



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

January 21, 2005

Mr. Les Moore
Police Legal Advisor
Irving Police Department
305 North O'Connor Road
Irving, Texas 75061

OR2005-00651

Dear Mr. Moore:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 217364.

The Irving Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a named individual, to include information pertaining to the investigation of the individual's death and police video footage pertaining to the shooting death of the individual on March 18, 2003. The request also asks for "all documentation and reports" pertaining to a specified address in the City of Irving "up to October 25, 2004." You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.103 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

We must address the department's obligations under section 552.301 of the Government Code. Under section 552.301(e), a governmental body receiving a request for information that the governmental body wishes to withhold pursuant to an exception to disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act") is required to submit to this office within fifteen business days of receiving the request (1) general written comments stating the reasons why the stated exceptions apply that would allow the information to be withheld, (2) a copy of the written request for information, (3) a signed statement or sufficient evidence showing the date the governmental body received the written request, and (4) a copy of the specific information requested or representative samples, labeled to indicate which exceptions apply to which parts of the documents. In this case, while you acknowledge that the present request encompasses police video footage of a specified incident, and you state that the department maintains "videotapes from squad cars" pertaining to the incident, you have not submitted copies or samples of the videotapes to this office for review. We therefore

determine the department has failed to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301(e) with respect to this portion of the request.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released, unless the governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.302; *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982).

Generally, a governmental body may demonstrate a compelling reason to withhold information by a showing that the information is made confidential by another source of law or affects third party interests. *See* Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). Section 552.103 of the Government Code is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects the governmental body's interests and may be waived by the governmental body. Thus, section 552.103 does not demonstrate a compelling reason to withhold information from the public. *See Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S.W.3d 469 (Tex. App.—Dallas 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive section 552.103); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally). We therefore determine the department may not withhold the requested videotapes pursuant to section 552.103. Furthermore, as you have not submitted the videotapes for review, we have no basis to determine that a compelling reason exists to withhold the videotapes. We therefore conclude the department must release the videotapes of the incident at issue to the requestor. With respect to the responsive information you have submitted for review, we will address your claim under section 552.103.

Section 552.103 of the Government Code provides as follows:

(a) Information is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information relating to litigation of a civil or criminal nature to which the state or a political subdivision is or may be a party or to which an officer or employee of the state or a political subdivision, as a consequence of the person's office or employment, is or may be a party.

....

(c) Information relating to litigation involving a governmental body or an officer or employee of a governmental body is excepted from disclosure under Subsection (a) only if the litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date that the requestor applies to the officer for public information for access to or duplication of the information.

Gov't Code § 552.103(a), (c). A governmental body has the burden of providing relevant facts and documents to show that the section 552.103(a) exception is applicable in a particular situation. The test for meeting this burden is a showing that (1) litigation was pending or reasonably anticipated on the date the governmental body received the request for information, and (2) the information at issue is related to that litigation. *Univ. of Tex. Law Sch. v. Tex. Legal Found.*, 958 S.W.2d 479, 481 (Tex. App.—Austin 1997, no pet.); *Heard v. Houston Post Co.*, 684 S.W.2d 210, 212 (Tex. App.—Houston [1st Dist.] 1984, writ ref'd n.r.e.); Open Records Decision No. 551 at 4 (1990). A governmental body must meet both prongs of this test for information to be excepted under section 552.103(a).

In this case, you state that the information at issue pertains to a shooting involving officers of the department. However, you do not provide comments explaining how the section 552.103 exception applies to the information. You have not shown that the submitted information is related to any litigation in which the department is a party that was pending on the date the department received the present request. Furthermore, you have not argued or shown that the submitted information is related to any litigation that was reasonably anticipated by the department on the date the department received the present request. Because you have not met your burden of explaining how section 552.103 is applicable to the information at issue, we determine that the submitted information is not excepted from disclosure under section 552.103 and may not be withheld on that basis.

We note that the submitted documents include a Texas license plate number that is excepted from disclosure under section 552.130 of the Government Code. Section 552.130 excepts information relating to a Texas motor vehicle driver's license and information relating to a Texas motor vehicle title or registration. Gov't Code § 552.130. Section 552.130 does not encompass motor vehicle information that pertains exclusively to a deceased individual. *See* Open Records Decision No. 272 (1981). The department must withhold the license plate number we have marked pursuant to section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, we have marked a Texas license plate number that must be withheld pursuant to section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remainder of the requested information to the requestor in its entirety.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within thirty calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within ten calendar days.

Id. § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, within ten calendar days of this ruling, the governmental body will do one of the following three things: 1) release the public records; 2) notify the requestor of the exact day, time, and place that copies of the records will be provided or that the records can be inspected; or 3) notify the requestor of the governmental body's intent to challenge this letter ruling in court. If the governmental body fails to do one of these three things within ten calendar days of this ruling, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Tex. Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within ten calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



David R. Saldivar
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

DRS/seg

Ref: ID# 217364

Enc: Submitted documents

c: Mr. Travis Bannister
3800 West Devonshire Avenue, #H189
Hemet, California 92545
(w/o enclosures)