (1990), 416 at 5 (1984). However, a governmental body must make a good faith effort to relate a request to information which it holds. *See* Open Records Decision No. 561 at 8 (1990).

<sup>2</sup>We assume that the representative sample of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information other statutes make confidential. Section 58.007 of the Family Code provides in part:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapter B.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). Section 58.007(c) is applicable to records of juvenile conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997. *See* Open Records Decision No. 644 (1996). The juvenile must have been at least 10 years old and less than 17 years of age when the conduct occurred. *See* Fam. Code § 51.02(2) (defining “child” for purposes of title 3 of Family Code). Section 58.007 is not applicable to information that relates to a juvenile as a complainant, victim, witness, or other involved party and not as a suspect or offender. After reviewing the submitted information, we find that Exhibits 2, 6, 10, and 11 involve juvenile conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997. Thus, these exhibits are subject to section 58.007, and it does not appear that any of the exceptions in section 58.007 apply. Therefore, Exhibits 2, 6, 10, and 11 are confidential under section 58.007(c) of the Family Code and must be withheld pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code.<sup>3</sup>

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides in part as follows:

(a) The following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

---

<sup>3</sup>Because we reach this conclusion, we need not address your other arguments for this information.

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). We agree that Exhibit 5 consists of files, reports, records, communications, or working papers used or developed in an investigation under chapter 261, and is therefore within the scope of section 261.201 of the Family Code. You do not inform us that the city has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information. We therefore assume no such rule exists. Given this assumption, we conclude that Exhibit 5 is confidential pursuant to section 261.201 of the Family Code and therefore must be withheld in its entirety pursuant to section 552.101.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the common-law right to privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. In addition, this office has found that the following types of information are excepted from required public disclosure under common law privacy: an individual's criminal history when compiled by a governmental body, *see* Open Records Decision No. 565 (citing *United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749 (1989)); personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992), 545 (1990); some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps); and identities of victims of sexual abuse, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 440 (1986), 393 (1983), 339 (1982). After reviewing the submitted information, we find that it contains such highly intimate or embarrassing facts that are of no legitimate concern to the public. Thus, we conclude that the information we have marked is protected by common-law privacy and must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

We now turn to your section 552.108 arguments regarding the remaining submitted incident reports. Section 552.108(a)(1) excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime." Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state that Exhibits 4, 8, and 9 relate to inactive criminal investigations. You also state that

the statute of limitations has not run in any of these cases and that “the investigations may be reactivated once additional leads are developed.” Based upon these representations, we conclude that the release of Exhibits 4, 8, and 9 would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases). Therefore, we agree that section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to these incident reports.

Section 552.108(a)(2) excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate that the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. You assert that Exhibit 7 pertains to a criminal investigation that concluded in a final result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Therefore, we agree that section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to this incident report.

We note, however, that information normally found on the front page of an incident report is generally considered public. *See generally* Gov't Code § 552.108(c); *Houston Chronicle*, 531 S.W.2d at 186-188; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976). Thus, you must release the types of information that are considered to be front page incident report information from Exhibits 4, 7, 8, and 9, even if this information is not actually located on the front page of the incident reports. Although sections 552.108(a)(1) and (a)(2) authorize you to withhold the remaining information in Exhibits 4, 7, 8, and 9 from disclosure, you may choose to release all or part of the information at issue that is not otherwise confidential by law. *See* Gov't Code § 552.007.

In summary, we conclude that the city must withhold Exhibits 2, 6, 10, and 11 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007 of the Family Code, Exhibit 5 under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code, and the information we have marked in Exhibit 3 under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. Exhibits 4, 7, 8, and 9 may be withheld under section 552.108, except for basic information, which must be released pursuant to section 552.108(c).

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days.

*Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Sarah I. Swanson  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

SIS/krl

Ref: ID# 213326

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Kevin Kelley  
Kelley & Witherspoon, L.L.C.  
1700 Commerce, Suite 450  
Dallas, Texas 75201  
(w/o enclosures)