



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

October 11, 2006

Ms. Katherine M. Powers
Assistant City Attorney
Criminal Law & Police Division
City of Dallas
1400 South Lamar Street, 1st Floor
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2006-11872

Dear Ms. Powers:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 261655.

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received a request for "personnel files and complete internal affairs files, including any substantiated complaints, involving [two named] officers." You claim that parts of the requested information are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.117, 552.119, 552.130, and 552.136 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.²

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by other statutes. The

¹Although you did not raise section 552.119 until the fifteen-business-day deadline, because section 552.119 is a mandatory exception, we will address the applicability of your arguments. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.301(b), .302.

²We assume that the sample of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

submitted information includes emergency medical services (“EMS”) records subject to chapter 773 of the Health and Safety Code. Section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code provides in relevant part:

(b) Records of the identity, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by emergency medical services personnel or by a physician providing medical supervision that are created by the emergency medical services personnel or physician or maintained by an emergency medical services provider are confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

...

(g) The privilege of confidentiality under this section does not extend to information regarding the presence, nature of injury or illness, age, sex, occupation, and city of residence of a patient who is receiving emergency medical services.

Health & Safety Code § 773.091(b), (g). Thus, except for the information specified in section 773.091(g), EMS records are deemed confidential under section 773.091 and, therefore, may only be released in accordance with chapter 773 of the Health and Safety Code. *See id.* §§ 773.091-.094. We note, however, that records that are confidential under section 773.091 may be disclosed to “any person who bears a written consent of the patient or other persons authorized to act on the patient’s behalf for the release of confidential information.” *Id.* §§ 773.092(e)(4), .093. Section 773.093 provides that a consent for release of EMS records must specify: (1) the information or records to be covered by the release; (2) the reasons or purpose for the release; and (3) the person to whom the information is to be released. We agree that the information you have marked consists of EMS records that are subject to chapter 773 of the Health and Safety Code. If section 773.092 applies in this instance, the department must release these marked EMS records to the requestor. *See id.* §§ 773.092, .093; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 632 (1995). Otherwise, the department must withhold these marked EMS records pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 773.091(b) of the Health and Safety Code, except for the information in these records that is not confidential under section 773.091(g).

The submitted information also includes fingerprints. Chapter 560 of the Government Code provides that a governmental body may not release fingerprint information except in certain limited circumstances. *See* Gov’t Code §§ 560.001 (defining “biometric identifier” to include fingerprints), .002 (prescribing manner in which biometric identifiers must be maintained and circumstances in which they can be released), .003 (providing that biometric identifiers in possession of governmental body are exempt from disclosure under Act). You do not inform us, and the submitted information does not indicate, that section 560.002 permits the disclosure of the submitted fingerprints in this instance. Therefore, the

department must withhold this information, which we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code.

You claim that a portion of the submitted information constitutes medical records, access to which is governed by the Medical Practice Act ("MPA"), chapter 159 of the Occupations Code. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides:

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Occ. Code § 159.002. Information that is subject to the MPA includes both medical records and information obtained from those medical records. *See* Occ. Code §§ 159.002, .004; Open Records Decision Nos. 598 (1991); 546 (1990) (because hospital treatment is routinely conducted under supervision of physicians, documents relating to diagnosis and treatment during hospital stay would constitute protected MPA records). This office has concluded that the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982).

Medical records may be released only as provided under the MPA. Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). The medical records must be released upon the patient's signed, written consent, provided that the consent specifies (1) the information to be covered by the release, (2) reasons or purposes for the release, and (3) the person to whom the information is to be released. Occ. Code §§ 159.004, .005. Section 159.002(c) also requires that any subsequent release of medical records be consistent with the purposes for which the governmental body obtained the records. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). The information we have marked constitutes medical records that may only be released in accordance with the MPA.

Next, you assert that the submitted documents contain criminal history record information ("CHRI"). CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential. Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains, except that the DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are

entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090 - .127. Furthermore, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. After reviewing the remaining information, we have marked the CHRI that must be withheld under section 552.101.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common law privacy. Common law privacy protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683.

In addition, this office has found that the following types of information are excepted from required public disclosure under common law privacy: some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps); personal financial information not relating to the financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 545 (1990), 523 (1989) (individual's mortgage payments, assets, bills, and credit history); and certain personal choices relating to financial transactions between the individual and the governmental body, *see* Open Records Decision No. 600 (1992) (designation of beneficiary of employee's retirement benefits and optional insurance coverage; choice of particular insurance carrier; direct deposit authorization; and forms allowing employee to allocate pretax compensation to group insurance, health care, or dependent care). However, this office has also found that the public has a legitimate interest in information relating to employees of governmental bodies and their employment qualifications and job performance. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 562 at 10 (1990), 542 at 5 (1990); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 423 at 2 (1984) (scope of public employee privacy is narrow). We have marked portions of the submitted information that must be withheld pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common law privacy. We find, however, that no portion of the remaining submitted information is confidential under common law privacy, and none of it may be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis.

