



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

July 14, 2005

Ms. Elizabeth Lutton  
Senior Attorney  
City of Arlington  
Box 90231  
Arlington, Texas 76004-3231

OR2005-06246

Dear Ms. Lutton:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 228053.

The City of Arlington (the "city") received a request for information regarding city employees and retirees who are members of the Texas Municipal Retirement System (the "retirement system"). You state that the city does not have information responsive to the portion of the request regarding the highest and lowest annuities paid to city employees or retirees by the retirement system.<sup>1</sup> You claim that the submitted listing of city employees and retirees who are retirement system members, with members' years of service creditable towards retirement, is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.117 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.<sup>2</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> The Act does not require a governmental body to disclose information that did not exist at the time the request was received, nor does it require a governmental body to prepare new information in response to a request. *Economic Opportunities Dev. Corp. v. Bustamante*, 562 S.W.2d 266 (Tex. Civ. App.—San Antonio 1978, writ dismissed); Attorney General Opinion H-90 (1973); Open Records Decision Nos. 452 at 2-3 (1986), 342 at 3 (1982), 87 (1975); see also Open Records Decision Nos. 572 at 1 (1990), 555 at 1-2 (1990), 416 at 5 (1984).

<sup>2</sup> We assume that the sample of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. See Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

Section 552.101 excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. You assert that the listing at issue is confidential under section 855.115 of the Government Code. Section 855.115 provides in relevant part:

(a) Information contained in records that are in the custody of the retirement system concerning an individual member, retiree, annuitant, or beneficiary is confidential under Section 552.101 [of the Government Code], and may not be disclosed in a form identifiable with a specific individual unless:

(1) the information is disclosed to:

(A) the individual or the individual’s attorney, guardian, executor, administrator, conservator, or other person who the [executive director of the retirement system (the “director”)] determines is acting in the interest of the individual or the individual’s estate;

(B) a spouse or former spouse of the individual after the director determines that the information is relevant to the spouse’s or former spouse’s interest in member accounts, benefits, or other amounts payable by the retirement system;

(C) a governmental official or employee after the director determines that disclosure of the information requested is reasonably necessary to the performance of the duties of the official or employee; or

(D) a person authorized by the individual in writing to receive the information; or

(2) the information is disclosed pursuant to a subpoena and the director determines that the individual will have a reasonable opportunity to contest the subpoena.

(b) This section does not prevent the disclosure of the status or identity of an individual as a member, former member, retiree, deceased member or retiree, or beneficiary of the retirement system.

(c) The director may designate other employees of the retirement system to make the necessary determinations under Subsection (a).

Gov't Code § 855.115(a)-(c). You state the city requested and obtained the listing at issue from the retirement system upon request from a city official. You explain, and provide documentation showing, that the retirement system provided this information to the city pursuant to section 855.115(a)(1)(C). The requestor is not a person to whom disclosure may be permitted under this provision and you do not indicate the city has otherwise been authorized to release the listing. *See id.* § 855.115(a). Therefore, the requested listing is confidential under section 855.115 and it must be withheld pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code.<sup>3</sup>

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Tex. Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

---

<sup>3</sup> As our ruling on this issue is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure.

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Ramsey A. Abarca  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

RAA/jev

Ref: ID# 228053

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Yamil Berard  
Fort Worth Star-Telegram  
P.O. Box 1870  
Fort Worth, Texas 76101  
(w/o enclosures)