



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

June 27, 2007

Mr. John C. West
General Counsel
Office of the Inspector General
Texas Department of Criminal Justice
P.O. Box 13084
Austin, Texas 78711

OR2007-08134

Dear Mr. West:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID#282206.

The Office of the Inspector General of the Texas Department of Criminal Justice (the "OIG") received a request for information pertaining to a deceased inmate. You state that you will release some of the requested information, including basic information, autopsy reports, and custodial death reports. You also state that social security numbers and certain other information will be withheld under sections 552.117 and 552.147 of the Government Code.¹ You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.134 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. The OIG claims that a portion of the submitted information consists of medical records, access to which is governed by the Medical Practices Act ("MPA"). Occ. Code §§ 151.001-165.160. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides in part:

¹See Gov't Code § 552.147(b) (authorizing governmental body to redact living person's social security number from public release under Gov't Code § 552.147 without necessity of requesting attorney general decision under Act); Open Records Letter No. 2005-01067 (2005) (authorizing Texas Department of Criminal Justice office of the OIG to withhold information relating to its current or former employees under Gov't Code § 552.117(a)(3) without necessity of requesting attorney general decision).

(a) A communication between a physician and a patient, relative to or in connection with any professional services as a physician to the patient, is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Id. § 159.002(a)-(c). This office has concluded that the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. *See Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982).* Furthermore, we have concluded that when a file is created as the result of a hospital stay, all of the documents in the file that relate to diagnosis and treatment constitute either physician-patient communications or records of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that are created or maintained by a physician. *See Open Records Decision No. 546 (1990).* We note that section 159.001 of the MPA defines "patient" as a person who consults with or is seen by a physician to receive medical care. *See Occ. Code § 159.001(3).* Under this definition, a deceased person cannot be a "patient" under section 159.002 of the MPA. Thus, section 159.002 is applicable only to the medical records of a person who was alive at the time of the creation of the records. When a patient is deceased, medical records may be released only on the signed consent of the deceased's personal representative. *See id.* § 159.005(a)(5). The consent in that instance must specify (1) the information to be covered by the release, (2) reasons or purposes for the release, and (3) the person to whom the information is to be released. *See id.* §§ 159.004, .005. Any subsequent release of medical records must be consistent with the purposes for which the governmental body obtained the records. *See id.* § 159.002(c); *Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990).* We have marked the medical records that are subject to the MPA. The OIG may only disclose these records in accordance with the access provisions of the MPA. Absent the applicability of an MPA access provision, the OIG must withhold these records pursuant to the MPA. *See Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991).*

The OIG seeks to withhold the submitted information under section 552.134 of the Government Code, which provides in relevant part:

(a) Except as provided by Subsection (b) or by Section 552.029 [of the Government Code], information obtained or maintained by the Texas Department of Criminal Justice is excepted from [required public disclosure]

if it is information about an inmate who is confined in a facility operated by or under a contract with the department.

Gov't Code § 552.134(a). Section 552.029 of the Government Code provides:

Notwithstanding Section 508.313 or 552.134, the following information about an inmate who is confined in a facility operated by or under a contract with the Texas Department of Criminal Justice is subject to required disclosure under Section 552.021:

- (8) basic information regarding the death of an inmate in custody, an incident involving the use of force, or an alleged crime involving the inmate.

Id. § 552.029(8). The information at issue concerns an inmate who was confined in a facility operated by the Texas Department of Criminal Justice. Section 552.134 is explicitly made subject to section 552.029 of the Government Code. Under section 552.029, basic information regarding the death of an inmate in custody, an alleged crime involving an inmate, and an incident involving the use of force is subject to required disclosure. Basic information includes the time and place of the incident, names of inmates and department officials directly involved, a brief narrative of the incident, a brief description of any injuries sustained, and information regarding criminal charges or disciplinary actions filed as a result of the incident. The information at issue includes an investigation of the death of an inmate in custody. Accordingly, with the exception of basic information, which you state has been released, the OIG must withhold the remaining information under section 552.134 of the Government Code.²

In summary, absent the applicability of an MPA access provision, the OIG must withhold the information we have marked pursuant to the MPA. The OIG must withhold the remaining information under section 552.134 of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the

²As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure.

governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Holly R. Davis
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

HRD/eeg

Mr. John C. West- Page 5

Ref: ID# 282206

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Opal Allen
2809 Northhaven Road
Number 1122
Dallas, Texas 75229
(w/o enclosures)