



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

April 16, 2007

Mr. Rashaad V. Gambrell
Assistant City Attorney
City of Houston
P.O. Box 1562
Houston, Texas 77251-1562

OR2007-04177

Dear Mr. Gambrell:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 279509.

The Houston Police Department (the "department") received a request for all police reports pertaining to the requestor's client. You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information. We have also considered comments submitted by the requestor. *See* Gov't Code § 552.304 (interested party may submit comments stating why information should or should not be released).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common law privacy, which protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common law

privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find that a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. We note that section 552.023 of the Government Code gives a person or a person's authorized representative a special right of access, beyond the right of the general public, to information held by a governmental body that relates to the person and that is protected from disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests. *See Gov't Code § 552.023*. Accordingly, none of the submitted information may be withheld under section 552.101 in order to protect the requestor's client's common law privacy interests.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information other statutes make confidential. Chapter 261 of the Family Code is applicable to information that relates to reports and investigations of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect. Section 261.201 provides in part:

(a) The following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

- (1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and
- (2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a); *see also id.* § 261.001(1), (4) (defining "abuse" and "neglect" for purposes of Fam. Code ch. 261). You raise section 261.201 for the report submitted as Exhibit 3. Because this information consists of files, reports, records, communications, or working papers used or developed in an investigation under chapter 261, the information is within the scope of section 261.201 of the Family Code. You have not indicated that the department has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information. Therefore, we assume that no such regulation exists. Given that assumption, report 2000-016149 is confidential pursuant to section 261.201 of the Family Code, and must be withheld in its

entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code. As our ruling on this issue is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments for the information at Exhibit 3.

You seek to withhold Exhibit 4 under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate that the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. You assert that the submitted information pertains to a criminal case that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. Therefore, we agree that section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to this information.

However, section 552.108 of the Government Code does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, with the exception of basic front page offense and arrest information, the department may withhold Exhibit 4 based on section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. We note that you have the discretion to release all or part of this exhibit that is not otherwise confidential by law. *Id.* § 552.007.

We next address your claim that portions of the remaining information must be withheld under section 552.130 of the Government Code. Section 552.130 excepts from disclosure information that “relates to . . . a motor vehicle operator’s or driver’s license or permit issued by an agency of this state [or] a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state.” Gov't Code § 552.130. Upon review, the department must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information that we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information that you have marked does not consist of Texas motor vehicle record information, and it may not be withheld on this basis.

Finally, you assert that some of the remaining information is excepted under section 552.147 of the Government Code, which provides that “[t]he social security number of a living person is excepted from” required public disclosure under the Act. The department may withhold the social security numbers from the remaining information under section 552.147.¹

In summary, the department must withhold Exhibit 3 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. Other than basic

¹We note that section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person’s social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act.

information, the department may withhold Exhibit 4 under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. The department must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information, which we have marked, from the remaining information under section 552.130 of the Government Code. Finally, the department may withhold the social security numbers from the remaining information under section 552.147 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released to the requestor.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for

contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "L. Joseph James".

L. Joseph James
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

LJJ/eeg

Ref: ID# 279509

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Brian H. Bieber
Hirschhorn & Bieber, P.A.
550 Biltmore Way
Penthouse Three A
Coral Gables, Florida 33134
(w/o enclosures)