ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

November 22, 2004

Mr. James A. Frazier
Assistant General Counsel
Texas Department of Criminal Justice
P.O. Box 4004
Huntsville, Texas 77342

OR2004-9943

Dear Mr. Frazier:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 213836.

The Texas Department of Criminal Justice (the "department") received a request for all information in reference to an employment position. You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.117, 552.130, and 552.137 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.117 excepts from disclosure the home addresses and telephone numbers, social security numbers, and family member information of employees of the department, regardless of whether the employees complied with section 552.1175.[1] Thus, we agree that you must withhold this information, which we have marked, pursuant to section 552.117(a)(3) if the information pertains to a current or former employee of the department.

You assert the Texas driver's license numbers in the submitted information are excepted under section 552.130. Section 552.130 provides in relevant part the following:

[1]We note that a post office box number is not a "home address" for purposes of section 552.117. *See* Gov't Code § 552.117; Open Records Decision No. 622 at 4 (1994) (legislative history makes clear that purpose of section 552.117 is to protect public employees from being harassed at home).

> (a) Information is excepted from the requirement of Section 552.021 if the information relates to:
>
> > (1) a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state; [or]
> >
> > (2) a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state[.]

Gov't Code § 552.130(a). We note that section 552.130 does not protect driver's license numbers from other states. You must withhold the Texas driver's license numbers we have marked under section 552.130.

Finally, you assert that the e-mail addresses in the submitted information are excepted under section 552.137. Section 552.137 provides the following:

> (a) Except as otherwise provided by this section, an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body is confidential and not subject to disclosure under this chapter.
>
> (b) Confidential information described by this section that relates to a member of the public may be disclosed if the member of the public affirmatively consents to its release.
>
> (c) Subsection (a) does not apply to an e-mail address:
>
> > (1) provided to a governmental body by a person who has a contractual relationship with the governmental body or by the contractor's agent;
> >
> > (2) provided to a governmental body by a vendor who seeks to contract with the governmental body or by the vendor's agent;
> >
> > (3) contained in a response to a request for bids or proposals, contained in a response to similar invitations soliciting offers or information relating to a potential contract, or provided to a governmental body in the course of negotiating the terms of a contract or potential contract; or
> >
> > (4) provided to a governmental body on a letterhead, coversheet, printed document, or other document made available to the public.

> (d) Subsection (a) does not prevent a governmental body from disclosing an e-mail address for any reason to another governmental body or to a federal agency.

Id. § 552.137. Under section 552.137, a governmental body must withhold the e-mail address of a member of the general public, unless the individual to whom the e-mail address belongs has affirmatively consented to its public disclosure. *See id.* § 552.137(b). You do not inform us that a member of the public has affirmatively consented to the release of any e-mail address contained in the submitted materials. The department must, therefore, withhold the e-mail addresses we have marked under section 552.137.

To conclude, the department must withhold (1) the marked section 552.117 information if it pertains to former or current employees of the department, (2) the marked Texas driver's license numbers under section 552.130, and (3) the marked e-mail addresses under section 552.137. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

James L. Coggeshall
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JLC/seg

Ref: ID# 213836

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Tom Warner
7109 Stonegate Drive
Fort Worth, Texas 76126
(w/o enclosures)