



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

January 5, 2006

Mr. John C. West  
General Counsel  
Texas Department of Criminal Justice  
Office of the Inspector General  
P.O. Box 13084  
Austin, Texas 78711

Mr. James M. Frazier III  
Assistant General Counsel  
Texas Department of Criminal Justice  
P.O. Box 4004  
Huntsville, Texas 77342

OR2006-00155

Dear Mr. West and Mr. Frazier:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 239809.

The Texas Department of Criminal Justice (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to an inmate who died while in custody at a department facility. The department and the Office of the Inspector General (the "OIG") have submitted separate briefs, as well as separate documents that each seeks to withhold from disclosure. The OIG states that it will release a portion of the requested information, but claims that the information it has submitted is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.117, 552.1175, and 552.134 of the Government Code. The department claims that the information it has submitted is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.107, and 552.134 of the Government Code. We have considered the submitted arguments and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note that the information submitted by the OIG includes a custodial death report. In 2003, the Office of the Attorney General (the "OAG") revised the format of a custodial death report. Previously, the report consisted of five sections. In Open Records Decision No. 521 at 5 (1989), we concluded that under article 49.18(b) of the Code of Criminal Procedure in conjunction with a directive issued by the OAG, section one of a custodial death report filed with this office was public information and must be released, but sections two through five of the report, as well as attachments to the report, were confidential. *See* Crim. Proc. Code art. 49.18(b) (attorney general shall make report, with exception of any portion of report that attorney general determines is privileged, available to any interested person). A custodial death report now consists of two pages and an attached summary of how the death occurred. The OAG has determined that the two-page report and summary must be released to the public; however, any other documents submitted with the revised report are confidential under article 49.18 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. *See also* Open Records Decision No. 623 at 3 (1994) (exceptions to public disclosure under Act generally not applicable to information that another statute expressly makes public). Therefore, the OIG must release the submitted custodial death report and the summary of how the death occurred under article 49.18 of the Code of Criminal Procedure.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code exempts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. The OIG claims that some of the submitted information consists of medical records, access to which is governed by the Medical Practices Act ("MPA"). Occ. Code §§ 151.001-165.160. The MPA governs the disclosure of medical records. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides in part:

- (a) A communication between a physician and a patient, relative to or in connection with any professional services as a physician to the patient, is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.
- (b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.
- (c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

*Id.* § 159.002(a)-(c). This office has determined that in governing access to a specific subset of information, the MPA prevails over the more general provisions of chapter 552 of the

Government Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). Medical records must be released upon the patient's signed, written consent, provided that the consent specifies (1) the information to be covered by the release, (2) reasons or purposes for the release, and (3) the person to whom the information is to be released. *See* Occ. Code §§ 159.004, .005. When a patient is deceased, medical records may be released only on the signed consent of the deceased's personal representative. *See id.* §§ 159.005(a)(5). The consent in that instance must specify (1) the information to be covered by the release, (2) reasons or purposes for the release, and (3) the person to whom the information is to be released. *See id.* §§ 159.004, .005. Any subsequent release of medical records must be consistent with the purposes for which the governmental body obtained the records. *See id.* § 159.002(c); Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). We have marked the medical records that are subject to the MPA. The OIG may only disclose these records in accordance with the access provisions of the MPA.<sup>1</sup> Absent the applicability of an MPA access provision, the OIG must withhold these records pursuant to the MPA. *See* Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991).

Next, we note that the information submitted by the OIG also contains records that are subject to chapter 611 of the Health and Safety Code, which provides for the confidentiality of records created or maintained by a mental health professional. Section 611.002(a) reads as follows:

Communications between a patient and a professional, and records of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient that are created or maintained by a professional, are confidential.

Health & Safety Code § 611.002. Section 611.001 defines a "professional" as (1) a person authorized to practice medicine, (2) a person licensed or certified by the state to diagnose, evaluate or treat mental or emotional conditions or disorders, or (3) a person the patient reasonably believes is authorized, licensed, or certified. *Id.* § 611.001(b). Sections 611.004 and 611.0045 provide for access to mental health records only by certain individuals. *See* Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). We have marked the information that constitutes mental health records, and that may only be released in accordance with sections 611.004 and 611.0045 of the Health and Safety Code. *See* Health & Safety Code § 611.004(a)(5) (professional may disclose confidential information to patient's personal representative if patient is deceased).

We turn now to the department's and OIG's claims regarding section 552.134 of the Government Code for the remaining information submitted by the department and the OIG.

---

<sup>1</sup>We note that the submitted information includes nurse' and clinic notes regarding evaluation and treatment of the inmate in question. To the extent such nurses' and clinic notes were created by department personnel acting under the supervision of a physician, they constitute medical records within the scope of the MPA. However, if these notes were not created under the supervision of a physician, they are not subject to the MPA.

Section 552.134(a) relates to inmates of the department and provides in relevant part the following:

(a) Except as provided by Subsection (b) or by Section 552.029 [of the Government Code], information obtained or maintained by the Texas Department of Criminal Justice is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information about an inmate who is confined in a facility operated by or under a contract with the department.

Gov't Code § 552.134(a). Section 552.134 is explicitly made subject to section 552.029, which provides in relevant part the following:

Notwithstanding . . . Section 552.134, the following information about an inmate who is confined in a facility operated by or under a contract with the Texas Department of Criminal Justice is subject to required disclosure under Section 552.021:

...

(8) basic information regarding the death of an inmate in custody, an incident involving the use of force, or an alleged crime involving the inmate.

Gov't Code § 552.029(8). On review, we agree that the records submitted by the OIG constitute information about an inmate for purposes of section 552.134. However, the records concern the death of the inmate in custody. Thus, the OIG must release basic information concerning the custodial death. *Id.* Basic information includes the time and place of the incident, names of inmates and department officials directly involved, a brief narrative of the incident, a brief description of any injuries sustained, and information regarding criminal charges or disciplinary actions filed as a result of the incident. The OIG must withhold the submitted information pursuant to section 552.134.<sup>2</sup>

The remainder of the information submitted by the department constitutes information about an inmate for purposes of section 552.134. However, the records concern an incident involving the use of force. Thus, the department must release basic information concerning

---

<sup>2</sup> Because we reach this conclusion, we need not address the OIG's arguments regarding section 552.108 of the Government Code, except to note that the information that is subject to section 552.029(8) corresponds to the basic front-page information that is made public under section 552.108(c). See Gov't Code § 552.108(c); *Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177, 186-188 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e.*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (per curiam); Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public in *Houston Chronicle*).

the use of force. Gov't Code § 552.029(8). Basic information includes the time and place of the incident, names of inmates and department officials directly involved, a brief narrative of the incident, a brief description of any injuries sustained, and information regarding criminal charges or disciplinary actions filed as a result of the incident.

In summary, the OIG must release the submitted custodial death report and the summary of how the death occurred under article 49.18 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. The OIG may only release the marked medical records and mental health records in accordance with the MPA and sections 611.004 and 611.0045 of the Health and Safety Code, respectively. The OIG and the department may withhold, with the exception of basic information, the remaining submitted information pursuant to section 552.134 of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Lisa V. Cubriel  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

LVC/segh

Ref: ID# 239809

Enc: Submitted documents

c: Mr. Kenneth Hensley  
5004 Hunnington Drive  
Conroe, Texas 77303  
(w/o enclosures)