



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

September 5, 2006

Mr. Mark G. Mann
Assistant City Attorney
City of Garland
P. O. Box 469002
Garland, Texas 75046-9002

OR2006-10277

Dear Mr. Mann:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 261921.

The Garland Police Department (the "department") received two requests for information related to a specified incident. You state that some responsive information has been released to the requestor. You claim that some of the remaining requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.108 and 552.136 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

You assert that some of submitted information is excepted under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Section 552.108(a)(1) excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime [if] release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime." A governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.108(a)(1), (b)(1), 552.301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state that the information at issue relates to a pending criminal investigation. Based on this representation, we conclude that the release of this information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e.*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court

delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases). Accordingly, the department may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108.

You also claim that some of the remaining information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.136 of the Government Code. Section 552.136:

(a) In this section, "access device" means a card, plate, code, account number, personal identification number, electronic serial number, mobile identification number, or other telecommunications service, equipment, or instrument identifier or means of account access that alone or in conjunction with another access device may be used to:

- (1) obtain money, goods, services, or another thing of value; or
- (2) initiate a transfer of funds other than a transfer originated solely by paper instrument.

(b) Notwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.

Id. § 552.136. The department must withhold the information you have marked pursuant to section 552.136 of the Government Code.

To conclude, the department may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information you have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining submitted information.¹

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited

¹We note that the information being released contains information that would be excepted from disclosure to the general public under laws and exceptions designed to protect privacy. However, as representatives of the individual to whom the information pertains, the requestors each have a special right of access to this information. See Gov't Code § 552.023(b) (governmental body may not deny access to person to whom information relates, or that person's representative, solely on grounds that information is considered confidential by privacy principles). If the department receives another request for this information from a person who would not have a special right of access, the department should resubmit this same information and request another decision. See Gov't Code §§ 552.301(a), .302; Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001).

from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Cindy Nettles
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CN/vh2

Ref: ID# 261921

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Jim Burnham
6116 North Central Expressway, Suite 515
Dallas, Texas 75206
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Brian T. Galindo
The Kruger Group Investigation
6116 North Central Expressway, Suite 200
Dallas, Texas 75206
(w/o enclosures)