



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

July 18, 2007

Ms. YuShan Chang
Assistant City Attorney
City of Houston
P.O. Box 368
Houston, Texas 77001-0368

OR2007-09098

Dear Ms. Chang:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 284227.

The Houston Police Department (the "department") received a request for information relating to property room items reported missing, lost, or stolen for the years 2003 through 2006. You claim that the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and have reviewed the information you submitted.¹ We also have considered the comments that we received from an attorney for the requestor.²

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses information that other statutes make confidential. You raise section 552.101 in conjunction with section 143.1214 of the Local Government Code, which provides in part:

¹This letter ruling assumes that the submitted representative sample of information is truly representative of the requested information as a whole. This ruling neither reaches nor authorizes the department to withhold any information that is substantially different from the submitted information. See Gov't Code §§ 552.301(e)(1)(D), .302; Open Records Decision Nos. 499 at 6 (1988), 497 at 4 (1988).

²See Gov't Code § 552.304 (any person may submit written comments stating why information at issue in request for attorney general decision should or should not be released).

(b) The department shall maintain an investigatory file that relates to a disciplinary action against a fire fighter or police officer that was overturned on appeal, or any document in the possession of the department that relates to a charge of misconduct against a fire fighter or police officer, regardless of whether the charge is sustained, only in a file created by the department for the department's use. The department may only release information in those investigatory files or documents relating to a charge of misconduct:

- (1) to another law enforcement agency or fire department;
- (2) to the office of a district or United States attorney; or
- (3) in accordance with Subsection (c).

(c) The department head or the department head's designee may forward a document that relates to a disciplinary action against a fire fighter or police officer to the [civil service] director or the director's designee for inclusion in the fire fighter's or police officer's personnel file maintained under Sections 143.089(a)-(f) [of the Local Government Code] only if:

- (1) disciplinary action was actually taken against the fire fighter or police officer;
- (2) the document shows the disciplinary action taken; and
- (3) the document includes at least a brief summary of the facts on which the disciplinary action was based.

Local Gov't Code § 143.1214(b)-(c).³ You explain that the information submitted as Exhibit 2 consists of records of an internal investigation of alleged misconduct on the part of a police officer. You contend that because the investigation is still pending and no disciplinary action has been taken, Exhibit 2 does not meet the conditions specified by section 143.1214(c) for inclusion in the officer's personnel file under section 143.089(a) of the Local Government Code. Based on your representations and our review of the information in question, we conclude that the department must withhold Exhibit 2 under section 143.1214 of the Local Government Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 642 (1996) (concluding that files relating to investigations of Houston Fire Department personnel by Public Integrity Review Group of Houston Police Department were confidential under Local Gov't Code § 143.1214).

³We understand that the City of Houston is a civil service municipality under chapter 143 of the Local Government Code.

Section 552.108 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body must reasonably explain how and why section 552.108 is applicable to the information that it seeks to withhold under this exception. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A); *Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state that the information submitted as Exhibits 3, 4, 4A, and 5 is related to an active criminal investigation. You also state that the information submitted as Exhibits 6 and 7 is related to criminal investigations that are inactive pending additional leads. You explain, however, that the statute of limitations has not run and the investigations may be reactivated once additional leads are developed. You contend that the release of Exhibits 3, 4, 4A, 5, 6, and 7 would interfere with the detection and investigation of crime. Based on your representations, we conclude that section 552.108(a)(1) is generally applicable to the information in question. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App. – Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases).

Section 552.108 does not except from disclosure “basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic front-page information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88. The department must release basic information, including a detailed description of the offense, even if the information does not literally appear on the front page of an offense or arrest report. *See* Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). The department may withhold the rest of the information in Exhibits 3, 4, 4A, 5, 6, and 7 under section 552.108(a)(1).

In summary: (1) the department must withhold Exhibit 2 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 143.1214 of the Local Government Code; and (2) the department may withhold Exhibits 3, 4, 4A, 5, 6, and 7 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code, except for the basic information that must be released under section 552.108(c).⁴

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov’t Code § 552.301(f). If the

⁴As we are able to make these determinations, we need not address your claim under section 552.147 of the Government Code.

governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'James W. Morris, III', with a large, stylized flourish extending to the right.

James W. Morris, III
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JWM/ma

Ref: ID# 284227

Enc: Submitted documents

c: Mr. Robert Crowe
Houston Chronicle
801 Texas Avenue
Houston, Texas 77002
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Joseph R. Larsen
Ogden, Gibson, Broocks & Longoria, L.L.P.
1900 Pennzoil South Tower
711 Louisiana
Houston, Texas 77002
(w/o enclosures)