



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

December 1, 2004

Mr. Robert D. Andron
General Counsel
El Paso Water Utilities
P. O. Box 511
El Paso, Texas 79961-0001

OR2004-10141

Dear Mr. Andron:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 214060.

The El Paso Water Utilities (the "utility") received a request for twelve categories of information "related to the purchase of land and/or water rights in Hudspeth County." You state that some responsive information has been made available to the requestors. You claim that the remaining requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.105, and 552.131 of the Government Code. In addition, you indicate that you notified Dell City Holdings, L.L.C. ("DCH") and Dell Valley Water Rights Owners, L.L.C. ("DVWRO"), the interested third parties, of the request for information and of each party's right to submit arguments as to why the requested information should not be released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305 (permitting interested third party to submit to attorney general reasons why requested information should not be released); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (determining that statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception in Act in certain circumstances). We have received arguments from DVWRO as to why its information should not be released. We have considered the claimed exceptions and reviewed the submitted information.

You assert that the submitted information is excepted under section 552.105 of the Government Code. Section 552.105 excepts from required public disclosure information "relating to"

- (1) the location of real or personal property for a public purpose prior to public announcement of the project; or
- (2) appraisals or purchase price of real or personal property for a public purpose prior to the formal award of contracts for the property.

Gov't Code § 552.105. Section 552.105 is designed to protect a governmental body's planning and negotiating position with regard to particular transactions. Open Records Decision Nos. 564 (1990), 357 (1982), 310 (1982). Information excepted under section 552.105 that pertains to such negotiations may be excepted so long as the transaction is not complete. Open Records Decision No. 310 (1982). A governmental body may withhold information "which, if released, would impair or tend to impair [its] 'planning and negotiating position in regard to particular transactions.'" Open Records Decision No. 357 at 3 (1982) (quoting Open Records Decision No. 222 (1979)). The question of whether specific information, if publicly released, would impair a governmental body's planning and negotiation position in regard to particular transactions is a question of fact. Accordingly, this office will accept a governmental body's good faith determination in this regard, unless the contrary is clearly shown as a matter of law. Open Records Decision No. 564 (1990).

You state that the utility is currently engaged in negotiations "for real estate and its associated water rights," and that "[n]o contract of sale or option agreement has been executed." You further state that release of the submitted information "will severely drive up the price of such land and water rights [and] would have a devastating effect on the [utility's] ability to serve the region as it is charged to do." Based on your representations and our review of the submitted information, we conclude that you have demonstrated the applicability of section 552.105 to the submitted information. Thus, the utility may withhold the information at issue under section 552.105 of the Government Code.¹

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney

¹As section 552.105 is dispositive, we do not address the other arguments against disclosure.

general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within 10 calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within 10 calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877)673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512)475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Cindy Nettles
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CN/krl

Ref: ID# 214060

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Luther Jones
1800 North Stanton, Suite 806
El Paso, Texas 79902
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. David Escobar
8811 Alameda Avenue
El Paso, Texas 79907
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Michael A. Gershon
Lloyd Gosselink Blevins Rochelle & Townsend, P.C.
111 Congress Avenue, Suite 1800
Austin, Texas 78701
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Ron C. Glover
Dell City Holdings, L.L.C.
P. O. Box 174
Dell City, Texas 79837
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. William J. Miller
Dell Valley Water Rights Owners, L.L.C.
c/o CL Land Company, L.L.C.
555 Seventeenth Street, Suite 2400
Denver, Colorado 30202
(w/o enclosures)