Next, we address your arguments under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Section 552.108(b)(1) excepts from disclosure "[a]n internal record or notation of a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that is maintained for internal use in matters relating to law enforcement or prosecution . . . if . . . release would interfere with law enforcement or

prosecution.” *Id.* § 552.108(b)(1). Section 552.108(b)(1) protects information the public disclosure of which would interfere with law enforcement and crime prevention. *See City of Fort Worth v. Cornyn*, 86 S.W.3d 320, 327 (Tex. App.—Austin 2002, no pet.) (section 552.108(b)(1) protects information that, if released, would permit private citizens to anticipate weaknesses in police department, avoid detection, jeopardize officer safety, and generally undermine police efforts to effectuate state laws); Open Records Decision Nos. 562 at 10 (1990), 531 at 2 (1989). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(b)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See Gov’t Code* §§ 552.108(b)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). Section 552.108 is generally not applicable to the records of an internal investigation that is purely administrative in nature. *See Morales v. Ellen*, 840 S.W.2d 519, 525-26 (Tex. Civ. App.—El Paso 1992, writ denied) (statutory predecessor not applicable to internal investigation that did not result in criminal investigation or prosecution); Open Records Decision No. 350 at 3-4 (1982).

We note, however, that this office has concluded that section 552.108(b)(1) protects certain kinds of information, the disclosure of which might compromise the security or operations of a law enforcement agency. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 531 (1989) (detailed guidelines regarding police department’s use of force policy), 508 (1988) (information relating to future transfers of prisoners), 413 (1984) (sketch showing security measures for forthcoming execution), 211 (1978) (information relating to undercover narcotics investigations), 143 (1977) (log revealing use of electronic eavesdropping equipment). You state that the records you have marked contain information regarding the identity of a department undercover police officer. Accordingly, based on your statements and our review of the information, we find that the department may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code.

You claim that some of the submitted information is subject to section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code. Section 552.117(a)(2) excepts from disclosure the current and former home addresses and telephone numbers, social security numbers, and family member information regarding a peace officer regardless of whether the officer elected under section 552.024 or 552.1175 of the Government Code to keep such information confidential.³ We have marked the information that must be withheld under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code.

You also seek to withhold photographs of the officers at issue pursuant to section 552.119 of the Government Code, which provides:

- (a) A photograph that depicts a peace officer as defined by Article 2.12, Code of Criminal Procedure, the release of which would endanger the life or

³“Peace officer” is defined by Article 2.12 of the Texas Code of Criminal Procedure.

physical safety of the officer, is excepted from [required public disclosure] unless:

- (1) the officer is under indictment or charged with an offense by information;
- (2) the officer is a party in a civil service hearing or a case in arbitration; or
- (3) the photograph is introduced as evidence in a judicial proceeding.

(b) A photograph excepted from disclosure under Subsection (a) may be made public only if the peace officer gives written consent to the disclosure.

Gov't Code § 552.119. Under section 552.119, a governmental body must demonstrate, if the documents do not demonstrate on their face, that release of the photograph would endanger the life or physical safety of a peace officer. In this instance, you have not demonstrated how the release of the photographs at issue would endanger the life or physical safety of the officers depicted. We therefore determine that the department may not withhold this information pursuant to section 552.119 of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information that “relates to . . . a motor vehicle operator’s or driver’s license or permit issued by an agency of this state[,] a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state[, or] a personal identification document[.]” *Id.* § 552.130. Pursuant to section 552.130, the department must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information you have marked.

Finally, we address your arguments under section 552.136 of the Government Code, which provides as follows:

(a) In this section, “access device” means a card, plate, code, account number, personal identification number, electronic serial number, mobile identification number, or other telecommunications service, equipment, or instrument identifier or means of account access that alone or in conjunction with another access device may be used to:

- (1) obtain money, goods, services, or another thing of value; or
- (2) initiate a transfer of funds other than a transfer originated solely by paper instrument.

(b) Notwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.

Id. § 552.136. You inform us that the employee identification numbers found in the submitted information are the same numbers used for the employees' city credit union bank accounts. Accordingly, the identification numbers you have marked must be withheld under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

In summary, if section 773.092 of the Health and Safety Code applies, the department must release the marked EMS records to the requestor; otherwise, the department must withhold these marked EMS records pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 773.091(b) of the Health and Safety Code, except for the information in these records that is not confidential under section 773.091(g). The department must withhold the marked fingerprint information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code. We have marked (1) the medical records that may only be released in accordance with the MPA; (2) the CHRI that must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with federal law and chapter 411 of the Government Code; and (3) the records that must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common law privacy. The department may withhold the information you have marked pursuant to section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have marked the personal information of department officers that must be withheld under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code. The marked Texas motor vehicle information must be withheld under section 552.130 of the Government Code, and the marked account numbers must be withheld under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The remaining submitted information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the

Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Cindy Nettles
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CN/eb

Ref: ID# 261655

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Denny Kelly
Kelly-James and Associates
P.O. Box 67-1345
Dallas, Texas 75367
(w/o enclosures)