



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

December 20, 2006

Ms. Meredith Ladd
Brown & Hofmeister, L.L.P.
For City of McKinney
740 East Campbell Road, Suite 800
Richardson, Texas 75081

OR2006-14989

Dear Ms. Ladd:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 266450.

The McKinney Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for the personnel records of two named officers and specified activity reports. You claim that portions of the submitted information are excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. You claim that some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 in conjunction with the Medical Practice Act ("MPA"), chapter 159 of the Occupations Code. Section 159.002 of the Occupations Code provides in pertinent part as follows:

¹We assume that the representative sample of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. See Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Occ. Code § 159.002 (b), (c). Information that is subject to the MPA includes both medical records and information obtained from those medical records. *See id.* §§ 159.002, .004; Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). This office has concluded that the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982). We have further found that when a file is created as the result of a hospital stay, all the documents in the file relating to diagnosis and treatment constitute physician-patient communications or “[r]ecords of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that are created or maintained by a physician.” Open Records Decision No. 546 (1990).

Medical records may be released only as provided under the MPA. Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). Such records must be released upon the patient's signed, written consent, provided that the consent specifies (1) the information to be covered by the release, (2) reasons or purposes for the release, and (3) the person to whom the information is to be released. Occ. Code §§ 159.004, .005. Section 159.002(c) also requires that any subsequent release of medical records be consistent with the purposes for which the governmental body obtained the records. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). We have reviewed the submitted information and marked the medical records subject to the MPA. Absent the applicability of an MPA access provision, the department must withhold these medical records pursuant to the MPA.

Next, you claim that some of the remaining information is confidential under section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code, which is also encompassed by section 552.101 of the Government Code. Section 1701.306 provides as follows:

(a) The commission may not issue a license to a person as an officer or county jailer unless the person is examined by:

(1) a licensed psychologist or by a psychiatrist who declares in writing that the person is in satisfactory psychological and emotional health to serve as the type of officer for which a license is sought; and

(2) a licensed physician who declares in writing that the person does not show any trace of drug dependency or illegal drug use after a physical examination, blood test, or other medical test.

(b) An agency hiring a person for whom a license as an officer or county jailer is sought shall select the examining physician and the examining psychologist or psychiatrist. The agency shall prepare a report of each declaration required by Subsection (a) and shall maintain a copy of the report on file in a format readily accessible to the commission. A declaration is not public information.

Id. § 1701.306(a), (b). The remaining information includes an L-2 Declaration of Medical Condition and an L-3 Declaration of Psychological and Emotional Health. These declarations are confidential under section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code and must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

We note that the remaining information contains an F-5 form (Report of Separation of License Holder), which is made confidential by section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code. Section 1701.454 provides in relevant part that “[a] report or statement submitted to [the Texas Commission on Law Enforcement Officer Standards and Education] under this subchapter is confidential and is not subject to disclosure under Chapter 552[.]” *Id.* § 1701.454(a). Accordingly, the department must withhold the F-5 form pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.454 of the Occupations Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses chapter 560 of the Government Code. Fingerprint information is governed by sections 560.001, 560.002, and 560.003 of the Government Code, which provide as follows:

Sec. 560.001. DEFINITIONS. In this chapter

(1) “Biometric identifier” means a retina or iris scan, fingerprint, voiceprint, or record of hand or face geometry.

(2) “Governmental body” has the meaning assigned by Section 552.003 [of the Government Code], except that the term includes each entity within or created by the judicial branch of state government.

Sec. 560.002. DISCLOSURE OF BIOMETRIC IDENTIFIER. A governmental body that possesses a biometric identifier of an individual:

(1) may not sell, lease, or otherwise disclose the biometric identifier to another person unless:

(A) the individual consents to the disclosure;

(B) the disclosure is required or permitted by a federal statute or by a state statute other than Chapter 552 [of the Government Code]; or

(C) the disclosure is made by or to a law enforcement agency for a law enforcement purpose; and

(2) shall store, transmit, and protect from disclosure the biometric identifier using reasonable care and in a manner that is the same as or more protective than the manner in which the governmental body stores, transmits, and protects its other confidential information.

Sec. 560.003. APPLICATION OF CHAPTER 552. A biometric identifier in the possession of a governmental body is exempt from disclosure under Chapter 552.

Gov't Code §§ 560.001-.003. Thus, the fingerprint information we have marked is confidential under section 560.003 and must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code unless section 560.002 permits its disclosure.

You claim that the submitted information contains confidential criminal history record information ("CHRI"). CHRI obtained from the National Crime Information Center or the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. CHRI means "information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions." *Id.* § 411.082(2). Federal law governs the dissemination of CHRI obtained from the National Crime Information Center network. Federal regulations prohibit the release to the general public of CHRI maintained in state and local CHRI systems. *See* 28 C.F.R. § 20.21(c)(1) ("Use of criminal history record information disseminated to noncriminal justice agencies shall be limited to the purpose for which it was given") and (c)(2) ("No agency or individual shall confirm the existence or nonexistence of criminal history record information to any person or agency that would not be eligible to receive the information itself"). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its own individual law with respect to CHRI that it generates. *See* Open Records Decision No. 565 at 10-12 (1990); *see generally* Gov't Code ch. 411 subch. F. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) of the Government Code authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *See* Gov't Code § 411.089(b). We

have marked the information that constitutes CHRI that the department must withhold under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with federal law and chapter 411 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 39.030 of the Education Code, which provides in relevant part:

b) The results of individual student performance on academic skills assessment instruments administered under [subchapter B, Chapter 39 of the Education Code] are confidential and may be released only in accordance with the Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act. However, overall student performance data shall be aggregated by ethnicity, sex, grade level, subject area, campus, and district and made available to the public, with appropriate interpretations, at regularly scheduled meetings of the board of trustees of each school district. The information may not contain the names of individual students or teachers.

