



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

December 19, 2006

Mr. Miguel Angel Matos
Denton, Navarro, Rocha & Bernal, P.C.
Alamo Area Council of Governments
2517 North Main Avenue
San Antonio, Texas 78212

OR2006-14935

Dear Ms. Matos:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 267321.

The Alamo Area Council of Governments (the "AACOG") received a request for "the bid results for RFP 2006-005," including "the name of the bidders, product bid, and prices." Although you take no position as to whether the requested information is excepted from disclosure, you indicate that this information may be subject to the third-party proprietary interests of ASTI Transportation Systems, Inc. ("ASTI") and American Signal Company ("American Signal"). Thus, pursuant to section 552.305 of the Government Code, you inform us you have notified ASTI and American Signal of the request and their right to submit arguments to this office as to why the requested information should not be released. *See Gov't Code § 552.305(d); see also Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (determining that statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception to disclosure under the Act in certain circumstances).*

Initially, we must next address the AACOG's obligations under section 552.301 of the Government Code. Pursuant to section 552.301(e) of the Government Code, a governmental body is required to submit to this office within fifteen business days of receiving an open records request (1) general written comments stating the reasons why the stated exceptions apply that would allow the information to be withheld, (2) a copy of the written request for information, (3) a signed statement or sufficient evidence showing the date the governmental body received the written request, and (4) a copy of the specific information requested or representative samples, labeled to indicate which exceptions apply to which parts of the

documents. Gov't Code § 552.301(e). Although the AACOG received the request for information on October 5, 2006, you have not submitted the specific information requested or representative samples. Consequently, you have failed to comply with section 552.301 of the Government Code.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the *Government Code*, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless the governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). Normally, a compelling interest is demonstrated when some other source of law makes the information at issue confidential or third-party interests are at stake. *See* Open Records Decision No. 150 at 2 (1977). In this instance, third-party interests are at stake.

However, an interested third party is allowed ten business days after the date of its receipt of the governmental body's notice under section 552.305(d) to submit its reasons, if any, as to why requested information relating to that party should be withheld from disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d)(2)(B). As of the date of this letter, this office has not received comments from either ASTI or American Signal explaining how the release of the requested information will affect their respective proprietary interests. Thus, we have no basis to conclude that the release of any portion of the requested information would implicate the proprietary interests of ASTI or American Signal. *See, e.g.,* Open Records Decision Nos. 661 at 5-6 (1999) (stating that business enterprise that claims exception for commercial or financial information under section 552.110(b) must show by specific factual evidence that release of requested information would cause that party substantial competitive harm), 552 at 5 (1990) (party must establish *prima facie* case that information is trade secret). Accordingly, the AACOG may not withhold any of the requested information on the basis of any proprietary interest that these companies may have in the information.

Furthermore, by AACOG's failure to submit any information for our review, we have no basis for finding it otherwise confidential. Thus, we have no choice but to order you to release the responsive information in accordance with section 552.302 of the Government Code. If you believe the information is confidential and may not lawfully be released, you must challenge this ruling in court as outlined below.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited

from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Ramsey A. Abarca
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

RAA/eb

Ref: ID# 267321

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. John C. Mueller
ADDSCO
240 Arlington Avenue East
St. Paul, Minnesota 55117
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Todd Hartnett
ASTI Transportation Systems, Inc.
18 Blevins Drive
New Castle, Delaware 19720
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Tim Paulino
American Signal Company
2755 Bankers Industrial Drive
Atlanta, Georgia 30360
(w/o enclosures)