



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

August 1, 2005

Mr. J. David Dodd, III  
Nichols, Jackson, Dillard, Hager & Smith, L.L.P.  
1800 Lincoln Plaza  
500 North Akard  
Dallas, Texas 75201

OR2005-06890

Dear Mr. Dodd:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 229233.

The Allen Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for police reports related to a specific address. You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.103 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we must address the department's obligations under the Act. Pursuant to section 552.301(b), a governmental body that receives a request for information that it wishes to withhold must ask for the attorney general's decision and state the exceptions that apply within ten business days after receiving the request. *See Gov't Code* § 552.301(a), (b). The copy of the written request for information that the department received bears a stamp indicating it was received on May 11, 2005. We received your request for a decision on May 24, 2005. The envelope containing your request for a decision did not bear a post office cancellation mark or other evidence that it was deposited in the mail on or before the prescribed deadline. *See Gov't Code* § 552.308 (describing rules for calculating submission dates of documents sent via first class United States mail, common or contract carrier, or interagency mail). Consequently, you failed to comply with section 552.301.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released. Information that is presumed public must be released unless a governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information to overcome this presumption. *See Gov't Code* § 552.302; *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of

openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). Generally, a governmental body may demonstrate a compelling reason to withhold information by a showing that the information is made confidential by another source of law or affects third party interests. *See* Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). Although the department claims that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure pursuant to section 552.103 of the Government Code, we note that this exception to disclosure is a discretionary exception under the Act that does not constitute a compelling interest that is sufficient to overcome the presumption that the submitted information is now public.<sup>1</sup> Further, we note that, although the department claims that the submitted information is also excepted from disclosure pursuant to section 552.108 of the Government Code, the department in this instance has not demonstrated a compelling interest under this exception that would allow any portion of the submitted information to be withheld from disclosure. *See* Open Records Decision No. 177 (1977) (governmental body may waive statutory predecessor to section 552.108); *But see* Open Records Decision No. 586 (1991) (need of another governmental body to withhold requested information may provide compelling reason for nondisclosure under section 552.108 in certain circumstances). Accordingly, we conclude that the department may not withhold the submitted information under either section 552.103 or section 552.108 of the Government Code. As you have raised no other exceptions to disclosure for the submitted information, and this information is not otherwise confidential by law, you must release it to the requestor.<sup>2</sup>

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney

---

<sup>1</sup>Discretionary exceptions are intended to protect only the interests of the governmental body, as distinct from exceptions which are intended to protect information deemed confidential by law or the interests of third parties. *See, e.g.,* Open Records Decision Nos. 551 (1990) (statutory predecessor to section 552.103 serves only to protect governmental body's position in litigation and does not itself make information confidential), 522 at 4 (1989) (discretionary exceptions in general); *see also Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S.W.3d 469, 475-76 (Tex. App.—Dallas 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive section 552.103).

<sup>2</sup>Because the records being released contain information relating to the requestor that would be excepted from disclosure to the general public to protect his privacy, the department must request another ruling from our office if it receives a future request for this information from an individual other than this requestor or his authorized representative.

general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Tex. Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Texas Building and Procurement Commission at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



L. Joseph James  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

LJJ/krl

Ref: ID# 229233

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Kevin McGrath  
607 English Oak  
Allen, Texas 75002  
(w/o enclosures)