



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

January 3, 2006

Ms. Pamela Smith
Senior Assistant General Counsel
Texas Department of Public Safety
P.O. Box 4087
Austin, Texas 78773-0001

OR2006-00039

Dear Ms. Smith:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under chapter 552 of the Government Code, the Public Information Act (the "Act"). Your request was assigned ID# 239389.

The Texas Department of Public Safety (the "department") received two requests for information relating to a custodial death investigation. The department states that it is releasing basic information to the requestors. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

First, we note that the submitted information includes an executed search warrant and supporting affidavit. Section 552.022 of the Government Code provides in part:

(a) Without limiting the amount or kind of information that is public information under this chapter, the following categories of information are public information and not excepted from required disclosure under this chapter unless they are expressly confidential under other law:

...

(17) information that is also contained in the public court record[.]

Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(17). Section 552.022(a)(17) makes the executed search warrant, which has been filed with a court, expressly public. Therefore, the department may withhold this information only to the extent it is made confidential under other law. Although the department raises section 552.108 for this information, this exception is discretionary and thus, does not make information confidential. *See* Open Records Decision No. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally). Therefore, the search warrant may not be withheld under section 552.108 of the Government Code. As the department raises no further exceptions to the disclosure of this information, it must be released.

The release of a search warrant affidavit is governed by article 18.01 of the Code of Criminal Procedure, which provides in part:

(b) No search warrant shall issue for any purpose in this state unless sufficient facts are first presented to satisfy the issuing magistrate that probable cause does in fact exist for its issuance. A sworn affidavit setting forth substantial facts establishing probable cause shall be filed in every instance in which a search warrant is requested. The affidavit is public information if executed, and the magistrate's clerk shall make a copy of the affidavit available for public inspection in the clerk's office during normal business hours.

Crim. Proc. Code art. 18.01(b). This provision makes the search warrant affidavit at issue expressly public. The exceptions found in the Act do not, as a general rule, apply to information that is made public by other statutes. *See* Open Records Decision No. 525 (1989) (statutory predecessor). Therefore, pursuant to article 18.01(b), the department must release the search warrant affidavit.

Next, we note that the department seeks to withhold an arrest warrant affidavit. Article 15.26 of the Code of Criminal Procedure states "[t]he arrest warrant, and any affidavit presented to the magistrate in support of the issuance of the warrant, is public information." Crim. Proc. Code art. 15.26. If the affidavit was presented to the magistrate in support of the issuance of the warrant, the department must release it pursuant to article 15.26. If not, we will address it below along with the remaining information.

We next address the submitted fingerprint information. Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. The submitted information includes fingerprint information that is subject to sections 560.001, 560.002, and 560.003 of the Government Code. These sections provide as follows:

Sec. 560.001. DEFINITIONS. In this chapter:

(1) "Biometric identifier" means a retina or iris scan, fingerprint, voiceprint, or record of hand or face geometry.

(2) "Governmental body" has the meaning assigned by Section 552.003 [of the Government Code], except that the term includes each entity within or created by the judicial branch of state government.

Sec. 560.002. DISCLOSURE OF BIOMETRIC IDENTIFIER. A governmental body that possesses a biometric identifier of an individual:

(1) may not sell, lease, or otherwise disclose the biometric identifier to another person unless:

(A) the individual consents to the disclosure;

(B) the disclosure is required or permitted by a federal statute or by a state statute other than Chapter 552 [of the Government Code]; or

(C) the disclosure is made by or to a law enforcement agency for a law enforcement purpose; and

(2) shall store, transmit, and protect from disclosure the biometric identifier using reasonable care and in a manner that is the same as or more protective than the manner in which the governmental body stores, transmits, and protects its other confidential information.

Sec. 560.003. APPLICATION OF CHAPTER 552. A biometric identifier in the possession of a governmental body is exempt from disclosure under Chapter 552.

Gov't Code §§ 560.001-.003. The submitted fingerprint information would normally be confidential under section 560.003. However, the laws making such information confidential are intended to protect an individual's privacy. *See* Gov't Code § 560.002(1)(A) (individual whose biometric identifier is at issue may consent to its release). However, in this instance, the requestors, as representatives of the individual whose fingerprints are at issue, have a special right of access to her fingerprint information. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning herself). Consequently, the department must release the fingerprint information to the requestors.

Section 552.108(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime.” Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See* Gov’t Code §§ 552.108(a)(1), (b)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state that the requested information relates to a pending criminal investigation. Based upon this representation, we conclude that the release of this information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases). Thus, with the exception of basic information, which you state has already been released, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108 of the Government Code.¹

In summary, the submitted probable cause affidavit for an arrest warrant must be released under article 15.26 of the Code of Criminal Procedure if it was presented to the magistrate in support of the issuance of an arrest warrant. The submitted executed search warrant and search warrant affidavit must be released under section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code and article 18.01(b) of the Code of Criminal Procedure, respectively. The fingerprint information must be released to the requestors as representatives of the decedent.² With the exception of basic information which the department states has already been released, the remaining information may be withheld under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov’t Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full

¹Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). *See also* Gov’t Code § 552.108(c).

²We note that because the requestors have a special right of access to this information, the department must again seek a decision from this office if it receives another request for the same information from another requestor.

benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Amanda Crawford
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

AEC/segh

Ref: ID# 239389

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Clark Dickenscheidt
CDI Investigations
10696 Haddington, Suite 130
Houston, Texas 77043
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Brent M. Langdon
Holman & Langdon, L.L.P.
P.O. Box 5367
Texarkana, Texas 75505-5367
(w/o enclosures)