



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

March 1, 2005

Ms. Sandra Smith
Executive Director
Texas Board of Chiropractic Examiners
333 Guadalupe, Suite 3-825
Austin, Texas 78701

OR2005-01765

Dear Ms. Smith:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 219596.

The Texas Board of Chiropractic Examiners (the "board") received a request for all files concerning a named chiropractor and clinic. You state that the board is releasing some responsive information. However, you claim that the remaining requested information is excepted from disclosure pursuant to sections 552.026, 552.101, 552.108, 552.114, 552.130, and 552.137 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

You assert that the submitted college transcripts in Exhibit A are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.026 and 552.114 of the Government Code. Section 552.026 provides as follows:

This chapter does not require the release of information contained in education records of an educational agency or institution, except in conformity with the Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act of 1974, Sec. 513, Pub. L. No. 93-380, 20 U.S.C. Sec. 1232g.

Gov't Code § 552.026. The Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act of 1974 ("FERPA") provides that no federal funds will be made available under any applicable program to an educational agency or institution that releases personally identifiable information (other than

directory information) contained in a student's education records to anyone but certain enumerated federal, state, and local officials and institutions, unless otherwise authorized by the student's parent. *See* 20 U.S.C. § 1232g(b)(1). "Education records" means those records that contain information directly related to a student and are maintained by an educational agency or institution or by a person acting for such agency or institution. *Id.* § 1232g(a)(4)(A). We note that the board is not an educational agency or institution.

However, FERPA provides that an educational agency or institution may only transfer personal information to a third party "on the condition that such party will not permit any other party to have access to such information without the written consent of the parents of the student." *Id.* § 1232g(b)(4)(B). The federal regulations provide that a third party that receives such information from an educational agency may use the information only for the purposes for which the disclosure was made. 34 C.F.R. § 99.33(a)(2). Here, you state that the board received the transcripts from educational institutions. Therefore, pursuant to sections 1232g(b)(4)(B) and 99.33(a)(2), the board may only release these transcripts upon consent of the named chiropractor.¹

We note that the remaining submitted information contains the social security numbers of chiropractors. Section 552.101 excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses other statutes, such as section 58.001 of the Occupations Code which provides as follows:

The social security number of an applicant for or holder of a license, certificate of registration, or other legal authorization issued by a licensing agency to practice in a specific occupation or profession that is provided to the licensing agency is confidential and not subject to disclosure under Chapter 552, Government Code.

Occ. Code § 58.001. Accordingly, we find that the chiropractors' social security numbers are confidential under section 58.001 of the Occupations Code and thus must be withheld from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have marked this information accordingly.

We note, that the remaining submitted information also contains a social security number of an individual who may not be licensed by the board. However, this individual's social security number may nevertheless be confidential. A social security number must be withheld in some circumstances under section 552.101 in conjunction with the 1990 amendments to the federal Social Security Act, 42 U.S.C. § 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I). *See* Open Records Decision No. 622 (1994). These amendments make confidential social security

¹ As our determination under FERPA is dispositive, we need not address section 552.114.

numbers and related records that are obtained or maintained by a state agency or political subdivision of the state pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990. *See id.* We have no basis for concluding that the social security number at issue is confidential under section 405(c)(2)(C)(viii)(I), and therefore excepted from public disclosure under section 552.101 on the basis of that federal provision. We caution, however, that section 552.352 of the Government Code imposes criminal penalties for the release of confidential information. Prior to releasing any social security number information, you should ensure that no such information was obtained or is maintained by the board pursuant to any provision of law enacted on or after October 1, 1990.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common law privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. In addition, this office has found that the following types of information are excepted from required public disclosure under common law privacy: an individual's criminal history when compiled by a governmental body, *see* Open Records Decision No. 565 (citing *United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749 (1989)); personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992), 545 (1990); and some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps). This office generally concludes that ownership percentages reflect personal financial information. However, where an individual holds a one hundred percent interest in a business, the information simply reflects that the individual owns his own business. We find that this information is not highly intimate or embarrassing for purposes of the common law right to privacy. We have reviewed the submitted records and indicated the information that must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common law privacy.

Section 552.130 excepts from disclosure information that relates to "a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state[.]" Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1). The Texas driver's license numbers that you have marked must be withheld under section 552.130.

You also raise section 552.137 of the Government Code for a portion of the remaining submitted information. This section excepts from disclosure "an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body" unless the member of the public consents to its release or the

e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). *See* Gov't Code § 552.137(a)-(c). Section 552.137 does not apply to a government employee's work e-mail address because such an address is not that of the employee as a "member of the public," but is instead the address of the individual as a government employee. The marked e-mail addresses in the remaining submitted information do not appear to be of a type specifically excluded by section 552.137(c). Thus, the board must withhold the marked e-mail addresses under section 552.137 unless their owners have affirmatively consented to their release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.137(b).

In summary, pursuant to FERPA, the board may only release the submitted transcripts upon the consent of the chiropractor to whom they pertain. The chiropractors' social security numbers must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 58.001 of the Occupations Code. The social security number of the individual who is not licensed by the board may be confidential under federal law. The board must withhold the marked information pursuant to section 552.101 in conjunction with common law privacy. The marked Texas driver's license numbers must be withheld under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The board must withhold the marked e-mail addresses under section 552.137 unless their owners have affirmatively consented to their release. The remaining submitted information must be released to the requestor.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the

² As our ruling is dispositive, we do not address your remaining arguments.

Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Tex. Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Debbie K. Lee
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

DKL/seg

Ref: ID# 219596

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Mike Cox
Mercury Insurance Group
P.O. Box 203010
Austin, Texas 78720
(w/o enclosures)