



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

GREG ABBOTT

October 25, 2006

Ms. Lisa M. Salinas
Custodian of Records
Baytown Police Department
3200 North Main Street
Baytown, Texas 77521

OR2006-12627

Dear Ms. Salinas:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 262915.

The Baytown Police Department (the "department") received a request for "any and all records" relating to the requestor and three other named individuals and a named business. You inform us that you have redacted social security numbers pursuant to section 552.147 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.147(b) (governmental body may redact social security number without necessity of requesting decision from this office under the Act). You claim that some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.136 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note, and you acknowledge, that the department has not complied with the time periods prescribed by section 552.301 of the Government Code in requesting a decision from this office. When a governmental body fails to comply with the procedural requirement of section 552.301, the information at issue is presumed public. *See* Gov't Code § 552.302; *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ); *City of Houston v. Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co.*, 673 S.W.2d 316, 323 (Tex. App.—Houston [1st Dist.] 1984, no writ); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). To overcome this presumption, the governmental body must show a compelling reason to withhold the information. *See* Gov't Code § 552.302; *Hancock*, 797 S.W.2d at 381. Because

sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.136 of the Government Code can provide compelling reasons to overcome the presumption of openness, we will consider the department's arguments against disclosure of the requested information.

Next, we note that a portion of the request implicates the three named individuals' right of privacy. Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. See *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both elements of this test must be established. See *id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. Cf. *U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find that a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

A portion of the instant request is for "any and all records" related to three named individuals. This request for unspecified law enforcement records requires the department to compile the three named individuals' criminal history. Therefore, to the extent that the department maintains any law enforcement records that depict the three named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants, the department must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department has submitted information that does not relate to the named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants. This information does not constitute a criminal history compilation protected by common-law privacy and may not be withheld on that basis under section 552.101. Accordingly, we will address your other claims with respect to that information.

Other types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. In addition, this office has found that some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses is protected by common-law privacy. See Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps). We have reviewed the

information that you have highlighted in yellow and agree that some of it is protected under common-law privacy; therefore, the department must withhold this information, which we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code. However, we find that the remainder of this information is not protected by common-law privacy, and the department may not withhold it under section 552.101 on that ground.

You assert that information you have marked in blue is excepted under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. Section 261.201(a) provides as follows:

(a) The following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

- (1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and
- (2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Upon review, we find that no portion of the remaining information constitutes information used or developed in an investigation under chapter 261. Accordingly, no portion of the remaining information may be withheld on that basis.

You assert that some of the remaining information is excepted under section 552.130 of the Government Code, which provides that information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by a Texas agency is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1), (2). We agree that the department must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information you have highlighted in pink under section 552.130 of the Government Code. We have marked additional information that the department must withhold under section 552.130.

Section 552.136 of the Government Code states that "[n]otwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential." Gov't Code § 552.136. We agree that the department must withhold the account numbers you have highlighted in purple under section 552.136.

In summary: (1) to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records that depict the three named individuals' as suspects, arrestees, and criminal defendants, the department

must withhold this information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common law privacy; (2) the department must also withhold the marked information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy; (3) in addition to the portions we have marked, the pink-highlighted Texas motor vehicle information must be withheld under section 552.130 of the Government Code; and (4) the purple-highlighted account numbers must be withheld under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The rest of the submitted information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Gilbert N. Saenz
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

GNS/sdk

Ref: ID# 262915

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Eric Baumgart
P.O. Box 727
La Porte, Texas 77572
(w/o enclosures)