Educ. Code § 39.030(b). We note that the Education Code “applies to educational institutions supported in whole or in part by state tax funds[.]” *Id.* § 1.001. The department is not an educational institution. Thus, the Education Code does not apply to the department. Accordingly, the department may not withhold any of the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 39.030 of the Education Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses constitutional and common-law privacy. Constitutional privacy protects two kinds of interests. *See Whalen v. Roe*, 429 U.S. 589, 599-600 (1977); Open Records Decision Nos. 600 at 3-5 (1992), 478 at 4 (1987), 455 at 3-7 (1987). The first is the interest in independence in making certain important decisions related to the “zones of privacy,” pertaining to marriage, procreation, contraception, family relationships, and child rearing and education, that have been recognized by the United States Supreme Court. *See Fadlo v. Coon*, 633 F.2d 1172 (5th Cir. 1981); ORD 455 at 3-7. The second constitutionally protected privacy interest is in freedom from public disclosure of certain personal matters. *See Ramie v. City of Hedwig Village, Tex.*, 765 F.2d 490 (5th Cir. 1985); ORD 455 at 6-7. This aspect of constitutional privacy balances the individual’s privacy interest against the public’s interest in the information. *See id.* at 7. Constitutional privacy under section 552.101 is reserved for “the most intimate aspects of human affairs.” *Id.* at 8 (quoting *Ramie*, 765 F.2d at 492).

Information must be withheld from the public under section 552.101 in conjunction with the common-law right to privacy when the information is highly intimate or embarrassing, such that its release would be highly objectionable to a person of ordinary sensibilities, and of no legitimate public interest. *See Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). Common-law privacy protects the specific types of

information that are held to be intimate or embarrassing in *Industrial Foundation*. See 540 S.W.2d at 683 (information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs). This office has found that the following types of information are excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy: personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body, see Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992), 545 (1990); and some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses, see Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps). However, the public has a legitimate interest in the essential facts about a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body. See Open Records Decision Nos. 600 at 9-12 (1992) (identifying public and private portions of certain state personnel records), 545 at 4 (1990) (attorney general has found kinds of financial information not excepted from public disclosure by common-law privacy to generally be those regarding receipt of governmental funds or debts owed to governmental entities), 523 at 4 (1989) (noting distinction under common-law privacy between confidential background financial information furnished to public body about individual and basic facts regarding particular financial transaction between individual and public body), 373 at 4 (1983) (determination of whether public's interest in obtaining personal financial information is sufficient to justify its disclosure must be made on case-by-case basis).

We have marked information that the department must withhold under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. Upon review of the submitted information, we find that no portion of it is protected by constitutional privacy. Therefore, the department may not withhold any of the remaining submitted information on privacy grounds under section 552.101.

Section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information that relates to the home address, home telephone number, or social security number" of a peace officer, or that reveals whether the peace officer has family members, regardless of whether the officer complies with section 552.024 of the Government Code or section 552.1175 of the Government Code.² See Gov't Code § 552.117(a)(2). However, an individual's personal post office box number is not a "home address" and therefore may not be withheld under section 552.117. See *id.* § 552.117; Open Records Decision No. 622 at 4 (1994) ("The legislative history of section 552.117(1)(A) makes clear that its purpose is to protect public employees from being harassed *at home*. See House Committee on State Affairs, Bill Analysis, H.B. 1976, 69th Leg. (1985); Senate Committee on State Affairs, Bill Analysis, H.B. 1976, 69th Leg. (1985)." (Emphasis added.)); see also Open Records Decision Nos. 658 at 4 (1998), 478 at 2 (1987), 465 at 4-5 (1987). Accordingly, we conclude that the department must withhold the personal information you have marked, as well as the additional information we have marked, pursuant to section 552.117(a)(2).

²Section 552.117(a)(2) applies to peace officers as defined by article 2.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. See Crim. Proc. Code art. 2.12.

We note that the submitted information contains Texas driver's license and motor vehicle information. Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information that "relates to . . . a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state [or] a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state." Gov't Code § 552.130. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.130.

We note that the submitted information also contains social security numbers. Section 552.147 of the Government Code provides that "[t]he social security number of a living person is excepted from" required public disclosure under the Act. Therefore, the department must withhold the social security numbers we have marked under section 552.147.³

In summary, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the MPA, sections 1701.306 and 1701.454 of the Occupations Code, section 560.003 of the Government Code, federal law and chapter 411 of the Government Code, and common-law privacy. The department must also withhold the information you have marked, as well as the additional information we have marked, pursuant to sections 552.117, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. The remaining submitted information must be released to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the

³We note that section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act.

Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Jaime L. Flores
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JLF/jww

Ref: ID# 266450

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Sharon Curtis
Attorney & Mediator
1216 North Central Expressway, Suite 101
McKinney, Texas 75070
(w/o enclosures)