



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

December 19, 2006

Ms. Cary Grace
Assistant City Attorney
City of Austin
P.O. Box 1088
Austin, Texas 78767-8828

OR2006-14957

Dear Ms. Grace:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 267149.

The Austin Police Department (the "department") received a request for all information related to four named individuals, including specified incidents related to graffiti. You state that you have released some responsive information to the requestor. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U. S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records

found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find that a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. In this instance, the requestor asks, in part, for the department to compile unspecified law enforcement records pertaining to the named individuals. Such a request implicates the individuals' right to privacy. We note that you have not submitted records pertaining to one of the individuals. Therefore, we assume that none exist. However, to the extent the department maintains unspecified law enforcement records depicting the remaining named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants, the department must withhold such information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. The requestor also seeks information about certain recent arrests of the named individuals for alleged graffiti offenses. This portion of the request does not implicate the common-law privacy of the named individuals. Accordingly, report numbers 2006-5048793, 2006-5049953, and 2006-2370298 may not be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.101 also encompasses information made confidential by other statutes such as section 58.007 of the Family Code. The relevant language of section 58.007(c) reads as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
- (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapter B.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). Report number 2006-2370298 consists of law enforcement records of a juvenile who engaged in delinquent conduct after September 1, 1997. *See* Fam. Code § 51.03 (defining "delinquent conduct" for purposes of Fam. Code § 58.007). You do not indicate, nor does it appear, that any of the exceptions in section 58.007 apply to the information in the report; therefore, the report is confidential under section 58.007(c) of the Family Code and must be withheld in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

In summary, you must withhold report number 2006-2370298 under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 58.007 of the Family Code. You must release report numbers 2006-5048793 and 2006-5049953. To the extent that you maintain unspecified records listing the named individuals as arrestees, suspects, or criminal defendants, you must withhold the information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Justin D. Gordon". The signature is fluid and cursive, with the first name "Justin" and last name "Gordon" clearly distinguishable.

Justin D. Gordon
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

- JDG/sdk

Ref: ID# 267149

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Seth Johnson
4908 Duval
Austin, Texas 78751
(w/o enclosures)