



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

January 9, 2007

Mr. Ignacio Perez  
Assistant City Attorney  
City of McAllen  
P.O. Box 220  
McAllen, Texas 78505-0220

OR2007-00343

Dear Mr. Perez:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 268730.

The City of McAllen (the "city") received a request for information related to a specific arrest and the police officers involved in the arrest. You state that some information will be released to the requestor, but claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.103, 552.108, 552.111, 552.129, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we must address the city's obligations under section 552.301 of the Government Code. Pursuant to section 552.301(e) of the Government Code, a governmental body is required to submit to this office within fifteen business days of receiving an open records request (1) general written comments stating the reasons why the stated exceptions apply that would allow the information to be withheld, (2) a copy of the written request for information, (3) a signed statement or sufficient evidence showing the date the governmental body received the written request, and (4) a copy of the specific information requested or representative samples, labeled to indicate which exceptions apply to which parts of the documents. Gov't Code § 552.301(e). As of the date of this ruling, you have not submitted arguments stating the reasons why the stated exceptions apply. Consequently, you have failed to comply with section 552.301 of the Government Code.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless a compelling reason exists to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). Sections 552.103, 552.108, and 552.111 of the Government Code are discretionary exceptions to disclosure that protect a governmental body's interests and may be waived. *See Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S.W.3d 469, 475-76 (Tex. App.—Dallas 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive section 552.103); Open Records Decisions Nos. 677 at 10 (2002) (attorney work-product privilege under section 552.111 or Texas Rule of Civil Procedure 192.5 is not compelling reason to withhold information for purposes of section 552.302), 542 at 4 (1990) (statutory predecessor to section 552.103 subject to waiver), 470 at 7 (1987) (statutory predecessor to section 552.111 subject to waiver), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally). Thus, the city may not withhold any of the information at issue under sections 552.103, 552.108, or 552.111 of the Government Code. However, because sections 552.101, 552.129, and 552.130 of the Government Code can provide compelling reasons to overcome the presumption of openness, we will address your claims under these exceptions.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. You claim that some material is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 in conjunction with chapter 411 of the Government Code. Chapter 411 deems confidential criminal history information ("CHRI") generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. CHRI means "information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions." Gov't Code § 411.082(2). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains, except that the DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083. Although you indicate that the submitted material contains criminal history information that is confidential under chapter 411, upon review we find that none of this material constitutes CHRI for the purposes of chapter 411. Therefore, the city may not withhold any portion of the submitted information on that basis under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Next, we address your claim under section 552.129 of the Government Code, which provides as follows:

A record created during a motor vehicle emissions inspection under Subchapter F, Chapter 548, Transportation Code, that relates to an individual vehicle or owner of an individual vehicle is excepted from [required public disclosure].

Gov't Code § 552.129. Upon review, we find that no portion of the submitted information pertains to a motor vehicle emissions inspection. Therefore, no portion of the submitted information may be withheld on this basis.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure information that relates to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state or a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1)-(2). We note that section 552.130 protects personal privacy. In this instance, the requestor identifies himself as an attorney for the individual to whom some of the submitted Texas driver's license and motor vehicle information pertains. As such, the requestor has a right of access to his client's driver's license and motor vehicle information under section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual or authorized representative asks governmental body to provide information concerning that individual).<sup>1</sup> Therefore, that information may not be withheld in this instance under section 552.130. However, we have marked other Texas driver's license and motor vehicle information that the city must withhold under this exception.

In summary, the city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released to the requestor.<sup>2</sup>

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited

---

<sup>1</sup>Section 552.023(a) provides that "[a] person or a person's authorized representative has a special right of access, beyond the right of the general public, to information held by a governmental body that relates to the person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests." Gov't Code § 552.023(a).

<sup>2</sup>The information being released includes the social security number of the requestor's client. As the authorized representative of the individual whose social security number is at issue, the requestor has a right of access to his client's social security number under section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a). We note that the city must again seek a decision from this office if it receives another request for the same information from another requestor.

from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Debbie K. Lee  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

DKL/eb

Ref: ID# 268730

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Joseph A. Conners, III  
P.O. Box 5838  
McAllen, Texas 78502-5838  
(w/o enclosures)