ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

October 6, 2006

Ms. Deborah S. Cartwright
General Counsel
Bexar Appraisal District
P.O. Box 830248
San Antonio, Texas 78283-0248

OR2006-11681

Dear Ms. Cartwright:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 263149.

The Bexar County Appraisal District (the "district") received a request for documents submitted to the appraisal review board in 2005 for specified properties. You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.103 and 552.107 of the Government Code. We also understand you to claim that some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under the attorney work product aspect of section 552.111 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.[1]

Initially, we must address the district's obligations under section 552.301 of the Government Code, which prescribes the procedures that a governmental body must follow in asking this office to decide whether requested information is excepted from public disclosure. Pursuant to section 552.301(e), a governmental body must submit to this office within fifteen business days of receiving an open records request a copy of the specific information requested or

[1]We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

representative samples, labeled to indicate which exceptions apply to which parts of the documents. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(e)(1)(D). The district received the request for information on August 2, 2006, but did not submit representative samples of the requested information requested until September 25, 2006. Thus, the district failed to comply with the procedural requirements mandated by section 552.301.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless the governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.302; *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). A compelling reason exists when third-party interests are at stake or when information is confidential under other law. Open Records Decision No. 150 (1977). Sections 552.103, 552.107, and 552.111 of the Government Code are discretionary in nature; they serve only to protect a governmental body's interests and may be waived. *See Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S.W.3d 469, 475-76 (Tex. App–Dallas 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive section 552.103); Open Records Decision Nos.677 at 10 (2002) (attorney work-product privilege under section 552.111 or rule 192.5 is not compelling reason to withhold information under section 552.302), 676 at 12 (2002) (attorney-client privilege under section 552.107 or rule 503 constitutes compelling reason to withhold information under section 552.302 only if information's release would harm third party), 522 (1989) (discretionary exceptions in general). As such, they do not constitute compelling reasons to withhold information for purposes of section 552.302. Accordingly, the district must release the requested information to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body

will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. We note that a third party may challenge this ruling by filing suit seeking to withhold information from a requestor. Gov't Code § 552.325. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

James L. Coggeshall
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JLC/eb

Ref: ID# 263149

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Monica P. Mapes
Geary, Porter & Donovan
16475 Dallas Parkway, Suite 500
Addison, Texas 75001-6837
(w/o enclosures)