ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

August 15, 2006

Mr. Galen Gatten
Assistant City Attorney
City of Midland
P.O. Box 1152
Midland, Texas 79702-1152

OR2006-09260

Dear Mr. Gatten:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 256881.

The Midland Police Department (the "department") received a request for a specified case report. You state that you have released basic information.[1] You claim that the remaining requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.108 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.108 provides in pertinent part as follows:

> (a) Information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 if:
>
> > (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime; [or]

---

[1]*See* Gov't Code § 552.108(c); *Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177, 186-88 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976); Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*).

> (2) it is information that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]
>
> . . .
>
> (b) An internal record or notation of a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that is maintained for internal use in matters relating to law enforcement or prosecution is excepted from [required public disclosure] if:
>
> . . .
>
> (2) the internal record or notation relates to law enforcement only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]

Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1)-(2), (b)(2). Generally speaking, subsection 552.108(a)(1) is mutually exclusive of subsection 552.108(a)(2). Subsection 552.108(a)(1) protects information that pertains to a specific pending criminal investigation or prosecution. In contrast, subsection 552.108(a)(2) protects information that relates to a concluded criminal investigation or prosecution that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. See *id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) or section 552.108(b)(2) must demonstrate that the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.108(a)(2), (b)(2), .301(e)(1)(A).

You state that the investigation of the incident in the submitted information "concluded and the case is closed" and that the investigation "did not result in a conviction or deferred adjudication." However, you also state that the "[i]nvestigation of the crime which forms the basis for the information contained in [the submitted information] is still pending." Based on your arguments, it is unclear whether the case is closed or open. Thus, we determine that you have failed to adequately demonstrate either that the case is pending and is thus excepted under section 552.108(a)(1) or that the case has reached some final result other than conviction or deferred adjudication and is thus excepted under section 552.108(a)(2) or section 552.108(b)(2). Therefore, the department may not withhold the submitted information under section 552.108.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common law privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication

of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. This office has determined that other types of information also are private under section 552.101. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 659 at 4-5 (1999) (summarizing information attorney general has held to be private), 470 at 4 (1987) (illness from severe emotional job-related stress), 455 at 9 (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps), 343 at 1-2 (1982) (references in emergency medical records to drug overdose, acute alcohol intoxication, obstetrical/gynecological illness, convulsions/seizures, or emotional/mental distress). We have marked information that the department must withhold under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common law privacy.

You note that the remaining information includes Texas motor vehicle record information. Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides the following:

> (a) Information is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 if the information relates to:
>
> > (1) a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state; [or]
> >
> > (2) a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state[.]

Gov't Code § 552.130(a). We have marked the Texas motor vehicle record information that must be withheld under section 552.130.

Finally, we note that the remaining information contains social security numbers. Section 552.147 of the Government Code provides that "[t]he social security number of a living person is excepted from" required public disclosure under the Act. Therefore, the department must withhold the social security numbers contained in the submitted information under section 552.147.[2]

In summary, we have marked information that the department must withhold under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common law privacy. We

---

[2]We note that section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act.

have also marked Texas motor vehicle record information that must be withheld under section 552.130 of the Government Code and social security numbers that must be withheld under section 552.147 of the Government Code. The remaining submitted information must be released to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for

contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

L. Joseph James

L. Joseph James
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

LJJ/dh

Ref: ID# 256881

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Valerie Whitworth
P.O. Box 580
Nevada, Texas 75123
(w/o enclosures)