



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

April 13, 2006

Mr. John C. West
General Counsel, Office of the Inspector General
Texas Department of Criminal Justice
P. O. Box 13084
Austin, Texas 78711

OR2006-03725

Dear Mr. West:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 246265.

The Texas Department of Criminal Justice (the "department") received a request for the investigative report on the death of an inmate. You state that the department has released basic information from the report and the two page custodial death report, redacting department employees' home addresses, telephone numbers, social security numbers, and personal family information pursuant to section 552.117(a)(3) of the Government Code.¹ The department also states that it is withholding social security numbers under section 552.147 of the Government Code.² You claim that the remainder of the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.103, 552.108 and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

¹Open Records Letter No. 2005-1067 (2005) serves as a previous determination permitting the department to withhold certain information under section 552.117 of the Government Code without the necessity of requesting an opinion from this office.

²We note that section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act.

Initially, we note that some of the submitted information, which we have marked, includes medical records, access to which is governed by the Medical Practice Act (the "MPA"), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code. *See* Occ. Code § 151.001 *et seq.* The MPA governs the disclosure of medical records. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides in part:

(a) A communication between a physician and a patient, relative to or in connection with any professional services as a physician to the patient, is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Id. § 159.002(a)-(c). This office has concluded that the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician.³ *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982). Medical records must be released upon the patient's signed, written consent, provided that the consent specifies (1) the information to be covered by the release, (2) reasons or purposes for the release, and (3) the person to whom the information is to be released. *See* Occ. Code §§ 159.004, .005. When a patient is deceased, medical records may be released only on the signed consent of the deceased's personal representative. *See id.* §§ 159.005(a)(5). The consent in that instance must specify (1) the information to be covered by the release, (2) reasons or purposes for the release, and (3) the person to whom the information is to be released. *See id.* §§ 159.004, .005. Any subsequent release of medical records must be consistent with the purposes for which the governmental body obtained the records. *See id.* § 159.002(c); Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). We have marked the medical records that are subject to the MPA. The department may only disclose these records in accordance with the access provisions of the MPA. Absent the applicability of an MPA access provision, the department must withhold these records pursuant to the MPA. *See* Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991).

³We note that the submitted information includes nurses' and clinic notes regarding evaluation and treatment of the inmate in question. You inform us that a licensed vocational nurse performs his or her duties under the express authority of a practicing physician.

We also note that the submitted information includes emergency medical service ("EMS") records. Access to EMS records is governed by the provisions of the Emergency Medical Services Act, Health and Safety Code sections 773.091-.173. See Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). Section 773.091 of the Emergency Medical Services Act provides in part:

(b) Records of the identity, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by emergency medical services personnel or by a physician providing medical supervision that are created by the emergency medical services personnel or physician or maintained by an emergency medical services provider are confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

...

(g) The privilege of confidentiality under this section does not extend to information regarding the presence, nature of injury or illness, age, sex, occupation, and city of residence of a patient who is receiving emergency medical services. . . .

Health & Safety Code § 773.091(b), (g). Confidential EMS records may be released to "any person who bears a written consent of the patient or other persons authorized to act on the patient's behalf." *Id.* § 773.092(e)(4). When a patient is deceased, his personal representative may consent to the release of his records. *Id.* § 773.093(a); see also Open Records Decision No. 632 (1995) (defining "personal representative" for purposes of EMS Act). This consent must be written and signed by the patient, authorized representative, or personal representative and must specify (1) the information to be covered by the release, (2) reasons or purposes for the release, and (3) the person to whom the information is to be released. Health & Safety Code § 773.093(a). Accordingly, the submitted EMS records are confidential under section 773.091(b) of the Health and Safety Code and must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code except as specified by section 773.091(g). However, the department must release the EMS records upon receipt of proper consent pursuant to section 773.093(a). See *id.* §§ 773.092, .093; Open Records Decision No. 632.

The submitted documents also include dental records that are subject to chapter 258 of the Occupations Code. Section 258.102 of the Occupations Code provides as follows:

(a) The following information is privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this article:

(1) a communication between a dentist and a patient that relates to a professional service provided by the dentist; and

(2) a dental record.

(b) The privilege described by this section applies regardless of when the patient received the professional service from the dentist.

Occ. Code § 258.102. A “dental record” means dental information about a patient that is created or maintained by a dentist and relates to the history or treatment of the patient. *See id.* §258.101(1). Information that is privileged under chapter 258 of the Occupations Code may be disclosed only under certain specified circumstances. *See id.* § 258.104 (consent to disclosure); *see also id.* §§ 258.105, .106, .107 (exceptions to privilege). The written consent for the release of privileged information required under section 258.104 must specify (1) the information covered by the release, (2) the person to whom the information is to be released, and (3) the purpose for the release. *See id.* § 258.104(c). A person who receives information that is privileged under section 258.102 of the Occupations Code may disclose that information to another person only to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the purpose for which the information was obtained. *See id.* § 258.108. We have marked the portions of the submitted information that are subject to section 258.102 of the Occupations Code. The department may only release the information we have marked if it has authorization under chapter 258 of the Occupations Code to do so.

The department claims that the remaining submitted information is excepted from public disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Section 552.108(a)(1) excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977).

The department states that the case file relates to an open and ongoing criminal investigation. Based on this representation and our review of the information at issue, we conclude that section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to this information. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases). Therefore, with the exception of basic information, which you state will be released, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108 of the Government Code.⁴

In summary, the submitted medical and EMS records, which we have marked, may only be released in accordance with the MPA and the Emergency Medical Services Act, respectively.

⁴As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure, except to note that basic information is generally not excepted under section 552.103. *See Open Records Decision No. 597* (1991).

The submitted dental records may only be released in accordance with chapter 258 of the Occupations Code. With the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for

contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Brian J. Rogers". The signature is fluid and cursive, with a prominent initial "B" and "R".

Brian J. Rogers
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

BJR/krl

Ref: ID# 246265

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Erika Gonzalez
601 West 162 Street #1D
New York, New York 10032
(w/o enclosures)