



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

December 27, 2006

Mr. Ken Johnson
Assistant City Attorney
City of Waco Legal Services
P.O. Box 2570
Waco, Texas 76702-2570

OR2006-15121

Dear Mr. Johnson:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 271272.

The Waco Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a fatal traffic accident. You state that the department will release some of the requested information but claim that portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.108 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime [if] release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime." Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.108(a)(1), (b)(1), 552.301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state that the submitted information relates to a pending criminal investigation and that release of the information you have marked in Exhibit 4 would interfere with that investigation. Based on this representation, we agree that section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the information you have marked in Exhibit 4. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e.*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases).

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. See Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Thus, with the exception of basic information, you may withhold the marked portions of Exhibit 4 under section 552.108(a)(1).

We next address your arguments for the remaining information, submitted as Exhibit 3. Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information that “relates to . . . a motor vehicle operator’s or driver’s license or permit issued by an agency of this state[,] a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state[, or] a personal identification document[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.130. We note that this provision only applies to motor vehicle information issued by the State of Texas, and not other states. We also note that the purpose of section 552.130 is to protect the privacy interests of individuals. Since the right of privacy lapses at death, Texas motor vehicle record information that pertains to a deceased individual may not be withheld under section 552.130. See *Moore v. Charles B. Pierce Film Enterprises, Inc.*, 589 S.W.2d 489, 491 (Tex. Civ. App.—Texarkana 1979, writ ref’d n.r.e.) (Texas does not recognize relational or derivative right of privacy); see also Attorney General Opinions JM-229 (1984); H-917 (1976); Open Records Decision No. 272 at 1 (1981). The remaining information contains Texas motor vehicle record information pertaining to the deceased individuals’ vehicles. If living individuals have ownership interests in the deceaseds’ vehicles, then the department must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information under section 552.130 of the Government Code. If no living individuals have an ownership interest in the vehicles, then the information at issue is not excepted from disclosure under section 552.130 of the Government Code and may not be withheld on this basis. Accordingly, to the extent the Texas motor vehicle record information, which we have marked, pertains to vehicles in which living individuals have an ownership interest, it must be withheld under section 552.130.

In summary, other than basic information, the department may withhold the information you have marked in Exhibit 4 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. To the extent the Texas motor vehicle record information, which we have marked, pertains to vehicles in which living individuals have an ownership interest, it must be withheld under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov’t Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full

benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



L. Joseph James
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

LJJ/dh

Ref: ID# 271272

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. James Moore
President
Motor Vehicle Accident Reconstruction Service
221 Cedar Tree Lane
Heath, Texas 75032-5884
(w/o enclosures)