



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

February 5, 2007

Ms. Bertha A. Ontiveros
Assistant City Attorney
El Paso County
500 East San Antonio, Room 503
El Paso, Texas 79901

OR2007-01437

Dear Ms. Ontiveros:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 270708.

The El Paso County Sheriff's Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified accident, including the complete accident report. You state that you have released basic information to the requestor.¹ You claim that the remaining submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we must address the department's obligations under the Act. Pursuant to section 552.301(b) of the Government Code, a governmental body must ask for the attorney general's decision and state the exceptions that apply within ten business days after receiving the request. *See Gov't Code* § 552.301(a), (b). You inform us that the department received this request for information on November 3, 2006. Accordingly, the deadline for the department to request a ruling from this office was November 20, 2006.² However, your request for a ruling was postmarked on November 21, 2006. *See Id.* § 552.308 (describing

¹Information normally found on the front page of an offense report is generally considered public, and must be released. *Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist. 1975, writ ref'd n.r.e.); *see* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*).

²We note that November 10, 2006 was a county holiday.

rules for calculating submission dates of documents sent via first class United States mail, common or contract carrier, or interagency mail). Consequently, we find the department failed to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless a compelling reason exists to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). Section 552.108 of the Government Code is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects a governmental body's interests and may be waived. *See* Open Records Decisions No. 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally). In this instance, your claim under section 552.108 does not provide a compelling reason to overcome the presumption of openness. Thus, the department may not withhold any of the submitted information under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Because section 552.101 of the Government Code can provide a compelling reason to overcome the presumption of openness, we will address your arguments under this exception.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 11 of article 49.25 of the Code of Criminal Procedure, which provides as follows:

The medical examiner shall keep full and complete records properly indexed, giving the name if known of every person whose death is investigated, the place where the body was found, the date, the cause and manner of death, and shall issue a death certificate The records are subject to required public disclosure in accordance with Chapter 552, Government Code, except that a photograph or x-ray of a body taken during an autopsy is excepted from required public disclosure in accordance with Chapter 552, Government Code, but is subject to disclosure:

- (1) under a subpoena or authority of other law; or
- (2) if the photograph or x-ray is of the body of a person who died while in the custody of law enforcement.

Code Crim. Proc. art. 49.25. You indicate that the exceptions to confidentiality provided in section 11 of article 49.25 are not applicable in this instance. Therefore, we conclude that the department must withhold the autopsy photographs under section 552.101 of the Government Code as information made confidential by law. The remaining photographs are not autopsy photographs and may not be withheld under this exception.

We note that the remaining submitted photographs and records contain Texas-issued motor vehicle record information. Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure information that relates to a driver's license or motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state. Gov't Code § 552.130. We note that section 552.130 protects the privacy interest of the individual, and because that right of privacy is purely personal, it lapses upon death. *See Moore v. Charles B. Pierce Film Enterprises, Inc.*, 589 S.W.2d 489 (Tex. Civ. App.--Texarkana 1979, writ ref'd n.r.e.) (Texas does not recognize relational or derivative right of privacy); *see also* Attorney General Opinions JM-229 (1984); H-917 (1976); Open Records Decision No. 272 at 1 (1981). Thus, motor vehicle information pertaining to deceased persons may not be withheld under section 552.130. Accordingly, pursuant to section 552.130, the department must withhold those portions of the photographs and records that reveal Texas motor vehicle record information pertaining to vehicles in which any living individual has an ownership interest. If the department is unable to redact the portions of the submitted photographs that reveal this information, then those photographs must be withheld in their entirety under section 552.130. The department may not withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information pertaining to vehicles in which no living individual has an ownership interest.

In summary, the department must withhold the autopsy photographs under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with article 49.25 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. Pursuant to section 552.130 of the Government Code, the department must withhold those portions of the photographs and records that reveal Texas motor vehicle record information pertaining to vehicles in which any living individual has an ownership interest. If the department is unable to redact the portions of the submitted photographs that reveal this information, then those photographs must be withheld in their entirety under section 552.130. The remaining information must be released to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body

will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Jaime L. Flores
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JLF/jww

Ref: ID# 270708

Enc. Submitted documents

c: X.L. Investigations
148 Gaspar
El Paso, Texas 79907
(w/o enclosures)