



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

April 19, 2006

Ms. YuShan Chang
Assistant City Attorney
City of Houston
P.O. Box 368
Houston, Texas 77002

OR2006-03930

Dear Ms. Chang:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 246747.

The Houston Police Department (the "department") received a request for 108 specific incident reports. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, 552.136, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.¹

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrines of common law privacy. Common law privacy protects information that is 1) highly intimate or embarrassing, such that its release would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and 2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668 (Tex. 1976). The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683.

¹We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

Upon review, we have marked information in Exhibit 2 that must be withheld by the department under section 552.101 on the basis of common law privacy. The remaining information in Exhibit 2 must be released.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. . . if (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with the detection, investigation or prosecution of crime. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), (a)(2), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state that the incident reports submitted as Exhibits 3, 7, and 8 pertain to active criminal cases. You also state that the incident reports submitted as Exhibits 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, and 22 are inactive criminal investigations for which “the statute of limitations has not run.” You advise that these investigations may be reactivated once additional leads are developed. Based upon your representations, we conclude that the release of Exhibits 3, 7, 8, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, and 22 would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crimes. We therefore agree that section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to these exhibits. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref’d n.r.e.*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (*per curiam*) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases).

Section 552.108(a)(2) excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate that the information at issue relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. You advise that the incident reports submitted as Exhibits 4, 5, 6, and 9 consist of records pertaining to cases that are closed and concluded in results other than conviction or deferred adjudication. We therefore agree that section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to Exhibits 4, 5, 6, and 9.

We note, however, that section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. *Id.* § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 185; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information made public by *Houston Chronicle*). Thus, except for basic information, the department may withhold Exhibits 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, and 22 under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We note that you have the discretion to release all or part of the remaining information that is not otherwise confidential by law. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.007.

In summary, the department must withhold the information we have marked in Exhibit 2 under section 552.101 in conjunction with common law privacy. The remaining information in Exhibit 2 must be released. With the exception of basic information, the department may withhold Exhibits 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, and 22 under section 552.108 of the Government Code.²

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or

²As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments.

complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Lisa V. Cubriel
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

LVC/er

Ref: ID# 246747

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Hope Edmondson
Edmondson & Associates, L.L.P.
2010 North Loop West, Suite 270
Houston, Texas 77018
(w/o enclosures)