



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

September 21, 2006

Ms. Lisa M. Salinas
Custodian of Records
Baytown Police Department
3200 North Main Street
Baytown, Texas 77521

OR2006-11012

Dear Ms. Salinas:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 259847.

The Baytown Police Department (the "department") received a request for copies of all records pertaining to a named department officer with regard to his application, training, certification, and employment to work at the department. You state you will redact the social security numbers from the submitted information pursuant to section 552.147 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.147 (authorizing a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting decision from this office under the Act). You also state you will redact the information you have underlined in red pursuant to a previous determination issued by this office in Open Records Decision No. 670 (2001).¹ You claim that portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

¹*See* Open Records Decision No. 670 at 6 (2001) (authorizing all governmental bodies that are subject to the Act to withhold home addresses and telephone numbers, personal cellular telephone numbers, personal pager numbers, social security numbers, and family member information of peace officers without necessity of requesting attorney general decision under section 552.117(a)(2)); *see also* Gov't Code § 552.301(a); Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001) (delineating circumstances under which attorney general decision constitutes previous determination under section 552.301).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code exempts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 143.089(g) of the Local Government Code. You inform us that the City of Baytown is a civil service city under chapter 143 of the Local Government Code. Section 143.089 contemplates two different types of personnel files, a police officer’s civil service file that the civil service director is required to maintain, and an internal file that the police department may maintain for its own use. Local Gov’t Code § 143.089(a), (g). In cases in which a police department investigates a police officer’s misconduct and takes disciplinary action against an officer, it is required by section 143.089(a)(2) to place all investigatory records relating to the investigation and disciplinary action, including background documents such as complaints, witness statements, and documents of like nature from individuals who were not in a supervisory capacity, in the police officer’s civil service file maintained under section 143.089(a). *Abbott v. City of Corpus Christi*, 109 S.W.3d 113, 122 (Tex. App.—Austin 2003, no pet.). All investigatory materials in a case resulting in disciplinary action are “from the employing department” when they are held by or in possession of the department because of its investigation into a police officer’s misconduct, and the department must forward them to the civil service commission for placement in the civil service personnel file. *Id.* Chapter 143 prescribes the following types of disciplinary actions: removal, suspension, demotion, and uncompensated duty. *See* Local Gov’t Code §§ 143.051-143.055. Such records are subject to release under chapter 552 of the Government Code. *See id.* § 143.089(f); Open Records Decision No. 562 at 6 (1990). However, information that reasonably relates to an officer’s employment relationship with the police department and that is maintained in a police department’s internal file pursuant to section 143.089(g) is confidential and must not be released. *City of San Antonio v. San Antonio Express-News*, 47 S.W.3d 556 (Tex. App.—San Antonio 2000, pet. denied); *City of San Antonio v. Texas Attorney General*, 851 S.W.2d 946, 949 (Tex. App.—Austin 1993, writ denied).

You inform us that the information you have highlighted in orange is kept in the officers’ section 143.089(g) files as personnel files created and maintained by the police department. Based on these representations and our review, we conclude that the orange-highlighted information is confidential under section 143.089(g) of the Local Government Code and must therefore be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses confidentiality provision such as section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code. The information you have highlighted in blue consists of L-2 Declarations of Medical Condition and L-3 Declarations of Psychological and Emotional Health required by the Texas Commission on Law Enforcement Officer Standards and Education (the “commission”). These declarations are confidential pursuant to section 1701.306, which provides in relevant part:

- (a) The commission may not issue a license to a person as an officer or county jailer unless the person is examined by:

(1) a licensed psychologist or by a psychiatrist who declares in writing that the person is in satisfactory psychological and emotional health to serve as the type of officer for which a license is sought; and

(2) a licensed physician who declares in writing that the person does not show any trace of drug dependency or illegal drug use after a physical examination, blood test, or other medical test.

(b) An agency hiring a person for whom a license as an officer or county jailer is sought shall select the examining physician and the examining psychologist or psychiatrist. The agency shall prepare a report of each declaration required by Subsection (a) and shall maintain a copy of the report on file in a format readily accessible to the commission. A declaration is not public information.

Occ. Code § 1701.306. Therefore, the department must withhold the blue-highlighted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code.

