



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

March 24, 2006

Ms. Rebecca Brewer
Abernathy, Roeder, Boyd & Joplin, P.C.
P.O. Box 1210
McKinney, Texas 75070

OR2006-02887

Dear Ms. Brewer:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 245522.

The Wylie Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request from a United States Navy Recruiter for information pertaining to a named individual. You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses confidentiality provisions such as section 58.007 of the Family Code. Juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997 are confidential under section 58.007. For purposes of section 58.007, "child" means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age. *See* Fam. Code § 51.02(2). The relevant language of section 58.007(c) reads as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
- (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapter B.

Id. § 58.007(c). The submitted incident reports that we have marked involve juvenile delinquent conduct that occurred after September 1, 1997. It does not appear that any of the exceptions in section 58.007 apply; therefore, these reports are confidential pursuant to section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. However, report number 05010151 does not involve a juvenile as a suspect or offender and is not subject to section 58.007.

However, the requestor is a recruiter for the United States Navy (the "Navy") and states that he is conducting a background investigation of an individual seeking to enlist in the Navy. The United States Department of Defense (the "DoD") is authorized to perform background investigations of persons seeking to enlist to determine the eligibility of applicants for acceptance into the armed services. 5 U.S.C. § 9101(b)(1)(C); *see also id.* § 9101(a)(6)(A) (DoD is a covered agency for purposes of section 9101). The Navy has a right to the criminal history record information ("CHRI") of state and local criminal justice agencies when its investigation is conducted with the consent of the individual being investigated. *See id.* § 9101(b)(1), (c); *see also* 10 U.S.C. § 111(b)(6), (7) (DoD includes the Department of the Navy). CHRI is defined as "information collected by criminal justice agencies on individuals consisting of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, indictments, informations, or other formal criminal charges, and any disposition arising therefrom, sentencing, correction supervision and release" but does not include "identification information such as fingerprint records to the extent that such information does not indicate involvement in the criminal justice system" or "records of a State or locality sealed pursuant to law from access by State and local criminal justice agencies of that State or locality." 5 U.S.C. § 9101(a)(2).

The requestor has submitted written consent from the individual under investigation for the release of the information at issue. Furthermore, federal law provides that the Navy's right of access to CHRI preempts state confidentiality provisions. *Id.* § 9101 (b)(4) (section 9101 "shall apply notwithstanding any other provision of law . . . of any State"). Thus, we conclude that the requestor has a right of access to CHRI held by the department. In addition, we conclude that the Navy's right of access under federal law preempts the state confidentiality provision you claim. *See English v. General Elec. Co.*, 496 U.S. 72, 79 (1990) (noting that state law is preempted to extent it actually conflicts with federal law); *see also La. Pub. Serv. Comm'n v. FCC*, 476 U.S. 355, 369 (1986) (noting that federal agency acting within scope of its congressionally delegated authority may preempt state regulation). Therefore, the department must release the CHRI to the requestor. The department must withhold the remaining information in the marked reports under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007 of the Family Code.

You seek to withhold the remaining report under section 552.101 on the basis of common law privacy.¹ Common law privacy protects information if it is highly intimate or embarrassing, such that its release would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and the public has no legitimate interest in it. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668 (Tex. 1976). Where an individual's criminal history information has been compiled by a governmental entity, the information takes on a character that implicates the individual's right to privacy. *See United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749 (1989). However, information that refers to an individual solely as a victim, witness, or involved person is not private under *Reporters Committee* and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis.

In this instance, the requestor asks the department for all records concerning a named individual. In so doing, the requestor implicates this individual's right to privacy. However, the requestor has submitted written consent from this individual for the release of the information at issue. As noted above, the holding of *Reporters Committee* is rooted in privacy concerns, and a person's criminal history, to the extent that one exists, may not be withheld from him based on section 552.101 and the holding in *Reporters Committee*. *See Gov't Code* § 552.023(b) (governmental body may not deny access to person to whom information relates, or that person's representative, solely on grounds that information is considered confidential by privacy principles). Therefore, the department may not withhold any portion of the remaining report under section 552.101 on the basis of common law privacy.

¹Section 552.101 also encompasses common law privacy. *See Gov't Code* § 552.101.

In summary, with the exception of CHRI, which must be released, the department must withhold the reports we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007 of the Family Code. The remaining information must be released.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be

²We note that the requestor has a right of access to information in the submitted documents that otherwise would be excepted from release under the Act. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023. Thus, the department must again seek a decision from this office if it receives a request for this information from a different requestor.

sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



L. Joseph James
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

LJJ/jh

Ref: ID# 245522

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Petty Officer Kenneth C. Durboraw
Department of the Navy
United States Navy Recruiting Station Plano
301 West Parker Road, Suite 217
Plano, Texas 75023
(w/o enclosures)