



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

October 25, 2006

Ms. YuShan Chang
Assistant City Attorney
City of Houston
Legal Department
P.O. Box 368
Houston, Texas 77001-0368

OR2006-12610

Dear Ms. Chang:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 263099.

The Houston Police Department (the "department") received a request for a specified incident report. The department received another request for information pertaining to a named individual. You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note that you have not submitted the specified incident report for our review. *See Gov't Code § 552.301(e)(1)(D)*. As you have not submitted this incident report, we assume the department has released this report to the extent it existed on the date the department received the request. If not, the department must do so at this time. *See id.* §§ 552.006, .301, .302; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 664 (2000) (noting that if governmental body concludes that no exceptions apply to requested information, it must release information as soon as possible).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common law privacy, which protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the

publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find that a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. Therefore, the department must withhold any criminal records where the named individual is listed as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, to the extent they exist, under common law privacy as encompassed by section 552.101 of the Government Code.

We note that you have submitted records that do not list the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or defendant. These documents may not be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common law privacy. You assert that some of these records are excepted from disclosure under sections 552.108, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We will consider your arguments under these exceptions.

Section 552.108 of the Government Code provides in pertinent part:

(a) Information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted from [required public disclosure] if:

(1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation or prosecution of crime[.]

Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state that the information submitted in Exhibit 4 pertains to a pending criminal investigation. You also state that the information submitted in Exhibit 5 relates to an inactive criminal investigation, but that this investigation may be reactivated once "additional leads are developed." You further inform us that the applicable statute of limitations has not yet run. Based on your representations and our review, we determine that the release of the information submitted in Exhibits 4 and 5 would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime, and we therefore agree that section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to this information. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd*

n.r.e. per curiam, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases).

However, section 552.108 does not except basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). We believe such basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. See 531 S.W.2d at 186-87; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information made public by *Houston Chronicle*). Therefore, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the information submitted in Exhibits 4 and 5 under section 552.108 of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code requires a governmental body to withhold "information [that] relates to . . . a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state." We have reviewed the remaining information and marked the Texas motor vehicle record information that must be withheld under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.147 of the Government Code provides that "[t]he social security number of a living person is excepted from" required public disclosure under the Act. Therefore, the department must withhold the social security number we have marked under section 552.147.¹

In summary, the department must withhold any criminal records where the named individual is listed as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, to the extent they exist, under common law privacy as encompassed by section 552.101 of the Government Code. With the exception of basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold the information submitted in Exhibits 4 and 5 under section 552.108 of the Government Code. The Texas motor vehicle record information we have marked must be withheld under section 552.130 of the Government Code, while the social security number we have marked must be withheld under section 552.147 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the

¹We note that section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act.

governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



James A. Person III
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JAP/dh

Ref: ID# 263099

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Kris L. Sanders
Daw & Ray
5718 Westheimer, Suite 1750
Houston, Texas 77057
(w/o enclosures)