



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

November 10, 2006

Mr. Rashaad V. Gambrell  
Assistant City Attorney  
City of Houston - Legal Department  
P. O. Box 1562  
Houston, Texas 77251-1562

OR2006-13344

Dear Mr. Gambrell:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID#264381.

The City of Houston (the "city") received a request for a specified incident report. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

We first note that the submitted information involves an alleged violation of section 32.51 of the Penal Code. Section 32.51 provides that "[a] person commits an offense if the person obtains, possesses, transfers, or uses identifying information of another person without the other person's consent and with intent to harm or defraud another." Penal Code § 32.51(b). Article 2.29 of the Code of Criminal Procedure pertains to alleged violations of section 32.51 of the Penal Code that occurred on or after September 1, 2005 and provides as follows:

(a) A peace officer to whom an alleged violation of Section 32.51, Penal Code, is reported shall make a written report to the law enforcement agency that employs the peace officer that includes the following information:

- (1) the name of the victim;
- (2) the name of the suspect, if known;

(3) the type of identifying information obtained, possessed, transferred, or used in violation of Section 32.51, Penal Code; and

(4) the results of any investigation.

(b) On the victim's request, the law enforcement agency shall provide the report created under Subsection (a) to the victim. In providing the report, the law enforcement agency shall redact any otherwise confidential information that is included in the report, other than the information described by Subsection (a).

Crim. Proc. Code art. 2.29. In this instance, the submitted information pertains to identity theft, which constitutes an alleged violation of section 32.51 of the Penal Code. The requestor here is the victim listed in the report. For purposes of article 2.29 of the Code of Criminal Procedure, an offense is committed on or after September 1, 2005 if no "element of the offense occurs before that date." Act of Jun. 17, 2005, 79th Leg., R.S., ch. 294, § 1(b), 2005 Tex. Gen. Laws 885. The submitted information indicates that the offense occurred after September 1, 2005. Thus, the submitted information is subject to article 2.29 of the Code of Criminal Procedure, and the city must release the submitted information unless it contains otherwise confidential information. *See* Crim. Proc. Code art. 2.29.

Section 552.108 of the Government Code is a discretionary exception to disclosure. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 177 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 did not prohibit release of information). Accordingly, no portion of the submitted information may be withheld on this basis. However, you also raise sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code. Further, we note that the submitted information contains information that is protected by section 552.147 of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup> As these exceptions are confidentiality provisions, we will address their applicability to the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *See Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and

---

<sup>1</sup>The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has found that some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses are excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps). Upon review, we find that you have failed to demonstrate how any portion of the submitted information constitutes highly intimate or embarrassing information for the purposes of common-law privacy. Accordingly, none of the submitted information may be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code on this basis.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides in relevant part:

(a) Information is excepted from the requirement of Section 552.021 if the information relates to:

(1) a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state; [or]

(2) a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state[.]

Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the Texas motor vehicle record information we have marked must be withheld pursuant to section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.147 of the Government Code provides that "[t]he social security number of a living person is excepted from" required public disclosure under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147(a). Thus, the city must withhold the social security numbers we have marked pursuant to 552.147 of the Government Code.

In summary, the city must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information and social security numbers we have marked pursuant to sections 552.130 and 552.147 of the Government Code, respectively. The remaining information must be released to the requestor.<sup>2</sup>

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

---

<sup>2</sup>We note that some of the information being released would otherwise be confidential under sections 552.130, 552.136, and 552.147 of the Government Code. However, because this information belongs to the requestor, it may not be withheld in this instance. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual asks governmental body to provide him with information concerning himself). However, if the city receives another request for this particular information from a different requestor, then the city should again seek a decision from this office.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Holly R. Davis  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

HRD/krl

Ref: ID# 264381

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Craig C. Smith  
4444 Westheimer, Number 280  
Houston, Texas 77027  
(w/o enclosures)