



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

GREG ABBOTT

May 1, 2007

Mr. Robert L. Dillard, III
Nichols, Jackson, Dillard, Hager & Smith, L.L.P.
1800 Lincoln Plaza
500 North Akard
Dallas, Texas 75201

OR2007-05019

Dear Mr. Dillard:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 277255.

The University Park Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for information pertaining to a specified case. You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.108, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note that the submitted information involves an alleged violation of section 32.51 of the Penal Code, which provides that "[a] person commits an offense if the person obtains, possesses, transfers, or uses identifying information of another person without the other person's consent and with intent to harm or defraud another." Penal Code § 32.51(b). Under section 32.51(a), identifying information is defined to include "information that alone or in conjunction with other information identifies an individual, including an individual's . . . unique electronic identification number, address, and routing code, [and] financial institution account number[.]" *Id.* § 32.51(a)(1)(C). Article 2.29 of the Code of Criminal Procedure pertains to alleged violations of section 32.51 that occurred on or after September 1, 2005 and provides as follows:

(a) A peace officer to whom an alleged violation of Section 32.51, Penal Code, is reported shall make a written report to the law enforcement agency that employs the peace officer that includes the following information:

- (1) the name of the victim;
- (2) the name of the suspect, if known;
- (3) the type of identifying information obtained, possessed, transferred, or used in violation of Section 32.51, Penal Code; and
- (4) the results of any investigation.

(b) On the victim's request, the law enforcement agency shall provide the report created under Subsection (a) to the victim. In providing the report, the law enforcement agency shall redact any otherwise confidential information that is included in the report, other than the information described by Subsection (a).

Crim. Proc. Code art. 2.29. For purposes of article 2.29, an offense is committed on or after September 1, 2005 if no "element of the offense occurs before that date." Act of Jun. 17, 2005, 79th Leg., R.S., ch. 294, § 1(b), 2005 Tex. Gen. Laws 885. In this instance, the submitted information pertains to an alleged identity theft. The requestor is the victim of the alleged identity theft. Furthermore, the report relates to an offense that occurred after September 1, 2005. Thus, this report is subject to article 2.29 of the Code of Criminal Procedure and must be released to the requestor, except to the extent that it contains confidential information. You seek to withhold portions of the report under section 552.108 of the Government Code. As a general rule, the exceptions to disclosure found in the Act do not apply to information that other statutes make public. See Open Records Decision Nos. 623 at 3 (1994), 525 at 3 (1989). Thus, section 552.108 is not applicable to the submitted report. We note, however, that the submitted information contains information that is protected under sections 552.101, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. As these exceptions are confidentiality provisions, we will address their applicability.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101.¹ Section 552.101 encompasses criminal history record information ("CHRI") generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565

¹This office will raise section 552.101 on behalf of a governmental body because the Act prescribes criminal penalties for the release of confidential information. See Gov't Code §§ 552.007, 552.352; Open Records Decision No. 325 at 2 (1982).

(1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Texas Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except that the DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090 - .127. We have marked the CHRI that must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with federal law and subchapter F of chapter 411 of the Government Code.²

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common law privacy. Common law privacy protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). The type of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683.

In addition, this office has found that personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is excepted from required public disclosure under common law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision No. 600 (1992) (public employee’s withholding allowance certificate, designation of beneficiary of employee’s retirement benefits, direct deposit authorization, and employee’s decisions regarding voluntary benefits programs, among others, are protected under common law privacy). We have marked personal financial information in the submitted records that must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common law privacy.

You claim that a portion of the remaining information is excepted from disclosure pursuant to section 552.130 of the Government Code, which excepts from disclosure information that relates to “(1) a motor vehicle operator’s or driver’s license or permit issued by an agency of this state; (2) a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state; or (3) a personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or a local agency authorized to issue an identification document.” Gov’t Code § 552.130(a)(1)-(3). We note, however, that the requestor has a special right of access to her own Texas motor vehicle

²As our ruling on this issue is dispositive, we do not reach your argument under section 552.147 of the Government Code.

record information. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023. Accordingly, we determine that the department must withhold only the Texas motor vehicle record information that we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold the CHRI we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with federal law and subchapter F of chapter 411 of the Government Code. The department must also withhold the personal financial information we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with common law privacy. The Texas motor vehicle record information that we have marked must be withheld under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released to the requestor.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "L. Joseph James".

L. Joseph James
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

LJJ/eeg

Ref: ID# 277255

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Lakeshay Dean
2919 Pine Street
Dallas, Texas 75215
(w/o enclosures)