



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

March 17, 2005

Ms. Sandra Smith
Executive Director
Texas Board of Chiropractic Examiners
333 Guadalupe, Suite 3-825
Austin, Texas 78701-3942

OR2005-02290

Dear Ms. Smith:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 220220.

The Texas Board of Chiropractic Examiners (the "board") received a request for all files related to a named chiropractor. You state that you are releasing some responsive information to the requestor. You claim, however, that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552, 130, and 552.137 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 excepts from required public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information made confidential by statute. Section 58.001 of the Occupations Code provides as follows:

The social security number of an applicant for or holder of a license, certificate of registration, or other legal authorization issued by a licensing agency to practice in a specific occupation or profession that is provided to the licensing agency is confidential and not subject to disclosure under Chapter 552, Government Code.

Occ. Code § 58.001. Pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code and section 58.001 of the Occupations Code, the board must withhold the social security numbers it has marked.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the common law right to privacy, which protects information if it is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, such that its release would be highly objectionable to a person of ordinary sensibilities, and (2) of no legitimate public interest. *See Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Common law privacy protects certain types of personal financial information. This office has determined that financial information that relates only to an individual ordinarily satisfies the first element of the common law privacy test, but the public has a legitimate interest in the essential facts about a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body. *See Open Records Decision Nos. 600 at 9-12 (1992) (identifying public and private portions of state employees' personnel records), 545 at 4 (1990) ("In general, we have found the kinds of financial information not excepted from public disclosure by common law privacy to be those regarding the receipt of governmental funds or debts owed to governmental entities"), 523 at 4 (1989) (noting distinction under common law privacy between confidential background financial information furnished to public body about individual and basic facts regarding particular financial transaction between individual and public body), 373 at 4 (1983) (determination of whether public's interest in obtaining personal financial information is sufficient to justify its disclosure must be made on case-by-case basis).* Further, although this office generally concludes that ownership percentages reflect personal financial information, we do not extend that principle to this situation. Where an individual holds a one hundred percent interest in a business, the information simply reflects that the individual owns his own business. We find this information is not highly intimate or embarrassing for purposes of the common law right to privacy, and is thus not confidential under common law privacy. Consequently, we conclude that the board may not withhold the submitted ownership percentages under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the common law right to privacy,

You note that the submitted records include information relating to Texas-issued motor vehicle records. Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information [that] relates to . . . a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state [or] a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state." Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1), (2). Pursuant to section 552.130, the board must withhold the Texas driver's license numbers it has marked.

Finally, you note that the submitted information includes e-mail addresses. Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body" unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). *See Gov't Code § 552.137(a)-(c).* Section 552.137 does not apply to a government employee's work e-mail address because such an

address is not that of the employee as a "member of the public" but is instead the address of the individual as a government employee. We have marked the e-mail address of a government employee that the board must release. The remaining e-mail address, which we have marked, does not appear to be of a type specifically excluded by section 552.137(c). Therefore, in accordance with section 552.137, the board must withhold the marked e-mail address unless the board receives consent to release it.

In summary, the marked social security numbers of individuals licensed by the board must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.001 of the Occupations Code. The marked Texas driver's license numbers must be withheld under section 552.130 of the Government Code. In accordance with section 552.137 of the Government Code, the board must withhold the marked e-mail address unless the board receives consent to release it. The remaining submitted information must be released to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental

body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Tex. Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Caroline E. Cho
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CEC/sdk

Ref: ID# 220220

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Carla Burwell
The Record Service
P.O. Box 177206
Irving, Texas 75017-7206
(w/o enclosures)