



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

November 5, 2007

Mr. Floyd M. Akers
City Attorney
Pflugerville Police
P.O. Box 679
Pflugerville, TX 78691

OR2007-14465

Dear Mr. Akers:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 294012.

The Pflugerville Police Department (the "department") received a request for all reports involving the requestor and a named individual from 2000 to 2007. You state that a portion of the requested information has been provided to the requestor. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note that you have redacted portions of the submitted information. You do not assert, nor does our review of our records indicate, that the department has been authorized to withhold any such information without seeking a ruling from this office. *See Gov't Code* § 552.301(a); *Open Records Decision* 673 (2000). Because we can discern the nature of the information that has been redacted, being deprived of this information does not inhibit our ability to make a ruling in this instance. Nevertheless, be advised that a failure to provide this office with requested information generally deprives us of the ability to determine whether information may be withheld and leaves this office with no alternative other than ordering that the redacted information be released. *See Gov't Code* §§ 552.301(e)(1)(D) (governmental body must provide this office with copy of "specific information requested"), .302.

Next, we note that the requested information contains a court-filed document. Information filed with a court is generally a matter of public record under section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code and may only be withheld if expressly confidential under other law. *See* Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(17). Although you assert that the requested information is excepted under section 552.108 of the Government Code, this section is a discretionary exception within chapter 552 of the Government Code and not other law that makes information confidential. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n. 5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally); 542 at 4 (1990)(governmental body may waive statutory predecessor to section 552.108). Therefore, the court-filed document, which we have marked, may not be withheld under section 552.108.

Section 552.101 excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find that a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. In this instance, the requestor seeks, in part, all records involving another named individual, thus implicating the individual's right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold such information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. We note that you have submitted records in which the named individual is not listed as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. Accordingly, we will address your arguments against the disclosure of these records.

Section 552.101 also encompasses information protected by section 58.007 of the Family Code. Law enforcement records involving juvenile offenders and relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997 are confidential under section 58.007. Section 58.007(c) reads as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise,

concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

- (1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;
- (2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and
- (3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapter B.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). Section 51.02(2)(A) defines “child” as a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age. *Id.* § 51.02(2)(A). Section 58.007(c) is applicable to information that relates to a juvenile as a suspect or offender, and not as a complainant, victim, witness, or other involved party. *See id.* § 58.007(c); *see also id.* § 51.03 (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct indicating a need for supervision” for purposes of Fam. Code § 58.007). Upon review of the submitted information, we find that you have failed to demonstrate that any of the submitted information is subject to section 58.007 of the Family Code. Thus, the department may not withhold any of submitted information under section 58.007 in conjunction with section 552.101.

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 261.201(a) of the Family Code, which provides as follows:

(a) The following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

- (1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and
- (2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). We note that a portion of the submitted information was used or developed in an investigation of alleged child abuse or neglect. Thus, the information we have marked is within the scope of section 261.201 of the Family Code. You have not indicated that the department has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of

information. Therefore, we assume that no such regulation exists. Given that assumption, the information we have marked is confidential pursuant to section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute). Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code as information made confidential by law.¹

Section 552.108(a) excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977).

In this instance, you state that “[t]his is an ongoing investigation and these cases contain [j]uvenile information.” You also state that “release of the entire incident report/supplement would reveal law enforcement methods, techniques and strategies.” However, the submitted information consists of numerous reports in which you have failed to identify what information pertains to a pending investigation. Therefore, we find that you have failed to demonstrate the applicability of section 552.108 to the submitted information, and it may not be withheld on that basis.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information that “relates to . . . a motor vehicle operator’s or driver’s license or permit issued by an agency of this state [or] a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state.”² Gov’t Code § 552.130. The department must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130.

In summary, to the extent that the department maintains law enforcement records that depict the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold any such information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law

¹We note that the requestor, as a parent of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, may have a right of access to certain abuse and neglect records maintained by the Texas Department of Family and Protective Services (“DFPS”). Section 261.201(g) of the Family Code provides that DFPS, upon request and subject to its own rules, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under this section if [DFPS] has edited the information to protect the confidentiality of the identity of the person who made the report and any other person whose life or safety may be endangered by the disclosure. Fam. Code § 261.201(g).

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception like section 552.130 of the Government Code on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

privacy. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. The department must withhold the Texas motor vehicle record information that we have marked under section 552.130.³ The remaining information must be released.⁴

This letter ruling is limited to the particular records at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other records or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For example, governmental bodies are prohibited from asking the attorney general to reconsider this ruling. Gov't Code § 552.301(f). If the governmental body wants to challenge this ruling, the governmental body must appeal by filing suit in Travis County within 30 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.324(b). In order to get the full benefit of such an appeal, the governmental body must file suit within 10 calendar days. *Id.* § 552.353(b)(3), (c). If the governmental body does not appeal this ruling and the governmental body does not comply with it, then both the requestor and the attorney general have the right to file suit against the governmental body to enforce this ruling. *Id.* § 552.321(a).

If this ruling requires the governmental body to release all or part of the requested information, the governmental body is responsible for taking the next step. Based on the statute, the attorney general expects that, upon receiving this ruling, the governmental body will either release the public records promptly pursuant to section 552.221(a) of the Government Code or file a lawsuit challenging this ruling pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code. If the governmental body fails to do one of these things, then the requestor should report that failure to the attorney general's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. The requestor may also file a complaint with the district or county attorney. *Id.* § 552.3215(e).

³We note that the information being released also contains the requestor's Texas motor vehicle record information. Pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code, the requestor in this instance has a special right of access to that information. Gov't Code § 552.023 (person or person's authorized representative has special right of access to records that contain information relating to the person that are protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests). Because such information may be confidential with respect to the general public, if the department receives another request for this information from an individual other than this requestor, the department should again seek our decision.

⁴The submitted information contains social security numbers subject to section 552.147 of the Government Code. We note that section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147.

If this ruling requires or permits the governmental body to withhold all or some of the requested information, the requestor can appeal that decision by suing the governmental body. *Id.* § 552.321(a); *Texas Dep't of Pub. Safety v. Gilbreath*, 842 S.W.2d 408, 411 (Tex. App.—Austin 1992, no writ).

Please remember that under the Act the release of information triggers certain procedures for costs and charges to the requestor. If records are released in compliance with this ruling, be sure that all charges for the information are at or below the legal amounts. Questions or complaints about over-charging must be directed to Hadassah Schloss at the Office of the Attorney General at (512) 475-2497.

If the governmental body, the requestor, or any other person has questions or comments about this ruling, they may contact our office. Although there is no statutory deadline for contacting us, the attorney general prefers to receive any comments within 10 calendar days of the date of this ruling.

Sincerely,



Loan Hong-Turney
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

LH/eeg

Ref: ID# 294012

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Ms. Marti Fradenburg
1514 Mexican Heather
Pflugerville, Texas 78660
(w/o enclosures)