



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

December 13, 2005

Ms. Elizabeth W. Wallace  
City Attorney  
City of Sonora  
201 N.E. Main  
Sonora, Texas 76950-3798

OR2005-11190

Dear Ms. Wallace:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 237885.

The Sonora Police Department (the "department") received a request for all information regarding a named individual.<sup>1</sup> You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we must address the department's obligations under section 552.301 of the Government Code. Section 552.301(e) requires the governmental body to submit to the attorney general, not later than the fifteenth business day after the date of its receipt of the request, (1) written comments stating why the governmental body's claimed exceptions apply to the information that it seeks to withhold; (2) a copy of the written request for information; (3) a signed statement of the date on which the governmental body received the request, or evidence sufficient to establish that date; and (4) the specific information that the governmental body seeks to withhold or representative samples of the information if it is

---

<sup>1</sup>As you have not submitted the request for information, we take our description from your brief.

voluminous. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(e)(1)(A)-(D). You have not provided this office with a copy of the written request for information. We therefore find that the department failed to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless the governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.302; *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). Because section 552.101 can provide a compelling reason to overcome the presumption of openness, we will address your arguments under that exception.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Section 552.101 encompasses common law privacy. Where an individual's criminal history information has been compiled by a governmental entity, the information takes on a character that implicates the individual's right to privacy. *See United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749 (1989). In this instance, the requestor asks for all information available on a named individual. In this case, we believe that this individual's right to privacy has been implicated. Thus, the department must withhold any criminal records where the named individual is listed as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, to the extent they exist, under common law privacy as encompassed by section 552.101 of the Government Code. *See id.*

We note that you have submitted records that do not list the named individual as a suspect, defendant, or arrestee. These documents may not be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with *Reporters Committee*, but they do contain information that is confidential by law. Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure information that relates to the following:

- (1) a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state; [or]
- (2) a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state.

Gov't Code § 552.130(a). We have marked the Texas motor vehicle record information that must be withheld under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold any criminal records where the named individual is listed as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, to the extent they exist, under common

law privacy as encompassed by section 552.101 of the Government Code. The department must also withhold the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for

contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'JAP', written over a horizontal line.

James A. Person III  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

JAP/sdk

Ref: ID# 237885

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Teresa James  
c/o Elizabeth W. Wallace  
City of Sonora  
201 N.E. Main  
Sonora, Texas 76950-3798  
(w/o enclosures)