



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

March 7, 2007

Mr. Nathan Barrow
Assistant City Attorney
City of Fort Worth
1000 Throckmorton Street
Fort Worth, Texas 76102

OR2007-02617

Dear Mr. Barrow:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 272923.

The City of Fort Worth (the "city") received a request for personnel information regarding a named police department officer. You state that some of the responsive information will be released to the requestor, and that some information has been redacted pursuant to a previous determination issued by this office in Open Records Decision No. 670 (2001).¹ You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.²

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't

¹See Open Records Decision No. 670 at 6 (2001) (authorizing all governmental bodies that are subject to chapter 552 of Government Code to withhold home addresses and telephone numbers, personal cellular telephone numbers, personal pager numbers, social security numbers, and family member information of peace officers without necessity of requesting attorney general decision under section 552.117(a)(2)); see also Gov't Code § 552.301(a); Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001) (delineating circumstances under which attorney general decision constitutes previous determination under section 552.301).

²We assume that the sample of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. See Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 also encompasses information made confidential by statute. Prior decisions of this office have held that section 6103(a) of title 26 of the United States Code renders tax return information confidential. *See* Attorney General Opinion H-1274 (1978) (tax returns); Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992) (W-4 forms), 226 (1979) (W-2 forms). Tax return information is defined as data furnished to or collected by the Internal Revenue Service with respect to the determination of possible existence of liability of any person under title 26 of the United States Code for any tax. *See* 26 U.S.C. § 6103(b). The W-4 forms submitted as Exhibit D constitute tax return information that must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with federal law.

We note the city is a civil service city under chapter 143 of the Local Government Code. Section 143.089 of the Local Government Code makes certain information maintained by a civil service police department confidential. Section 143.089 contemplates two different types of personnel files, a police officer's civil service file that the civil service director is required to maintain, and an internal file that a police department may maintain for its own use. Local Gov't Code § 143.089(a), (g).

In cases in which a police department investigates a police officer's misconduct and takes disciplinary action against an officer, it is required by section 143.089(a)(2) to place all investigatory records relating to the investigation and disciplinary action, including background documents such as complaints, witness statements, and documents of like nature from individuals who were not in a supervisory capacity, in the police officer's civil service file maintained under section 143.089(a). *Abbott v. City of Corpus Christi*, 109 S.W.3d 113, 122 (Tex. App.—Austin 2003, no pet.). All investigatory materials in a case resulting in disciplinary action are "from the employing department" when they are held by or in possession of the department because of its investigation into a police officer's misconduct, and the department must forward them to the civil service commission for placement in the civil service personnel file.³ *Id.* Information contained in the civil service file generally must be released, unless it is shown that some provision of chapter 552 of the Government Code permits the information to be withheld from public disclosure. *See* Local Gov't Code § 143.089(f); Gov't Code §§ 552.006, .021; Open Records Decision No. 562 at 6 (1990).

However, subsection (g) of section 143.089 authorizes city police departments to maintain for their own use a file on a police officer that is separate from the file maintained by the city civil service commission. *Id.* Information that reasonably relates to a police officer's employment relationship with the police department and that is maintained in a police department's internal file pursuant to section 143.089(g) is confidential and must be withheld pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code. *See id.*; *see also City of San Antonio v. Tex. Attorney General*, 851 S.W.2d 946, 949 (Tex. App.—Austin 1993, writ denied) ("the

³Chapter 143 prescribes the following types of disciplinary actions: removal, suspension, demotion, and uncompensated duty. *See id.* §§ 143.051-.055.

legislature intended to deem confidential the information maintained by the . . . department for its own use under subsection (g)"); *City of San Antonio v. San Antonio Express-News*, 47 S.W.3d 556 (Tex. App.—San Antonio 2000, pet. denied) (restricting confidentiality under section 143.089(g) to "information reasonably related to a police officer's or fire fighter's employment relationship"); Attorney General Opinion JC-0257 at 6-7 (2000) (addressing functions of section 143.089(a) and (g) files).

You state that the information submitted as Exhibit E is maintained by the city police department under section 143.089(g). Based on your representations and our review of the submitted information, we conclude that Exhibit E is confidential pursuant to section 143.089(g) and must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. Common-law privacy protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. 540 S.W.2d at 683. In addition, this office has found that the following types of information are excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy: personal financial information not relating to the financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body, *see* Open Records Decision Nos. 545 (1990), 523 (1989) (individual's mortgage payments, assets, bills, and credit history); and certain personal choices relating to financial transactions between the individual and the governmental body, *see* Open Records Decision No. 600 (1992) (designation of beneficiary of employee's retirement benefits and optional insurance coverage; choice of particular insurance carrier; direct deposit authorization; and forms allowing employee to allocate pretax compensation to group insurance, health care, or dependent care). The information submitted as Exhibit C must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code, the city must withhold, (1) Exhibit D in conjunction with federal law, (2) Exhibit E in conjunction with section 143.089 of the Local Government Code, and (3) Exhibit C in conjunction with common-law privacy.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited

Ref: ID# 272923

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Brian Guerra
4700 Airport Freeway
Fort Worth, Texas 76117
(w/o enclosures)