



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

December 15, 2006

Mr. Dan Meador
Assistant General Counsel
Texas Department of State Health Services
1100 W. 49th Street
Austin, Texas 75756

OR2006-14789

Dear Mr. Meador:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 267220.

The Texas Department of State Health Services (the "department") received a request for information regarding a specified massage therapist. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information. We have also considered comments submitted by the requestor. *See* Gov't Code § 552.304 (providing that any person may submit comments stating why information should or should not be released).

Initially, we note and you acknowledge that the department has not complied with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 of the Governmental Code in requesting this ruling. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(b), (e). Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the information is public and must be released unless a governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information to overcome this presumption. *See Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to Gov't Code § 552.302); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). This office has held that a compelling reason exists to withhold information when the information is confidential by another source of law or affects third party interests. *See* Open Records

Decision No. 150 (1977). Because sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code can constitute such compelling reasons, we will consider whether these exceptions apply to the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information other statutes make confidential. Section 1304(b) of title 8 of the United States Code addresses the confidentiality of the registration of aliens under section 1301 of the United States Code and provides:

All registration and fingerprint records made under the provisions of this subchapter shall be confidential, and shall be made available only

(1) pursuant to section 1357(f)(2) of this title, and

(2) to such persons or agencies as may be designated by the Attorney General.

Upon review, we agree that the information you have marked consists of alien registration information. Accordingly, this information is made confidential under title 8, section 1304(b) of the United States Code and must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

You claim that some of the submitted information is criminal history record information (“CHRI”) generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center, and is excepted from public disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. Section 552.101 encompasses section 411.083 of the Government Code, which deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except that the DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090 - .127. Furthermore, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. Upon review, we agree that the information you have marked is CHRI and must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

You claim that the submitted Texas driver’s license is excepted from public disclosure under section 552.130 of the Government Code. In relevant part, section 552.130 provides:

(a) Information is excepted from required public disclosure if the information relates to:

- (1) a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state[.]

Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1). Upon review, we agree that you must withhold the Texas driver's license under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

You claim that the social security number is excepted from public disclosure under section 552.147 of the Government Code. Section 552.147 provides that "[t]he social security number of a living person is excepted from" required public disclosure under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147. Therefore, the department must withhold the social security number under section 552.147 of the Government Code.¹

In summary, the department must withhold the information it has marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with title 8 section 1304(b) of the United States Code. The department must withhold the CHRI you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the Texas-issued driver's license under section 552.130 of the Government Code. Additionally, the department must withhold the social security number under section 552.147 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the

¹We note that section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act.

statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Jaclyn N. Thompson
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JNT/dh

Ref: ID# 267220

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Rudy Willmann
P.O. Box 460167
San Antonio, Texas 78246
(w/o enclosures)