



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

October 15, 2007

Ms. Lona Chastain
Assistant General Counsel
Texas Workforce Commission
101 East 15th Street
Austin, Texas 78701

OR2007-13458

Dear Ms. Chastain:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 291722.

The Texas Workforce Commission (the "commission") received a request for financial information pertaining to International Business College, Lubbock Inc., and its affiliated campuses: International Business School, Sherman; International Business School, Denton; International Business School, McKinney; International Business School, Midland; and Business Skills Institute. You state that you will release a portion of the requested information. The commission takes no position on whether the submitted information is excepted from disclosure, but you state that release of this information may implicate the proprietary interests of the above listed third parties. Accordingly, you inform us, and provide documentation showing, that you notified these parties of the request and of their right to submit arguments to this office as to why the information should not be released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d) (permitting interested third party to submit to attorney general reasons why requested information should not be released); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (determining that statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception to disclosure in certain circumstances). We have reviewed the submitted information.

in asking this office to decide whether requested information is excepted from public disclosure. Pursuant to section 552.301(b), a governmental body must ask for a decision from this office and state the exceptions that apply within ten business days of receiving the written request. Gov't Code § 552.301(b). Pursuant to section 552.301(e), a governmental body is required to submit to this office within fifteen business days of receiving an open records request a copy of the specific information requested or representative samples, labeled to indicate which exceptions apply to which parts of the documents. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(D). You state you received the request April 5, 2007. However, the commission did not request a decision from this office or submit the information at issue until August 9, 2007. Accordingly, we conclude that the commission failed to comply with the procedural requirements mandated by section 552.301 of the Government Code.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless the governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). A compelling reason exists when third-party interests are at stake or when information is confidential under other law. Open Records Decision No. 150 (1977). Because third parties interests are at stake, we will address whether the submitted information must be withheld to protect the interests of the third parties.

An interested third party is allowed ten business days after the date of its receipt of the governmental body's notice under section 552.305(d) to submit its reasons, if any, as to why information relating to that party should be withheld from public disclosure. *See Gov't Code* § 552.305(d)(2)(B). As of the date of this letter, we have not received comments from any of the third parties explaining why the requested information should not be released. We thus have no basis for concluding that any portion of the requested information constitutes proprietary information protected under section 552.110, and none of it may be withheld on that basis. *See id.* § 552.110; Open Records Decision Nos. 661 at 5-6 (1999) (to prevent disclosure of commercial or financial information, party must show by specific factual evidence, not conclusory or generalized allegations, that release of requested information would cause that party substantial competitive harm), 552 at 5 (1990) (party must establish *prima facie* case that information is trade secret), 542 at 3 (1990).

We note that the submitted information contains a bank account number and routing number. Section 552.136 states that “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or

maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.”¹ Gov’t Code § 552.136(b). The commission must withhold the bank account number and routing number we have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

The remaining information also contains e-mail addresses that are excepted from disclosure under section 552.137 of the Government Code, which requires a governmental body to withhold the e-mail address of a member of the general public, unless the individual to whom the e-mail address belongs has affirmatively consented to its public disclosure. *See id.* § 552.137 (b). You do not inform us that the owner of the e-mail addresses have affirmatively consented to their release. Therefore, the commission must withhold the e-mail addresses we have marked under section 552.137.

In summary, you must withhold the information we have marked under sections 552.136 and 552.137 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released to the requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov’t Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general’s Open Government Hotline,

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Justin D. Gordon
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JDG/jh

Ref: ID# 291722

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Mr. Khris Rogers
4719 36th
Lubbock, Texas 79414
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Max R. Tarbox
Counsel to International Buisness College, Lubbock, Inc
McWhorter, Cobb & Johnson, LLP
P. O. Box 2547
Lubbock, Texas 79408
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Joseph Edwin Price
Price & Heald
2301 Broadway
Lubbock, Texas 79401
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Glenn Kirk Williams
9314 Raleigh Avenue
Lubbock, Texas 79424
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Glenn Kirk Williams
3701 94th Street
Lubbock, Texas 79423
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Glenn Kirk Williams
4630 50th Street, Suite 100
Lubbock, Texas 79414
(w/o enclosures)

Ms. Gayle Williams
International Business School, Sherman
4107 North Texoma Parkway
Sherman, Texas 75090
(w/o enclosures)

Ms. Gayle Williams
International Business School, Denton
P.O. Box 98
Santa Teresa, New Mexico 88008
(w/o enclosures)

International Business School, Denton
2006 West University Drive
Denton, Texas 76201
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Glenn Kirk Williams
International Business School, McKinney
1434 North Central Plaza, Suite 116
McKinney, Texas 75070
(w/o enclosures)

Ms. Elizabeth Gayle Williams
International Business School, Midland
128 Abell-Hanger Circle
Midland, Texas 79707
(w/o enclosures)

International Business School, Midland
3305 Andrews Highway
Midland, Texas 79703
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Glenn Kirk Williams
Business Skills Institute
8037 Lockheed Drive
El Paso, Texas 79925
(w/o enclosures)