



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

July 20, 2005

Mr. John T. Patterson
Assistant City Attorney
City of Waco
P. O. Box 2570
Waco, Texas 76702-2570

OR2005-06466

Dear Mr. Patterson:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 228689.

The City of Waco (the "city") received a request for any information about a certain individual. You state that some information will be released, but claim that portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision," and encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. Common-law privacy protects information that is highly intimate or embarrassing, such that its release would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and that is of no legitimate concern to the public. *Industrial Found. v. Texas Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668 (Tex. 1976).

Where an individual's criminal history information has been compiled by a governmental entity, the information takes on a character that implicates the individual's right to privacy in a manner that the same information in an uncompiled state does not. *See United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 780 (1989) ("[A] third party's request for law enforcement records or information about a private citizen

can reasonably be expected to invade that citizen's privacy.")¹ Here, because the requestor asks for all information concerning a certain person, the request implicates that person's right to privacy. Thus, to the extent the city maintains law enforcement records depicting the individual at issue as a possible suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, we determine that the city must withhold such information pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. *See id.* However, as you note, the definition of criminal history record information does not include driving record information. *See Gov't Code § 411.082(2)*. Thus, the submitted arrest report for traffic violations may not be withheld as criminal history record information.

However, the arrest report contains Texas motor vehicle record information which is subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code. Section 552.130 excepts from disclosure information that "relates to . . . a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state [or] a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state." Gov't Code § 552.130. In accordance with section 552.130 of the Government Code, the city must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information that you have marked in the submitted documents.

The arrest report also contains a social security number. Section 552.147 of the Government Code² provides that "[t]he social security number of a living person is excepted from" required public disclosure under the Act. Therefore, the city must withhold the social security number you have marked in the submitted document under section 552.147.³

Finally, the arrest record also contains a fingerprint, which is subject to sections 560.001, 560.002, and 560.003 of the Government Code. Sections 560.001, 560.002, and 560.003 provide as follows:

Sec. 560.001. DEFINITIONS. In this chapter:

¹Please note that the privacy interest in criminal history record information has long been recognized by Texas courts and in open records decisions issued by this office. *See, e.g., Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177, 188 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (release of individual's criminal history record compiled by city police department implicates privacy interests of individual) (construing statutory predecessor to section 552.101); Open Records Decision Nos. 616 (1993), 565 (1990), 354 (1982), 252 (1980), 216 (1978), 183 (1978), 144 (1977), 127 (1977).

²Added by Act of May 23, 2005, 79th Leg., R.S., S.B. 1485, § 1, sec. 552.147(a) (to be codified at Tex. Gov't Code § 552.147).

³We note that section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act.

(1) "Biometric identifier" means a retina or iris scan, fingerprint, voiceprint, or record of hand or face geometry.

(2) "Governmental body" has the meaning assigned by Section 552.003 [of the Government Code], except that the term includes each entity within or created by the judicial branch of state government.

Sec. 560.002. DISCLOSURE OF BIOMETRIC IDENTIFIER. A governmental body that possesses a biometric identifier of an individual:

(1) may not sell, lease, or otherwise disclose the biometric identifier to another person unless:

(A) the individual consents to the disclosure;

(B) the disclosure is required or permitted by a federal statute or by a state statute other than Chapter 552 [of the Government Code]; or

(C) the disclosure is made by or to a law enforcement agency for a law enforcement purpose; and

(2) shall store, transmit, and protect from disclosure the biometric identifier using reasonable care and in a manner that is the same as or more protective than the manner in which the governmental body stores, transmits, and protects its other confidential information.

Sec. 560.003. APPLICATION OF CHAPTER 552. A biometric identifier in the possession of a governmental body is exempt from disclosure under Chapter 552.

Gov't Code §§ 560.001-.003. Upon review, we find section 560.002 does not permit the disclosure of the submitted fingerprint information in this instance. Therefore, the city must withhold the fingerprint you have marked pursuant to section 552.101 in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code.

In summary, to the extent that the city maintains records in which the named individual is portrayed as a suspect, arrestee or criminal defendant, any such information is private under *Reporter's Committee* and must be withheld in conjunction with section 552.101. The city must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information that you have marked under section 552.130. The social security number you have marked must be withheld under section 552.147. The fingerprint you have marked must be withheld pursuant to

section 552.101 in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code. The remainder of the arrest record must be released. As our ruling on this issue is dispositive, we need not consider your remaining argument.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code

§ 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'J. Vela III', with a stylized flourish at the end.

José Vela III
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JV/krl

Ref: ID# 228689

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Heidi Wynn
3765 NW Oak Ave.
Redmond, Oregon 97756
(w/o enclosures)