



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

December 22, 2005

Ms. Debra G. Rosenberg
Atlas & Hall, L.L.P.
P. O. Box 3725
McAllen, TX 78502

OR2005-11532

Dear Ms. Rosenberg:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 238668.

The McAllen Independent School District (the "district"), which you represent, received two requests for information regarding health insurance coverage for the district. The district takes no position on whether the submitted cost review analysis documents are excepted from disclosure, but you state that release of this information may implicate the proprietary interests of Benefit Planners, Ltd. ("Benefit"), Blue Cross and Blue Shield of Texas ("Blue Cross"), Boon-Chapman Benefit Administrators, Inc. ("Boon-Chapman"), American Administrative Group, Inc. ("American"), Group & Pension Administrators, Inc. ("G&P"), Health Administration Services ("HAS"), Mutual of Omaha ("Mutual"), and the Texas Association of School Boards ("TASB"). Accordingly, you inform us, and provide documentation showing, that you notified these companies of the request and of their right to submit arguments to this office as to why their information should not be released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d) (permitting interested third party to submit to attorney general reasons why requested information should not be released); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (determining that statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception to disclosure in certain circumstances). We have reviewed the submitted information.

We note that section 552.305 of the Government Code allows an interested third party ten business days from the date of its receipt of the governmental body's notice to submit its

reasons, if any, as to why information relating to that party should not be released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d)(2)(B). However, as of the date of this letter, we have not received arguments from Benefit, Blue Cross, Boon-Chapman, American, G&P, HAS, Mutual, or the TASB for withholding the submitted information. Therefore, we have no basis to conclude that the release of any of the submitted information would harm the proprietary interests of these third parties. *See id.* § 551.110(b); Open Records Decision Nos. 661 at 5-6 (1999) (stating that business enterprise that claims exception for commercial or financial information under section 552.110(b) must show by specific factual evidence that release of requested information would cause that party substantial competitive harm), 552 at 5 (1990) (party must establish *prima facie* case that information is trade secret). Accordingly, we conclude that the district may not withhold any portion of the submitted information on the basis of any proprietary interest that Benefit, Blue Cross, Boon-Chapman, American, G&P, HAS, Mutual, and the TASB may have in the information.

Because the district does not oppose disclosure and because Benefit, Blue Cross, Boon-Chapman, American, G&P, HAS, Mutual, and the TASB have failed to submit arguments that an exception to disclosure applies, we have no basis for finding that the submitted information may be withheld. Therefore, the submitted information must be released to the requestor in its entirety.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



James A. Person III
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JAP/krl

Ref: ID# 238668

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Jesse Trevino
Jesse Trevino Insurance Agency
803 N. Main Street
McAllen, TX 78501
(w/o enclosures)

Roberto Ramirez, Jr.
Puro Asguero Inc.
514 South I Road, Suite A
Pharr, TX 78577
(w/o enclosures)