The information you have highlighted in purple consists of an Employment Eligibility Verification Form I-9 and an attachment to the form. A Form I-9 is governed by title 8, section 1324a of the United States Code, which provides that the form “may not be used for purposes other than for enforcement of this chapter” and for enforcement of other federal statutes governing crime and criminal investigations. 8 U.S.C. § 1324a(b)(5). Release of this document in this instance would be “for purposes other than for enforcement” of the referenced federal statute. Accordingly, we conclude that the purple-highlighted Form I-9 and the attachment are confidential for purposes of section 552.101 of the Government Code and may only be released in compliance with the federal laws and regulations governing the employment verification system.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 6103(a) of Title 26 of the United States Code, which provides that tax return information is confidential. *See* 26 U.S.C. §6103(a)(2), (b)(2)(A), (p)(8); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 600 (1992); Attorney General Op. MW-372 (1981). Therefore, the department must withhold the W-4 forms you have marked in red brackets under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 6103 of title 26 of the United States Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses criminal history record information (“CHRI”) generated by the National Crime Information Center (“NCIC”) or by the Texas Crime Information Center (“TCIC”). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except that the DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the

Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090 - .127. Furthermore, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. We note, however, that the definition of CHRI does not include driving record information maintained by the DPS under subchapter C of chapter 521 of the Transportation Code. *See id.* § 411.082(2)(B). The information we have marked consists of CHRI generated by TCIC and NCIC. Therefore, the department must withhold the CHRI we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with chapter 411 of the Government Code. The remaining information, however, is not CHRI, and thus, it may not be withheld on that basis.

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 411.192 of the Government Code, which governs the release of all information maintained by the DPS concerning the licensure of individuals to carry a concealed handgun. Section 411.192 provides as follows:

[DPS] shall disclose to a criminal justice agency information contained in its files and records regarding whether a named individual or any individual named in a specified list is licensed under this subchapter. [DPS] shall, on written request and payment of a reasonable fee to cover costs of copying, disclose to any other individual whether a named individual or any individual whose full name is listed on a specified written list is licensed under this subchapter. Information on an individual subject to disclosure under this section includes the individual's name, date of birth, gender, race, and zip code. Except as otherwise provided by this section and by Section 411.193, all other records maintained under this subchapter are confidential and are not subject to mandatory disclosure under the open records law, Chapter 552, Government Code, except that the applicant or license holder may be furnished a copy of disclosable records on request and the payment of a reasonable fee.

Gov't Code § 411.192. The submitted documents contain information concerning an individual's concealed handgun license. In this instance, the circumstances of the request do not meet the access requirements of section 411.192. Therefore, the department must withhold this information, which we have marked, pursuant to section 552.101 in conjunction with section 411.192 of the Government Code.

We note that the submitted information contains medical records which are subject to the Medical Practice Act (the "MPA"), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code. *See* Occ. Code § 151.001. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides in part:

(a) A communication between a physician and a patient, relative to or in connection with any professional services as a physician to the patient, is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Id. § 159.002(a)-(c). We have concluded that when a file is created as the result of a hospital stay, all of the documents in the file that relate to diagnosis and treatment constitute either physician-patient communications or records of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that are created or maintained by a physician. *See* Open Records Decision No. 546 (1990). Medical records must be released on the patient's signed, written consent, provided that the consent specifies (1) the information to be covered by the release, (2) reasons or purposes for the release, and (3) the person to whom the information is to be released. *See* Occ. Code §§ 159.004, .005. Any subsequent release of medical records must be consistent with the purposes for which the governmental body obtained the records. *See id.* § 159.002(c); Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). We have marked the medical records that may only be released in accordance with the MPA. *See* Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses common-law privacy, which protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. We have reviewed the remaining submitted records and find that none of it is protected under common-law privacy. Therefore, the department may not withhold any of the remaining submitted information under section 552.101 on that basis.

We note that the remaining submitted information contains additional information that is subject to section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code. Section 552.117(a)(2) excepts from disclosure "information that relates to the home address, home telephone number, or social security number" of a peace officer, or that reveals whether the peace officer has family members, regardless of whether the officer complies with section 552.024 or section

552.1175.² *See* Gov't Code § 552.117(a)(2). Accordingly, we conclude that the department must withhold the additional information we have marked pursuant to section 552.117(a)(2).

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information that "relates to . . . a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state [or] a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state." Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information you have highlighted in pink, as well as the additional information we have marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold the following: (1) the orange-highlighted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 143.089(g) of the Local Government Code; (2) the blue-highlighted information under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code; (3) the W-4 forms you have marked in red brackets under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 6103 of title 26 of the United States Code; (4) the CHRI we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with chapter 411 of the Government Code; (5) the information we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 411.192 of the Government Code; (6) the additional information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code; and (7) the Texas motor vehicle information you have highlighted in pink, as well as the additional information we have marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The purple-highlighted Form I-9 and attachment are confidential for purposes of section 552.101 of the Government Code and may only be released in compliance with the federal laws and regulations governing the employment verification system. The medical records we have marked may only be released in accordance with the MPA. The remaining information must be released to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

²Section 552.117(a)(2) applies to peace officers as defined by article 2.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. *See* Crim. Proc. Code art. 2.12.

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Jaime L. Flores
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JLF/sdk

Ref: ID# 259847

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Tracy McMickle
c/o Baytown Police Department
3200 North Main Street
Baytown, Texas 77521
(w/o enclosures)